



**CITIZEN POLICE REVIEW BOARD**  
816 Fifth Avenue, Suite 400  
Pittsburgh PA 15219  
412-765-8023 Telephone – 412-765-8059 Facsimile  
cprb@city.pittsburgh.pa.us

Approved  
2/28/12

---

**Minutes of the CPRB Meeting Held on January 24, 2012 (Mtg. No. 142)**  
**City Council Chambers**  
**510 City County Building**  
**Pittsburgh, PA 15219**  
**Neighborhood: Citywide**

---

**Members Present:** Ms. Deborah L. Walker  
Mr. Ralph E. Norman  
Ms. Leshonda R. Roberts  
Ms. Debora L. Whitfield

**Excused:** Mr. Richard M. Carrington  
Ms. Donna Kramer

**Absent:** None  
**Vacancies:** 1 Mayoral Selection

**Solicitors:** Mr. Robert J. Ridge & Ms. Lourdes Sanchez Ridge

**Staff Present:**

Ms. Elizabeth C. Pittinger, Executive Director  
Mr. Michael Ayoob, Intake Coordinator  
Ms. Sherri Bridgett, Investigator  
Mrs. Kathy Carson, Investigator  
Ms. Michelle Gamble, Investigator  
Ms. Carolyn Gaskin, Executive Assistant

**Excused:**  
  
**Vacancies:** Investigative Associate

**Administrative Matters:**

- Ms. Walker, Chair, called the meeting to order at 6:30p.m.
- Ms. Walker reported that the Board met in Executive Session prior to the meeting to discuss matters concerning ongoing litigation.
- A motion to adopt the meeting minutes for December 6, 2011 was offered by Ms. Whitfield and seconded by Mr. Norman, and approved unanimously.
- A motion to appeal the Commonwealth Court decision (GD 10-001338) to the Supreme Court, was offered by Mr. Norman and seconded by Ms. Whitfield, and approved unanimously.
- Ms. Walker and the Board acknowledged and congratulated Ms. Pittinger on 13 years of service as the Executive Director of the CPRB.

**Executive Director's Report**

- Ms. Pittinger reported that there has been no change regarding the CPRB appointment process (one vacant seat and the three incumbent expired member's terms). To date, neither City Council nor the Mayor have acted as prescribed under the City Code, Title Six, Article VI, §662.04.
- Ms. Pittinger reminded the Board of the Rude & Discourteous Hearing scheduled for 6 p.m., Tuesday, January 31, 2012 at City Council Chambers.

- Ms. Pittinger reported on the progress of the 2012 CPRB/Solicitor Contract with Robert J. Ridge, Esq. and Lourdes Sanchez Ridge, Esq. of Thorp Reed & Armstrong. At this time, the City's 2012 Annual Budget has not yet been approved and all financial proceedings are being held until further notice.
- Ms. Pittinger announced that the play "The Gammage Project" which was written by Attilio Favorini and directed by Mark Clayton Southers will open to the public on February 9, 2012. The play is a dramatization of the death of Jonny Gammage and the resultant legal case. Ms. Pittinger noted that she and other community representatives are portrayed in the show and will participate in a series of talk back sessions following the performance. Information regarding show dates, times and locations was distributed prior to the meeting.

### **Case Review**

Ms. Walker moved to the case review agenda (copy attached), 17 cases were reviewed. Copies of the agenda were made available to the public. Each case summary was reviewed and acted upon as noted (votes unanimous among attending members unless stated otherwise). (*Actions taken are published here and on the CPRB website, <http://www.city.pittsburgh.pa.us/cprb/>*)

### **Public Comment:**

Ms. Walker invited public comment. Public comment was made by Mr. Mark Ozark and Mr. Harry Liller.

### **Next Meeting:**

Ms. Walker announced that the Rude & Discourteous Hearing is scheduled for 6p.m., Tuesday, January 31, 2012 at City Council Chambers and that the next regular board meeting is scheduled for 6p.m., Tuesday, February 28, 2012 at City Council Chambers, 414 Grant Street, Pittsburgh, PA 15219.

The meeting was adjourned at 7p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Carolyn L. Gaskin  
Executive Assistant

Attachment (2):

1. Case Review Agenda/Board Actions
2. Executive Director's Report (1/24/12)

**CPRB CASE REVIEW AGENDA**

<b>CPRB CASE NO. INVESTIGATOR</b>	<b>ALLEGATION(S)</b>	<b>SUMMARY</b>	<b>RECOMMENDATION</b>	<b>RATIONALE</b>
<b>PUBLIC HEARING (0)</b>				
<b>FULL INVESTIGATION (2)</b>				
11-207/CARSON	Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6) Conduct Toward the Public (PBP 16-1, 3.7) Unbiased Policing (PBP 11-3, 4.1)	Cx. alleges that the S.O.s are harassing him.	AUTHORIZED FULL INVESTIGATION	Preliminary evidence suggests more investigation time is needed.
11-258/BRIDGETT	Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6;2) Conduct Toward the Public (PBP 16-1, 3.7;3) Truthfulness (PBP 16-1, 3.19:4) Warrantless Search & Seizures (PBP 45-2, 3.0)	Cx. alleges that he was detained by the S.O.s without cause.	AUTHORIZED FULL INVESTIGATION	Preliminary evidence suggests more investigation time is needed.
<b>30 DAY EXTENSION OF FULL INVESTIGATION (3)</b>				
11-186/CARSON	Unbiased Policing (PBP 11-3, 4.1) Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6) Conduct Toward the Public (PBP 16-1, 3.7) Truthfulness (PBP 16-1, 3.19) False Report (PBP 62-1, 2.10)	Cx. alleges that the S.O. is harassing him because of his sexual orientation.	AUTHORIZED 30 DAY EXTENSION	Interviews need to be conducted.
11-199/CARSON	Obedience to Orders &/or Laws (PBP 16-1, 3.1) Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6) Property of Prisoners and Suspects (PBP 50-2, 7.0)	Cx. alleges that the S.O. stole his personal property.	AUTHORIZED 30 DAY EXTENSION	The Investigator is awaiting information from the ACJ.
11-203/GAMBLE	Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6) Conduct Toward the Public (PBP 16-1, 3.7) Neglect of Duty (PBP 16-1, 3.13)	Cx. alleges that the S.O. threatened her after he responded to a 911 call.	AUTHORIZED 30 DAY EXTENSION	The Investigator is awaiting information from OMI.

CPRB CASE NO. INVESTIGATOR	ALLEGATION(S)	SUMMARY	RECOMMENDATION	RATIONALE
<b>UNFOUNDED (6)</b>				
11-108/GAMBLE	Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6) Conduct Toward the Public (PBP 16-1, 3.7) Neglect of Duty (PBP 16-1, 3.13) Truthfulness (PBP 16-1, 3.19)	Cx. alleges that the S.O.s acted inappropriately.	DISMISSED AS UNFOUNDED	There is no evidence to support the Cx.'s allegations.
11-189/CARSON	Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6)	Cx. alleges that he is being harassed by the S.O.	DISMISSED AS UNFOUNDED	There is no evidence to support the Cx.'s allegations.
11-206/BRIDGETT	Use of Force (PBP 12-6; 3.1;2) Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6;3) Truthfulness (PBP 16-1, 3.19;4) False Report (PBP 62-1; 2.10)	Cx. alleges that the S.O.s shot and killed his dog.	DISMISSED AS UNFOUNDED	The S.O.s did not violate any PBP policy or procedure.
11-221/CARSON	Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6) Conduct Toward the Public (PBP 16-1, 3.7)	Cx. alleges that the S.O.s harassed him.	DISMISSED AS UNFOUNDED	There is no evidence to support the Cx.'s allegations.
11-225/GAMBLE	Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6) Conduct Toward the Public (PBP 16-1, 3.7)	Cx. alleges that the S.O.s acted inappropriately during the incident.	DISMISSED AS UNFOUNDED	There is no evidence to support the Cx.'s allegations.
11-262/CARSON	Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6) Conduct Toward the Public (PBP 16-1, 3.7) Neglect of Duty (PBP 16-1, 3.13) Use of Force (PBP 12-6, 3.1)	Cx. alleges that she was injured during an unlawful arrest.	DISMISSED AS UNFOUNDED	PBP officers were not involved in the alleged physical altercation.

CPRB CASE NO. INVESTIGATOR	ALLEGATION(S)	SUMMARY	RECOMMENDATION	RATIONALE
<b>UNSUSTAINABLE (2)</b>				
10-199/GAMBLE	Unbiased Policing (PBP 11-3, 4.1) Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6) Conduct Toward the Public (PBP 16-1, 3.7)	Cx.s allege that the S.O. has harassed them on more than one occasion.	DISMISSED AS UNSUSTAINABLE	There is no evidence to support the Cx.'s allegations.
11-176/CARSON	Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6) Conduct Toward the Public (PBP 16-1, 3.7) Unbiased Policing (PBP 11-3, 4.1)	Cx. alleges that he was verbally abused by the S.O.	DISMISSED AS UNSUSTAINABLE  MOVED TO RUDE & DISCOURTEOUS HEARING	Cx. may benefit from participating in the next Rude & Discourteous Hearing.
<b>OTHER (4)</b>				
11-76/CARSON	Use of Force (PBP 12-6, 3.1) Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6) Conduct Toward the Public (PBP 16-1, 3.7)	Cx. alleges that the S.O. used excessive force during an encounter.	AUTHORIZED SUSPENSION	Investigator is awaiting the outcome of the Cx.'s trial.
11-164/BRIDGETT	Use of Force (PBP 12-6, 3.1;2) Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6) Conduct Toward the Public (PBP 16-1, 3.7)	Cx. alleges that the S.O. used excessive force during an encounter.	AUTHORIZED SUSPENSION	Investigator is awaiting requested information.
11-169/CARSON	Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6) Conduct Toward the Public (PBP 16-1, 3.7) Use of Force (PBP 12-6, 3.1)	Cx. alleges that the S.O.s used excessive force and illegally detained him.	AUTHORIZED SUSPENSION	Investigator is awaiting information.
11-281/BRIDGETT	Use of Force (PBP 12-6, 5.1) Discharge of Firearms (PBP 12-7, 2.1;3) Conduct Unbecoming a Member (PBP 16-1, 3.6)	Cx. alleges that her brother was fatally injured by the S.O. without cause.	AUTHORIZED SUSPENSION	Pending the disposition of the Medical Examiner and the District Attorney's inquiry.

MEMORANDUM

**To:** Honorable Members of the Board  
**From:** Elizabeth C. Pittinger  
Executive Director  
**Date:** January 24, 2012  
**Re:** Executive Director's Report: 1-24-12

Suite 400  
816 Fifth Avenue  
Pittsburgh PA 15219

412-765-8023 (Voice)  
412-765-8059 (Fax)  
cprb@city.pittsburgh.pa.us



**Intake Summary through 01-24-12:** 14 total cases

Citizen Complaints: 01	Pending Citizen Action: 13	Total Intake: 14
Out of Jurisdiction: 00	Statute of Limitation: 00	(EDI: 0)

**Intake Summary through 12/31/11:** 282 total cases

Citizen Complaints: 38	Pending Citizen Action: 215	Total Intake: 282
Out of Jurisdiction: 18	Statute of Limitation: 09	(EDI: 02)

(Actual Totals for 2010: CC: 79; PCA: 221; OJ: 30; SL: 05 EDI: 01	Total: 336)
(Actual Totals for 2009: CC: 80; PCA: 380; OJ: 18; SL: 09 EDI: 05	Total: 490)
(Actual Totals for 2008: CC: 66; PCA: 288; OJ: 45; SL: 05 EDI: 03	Total: 412)
(Actual Totals for 2007: CC: 71; PCA: 227; OJ: 65; SL: 08 EDI: 10	Total: 425)
(Actual Totals for 2006: CC: 76; PCA: 280; OJ: 85; SL: 09	Total: 450)
(Actual Totals for 2005: CC: 59; PCA: 284; OJ: 70; SL: 18	Total: 431)
(Actual Totals for 2004: CC: 61; PCA: 352; OJ: 62; SL: 14	Total: 489)
(Actual Totals for 2003: CC: 61; PCA: 380; OJ: 66; SL: 20	Total: 527)
(Actual Totals for 2002: CC: 75; PCA: 330; OJ: 83; SL: 26	Total: 514)
(Actual Totals for 2001: CC: 77; PCA: 362; OJ: 87; SL: 11	Total: 537)
(Actual Totals for 2000: CC: 75; PCA: 394; OJ: 92; SL: 30	Total: 590)
(Actual Totals for 1999: CC: 80; PCA: 383; OJ: 27; SL: 11	Total: 501)

**1. Board Terms**

Status unchanged:

- a) 1 vacancy since 6/30/11: City Council Seat #3 (Rev. Downing's seat).
  - i Council sent the proper Nominating Resolution (2011-1756) to the Mayor on 5/31/2011 (timely).
  - ii Mayor has not acted.
- b) 3 terms expired on 10/31/2011.
  - i Ms. Kramer (Council Seat #1)
  - ii Mr. Carrington (Mayoral Seat #6)
  - iii Mr. Norman (Mayoral Seat #7 – LEP)
- c) All notices from the CPRB Chair were made in a proper & timely manner.
- d) Neither City Council nor the Mayor have acted as prescribed under the City Code, Title Six, Article VI, §662.04.

**2. Public Hearing on Rude & Discourteous Conduct**

- a) Public notice was provided through publication in local newspapers and media advisories.
- b) 175 written invitations were sent to people who filed complaints of this nature since the last R&D Public Hearing on May 6, 2010. These include persons whose complaints were determined not to warrant a public hearing.
- c) We will try to arrange a live stream of the hearing. A videographer will document the event.
- d) Members will receive a briefing prior to the day of the hearing.

**3. Appeal to Commonwealth Court No. 2238 C.D. 2010**

- a) On behalf of the Commonwealth Court on 12/28/11, Judge Butler issued a decision affirming Judge Wettick's decision of 9/23/10. That decision was distributed to Board members.

**4. CPRB Solicitors' Contract**

- a) The contract with Robert J. Ridge, Lourdes Sanchez Ridge/Thorp Reed & Armstrong as authorized by the Board on 10/25/11 was submitted on 1/6/12 to the Office of Management & Budget as required. It will be released from OMB to City Council for the authorizing resolution. Then it returns to the Mayor for signature.
- b) The City has adopted a budget but the financial oversight boards have not approved the budget. Accordingly, commitments are on hold until such approvals are received and the budget is released.

Respectfully submitted,



01/24/2012

Attachment: copy of webpage, The Gammage Project, Theatre Arts, Univ. of Pittsburgh



Home » Current Season » Mainstage »

## The Gammage Project



On October 12, 1995, Jonny Gammage, cousin of former Pittsburgh Steeler Ray Seals, was stopped by Lieutenant Milton Mulholland of the Brentwood, Pa., police department. Seven minutes later, Gammage was dead. The bare facts, as troubling as they may be, fail to capture the often unaddressed problems of race relations in the Pittsburgh region. This original docudrama, coproduced by Pitt Rep and Pittsburgh Playwrights Theatre Company, goes beyond issues of Black and White in order to expose the suppressed emotions that continue to affect race relations in our area today.

For tickets to the February performance, [click here](#).

Produced in conjunction with **Pittsburgh Playwrights Theatre Company** with additional performances at the August Wilson Center, March 2-4.

For tickets to the March shows, visit <http://www.pghplaywrights.com/gammage>

### Show Info

Written By:  
Attilio Favorini

Directed By:  
Mark Clayton  
Southers

Dates:  
February 9, 2012 -  
February 19, 2012

Show Times:  
Tuesdays-Saturdays at  
8 p.m.

Sunday matinees at 2  
p.m.

Location:  
Henry Heymann  
Theatre (February)

August Wilson Center  
(March)

### BUY TICKETS

### Production Blog

November 9, 2011  
Sweeney Todd:  
Making Meat Pies  
(recipe and video)  
The BEST pies in  
Pittsburgh. In honor of our  
production of Sweeney  
Todd, three Pitt Rep  
students teach you how to  
make an authentic English  
meat pie.

January 24, 2012  
Why is this girl talking  
to herself?  
Between classes, doing my  
laundry, waiting in line, in  
the shower, I constantly  
find myself running through  
my lines. People who hear  
me muttering probably  
wonder, "Who is Jonny  
Gammage?" and "Why is