

Performance Audit

CITIPARKS TENNIS PROGRAM

Report by the
Office of City Controller

MICHAEL E. LAMB
CITY CONTROLLER

Douglas W. Anderson, Deputy Controller

Anabell Kinney, Management Auditor

Gloria Novak, Assistant Management Auditor

Jeff Khadem, Performance Auditor

Dave Henderson, Performance Auditor

October 2009

October 20, 2009

To the Honorables: Mayor Luke Ravenstahl and
Members of Pittsburgh City Council:

The Office of City Controller is pleased to present this Performance Audit of *Citiparks Tennis Program*, conducted pursuant to the Controller's powers under Section 404(c) of the Pittsburgh Home Rule Charter.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This performance audit was of *Citiparks Tennis Program* was requested by a member of Pittsburgh City Council. The Department of Public Works website identifies 33 City park facilities that contain tennis courts. With the exception of Mellon Park, these courts are seasonal facilities, mostly used spring through fall. The five covered courts at Mellon Park offer year round tennis.

Citiparks Tennis Program consists of summer tennis camps at Schenley Park and year round lessons at the Mellon Park Tennis Center. The Tennis Program is managed by a Tennis Coordinator whose duties include issuing permits for tournaments, scheduling tennis pros to teach tennis camps and tennis lessons and submitting tennis pro timesheets. This audit examines payroll and cash controls and user demographics of the Mellon Park Tennis Center and Schenley Park Summer Tennis Camps.

Findings and Recommendations

According to Citiparks, the 'Bubble' tennis courts at Mellon Park are a good revenue generator. This revenue has enabled Citiparks to retire the Bubble debt early and set aside funds for the eventual 'bubble' replacement.

Permanent Court Time at Mellon Park

Permanent court time is available one hour a week for thirty weeks, October 1 through April. Permanent court time prices range from \$600 to \$900 per season.

Permanent court time is available May 1 through September 30 at half price. Patrons can pay in full by June 30th and receive a 10% discount or pay in three installments.

Finding: Permanent court time fees for the 2008-2009 tennis season generated \$122,132.77 revenue. As of August 7, 2009, \$66,490.09 has been received for the 2009-2010 season.

Finding: Court time payments were recorded as paid in full for all of the 93 individuals or organizations registered for permanent court time for the 2008-2009 season.

Occasional Court Time at Mellon Park

Pay as you play occasional court time is available throughout the week and ranges from \$20 to \$30 an hour, depending on the time of day. Seniors can pay \$7.00 for two hours between noon and 4:00 p.m. if time is available.

Finding: In 2008, the Mellon Park Tennis Center collected \$73,459.17 in cash and checks from walk in patrons. Through July 24, 2009, \$51,159.25 was collected.

Finding: The winter months are the most lucrative for walk in patrons.

Finding: The cash and checks collected for one business day (two shifts) are put together in one bundle in the safe after the evening shift balances the cash register tape with the cash and checks.

Recommendation No. 1:

At the end of each shift, employees should reconcile the cash and checks received during their shift with the register tape and sign off on it.

Finding: Citiparks Staff informed the auditors that walk-in deposits from the Bubble are picked up an average of every two weeks. However the deposit worksheet shows only 17 deposits were made in 2008. During the months of July, September and November no deposits were made. Two months had one deposit, six months had two deposits and one month had three deposits. In 2009 thru July 24, nine deposits were made. February and April had two deposits seven months had only one deposit.

Recommendation No. 2:

Money should be picked up every two weeks at the Bubble and deposited in the bank by the next working day in that week, if not the same day. Reconciliations do **not** have to be done before the money is deposited. There are 26 two week periods in a year. There should be no less than 25 deposits annually.

Petty Cash Payments at the Bubble

Finding: Occasionally money is paid out of the Bubble cash register for incidental items such as tennis balls. A vendor receipt is put in the register to account for the cash used.

Recommendation No. 3:

Citiparks should track the frequency and amount of these purchases and determine if a petty cash fund should be set up at the Bubble.

Summer Tennis Camp User Demographics

The auditors reviewed the registration forms submitted for the three 2009 Schenley Summer Tennis Camps.

Finding: The current registration form lists name, email, phone, age and emergency name and phone but no residency information such as street address or zip code.

Recommendation No. 4:

Summer tennis camp registration forms should include a street address and zip code. This would facilitate an analysis of tennis camp user demographics.

The auditors obtained copies of the checks used to pay for the three 2009 Schenley Summer Tennis Camps and sorted the checks by zip code. Children participating in more than one camp were counted only once. Each family member was counted as an individual registrant.

Finding: In 2009, sixty seven children registered for one or more summer tennis camps at Schenley Park. Ninety four percent (94%) of registrants were City residents. Over half of the participants (55%) resided in East Liberty, Shadyside or Squirrel Hill zip codes with nearly a third of participants (31%) from Squirrel Hill.

Mellon Park Permanent Court Time User Demographics

The auditors obtained lists of permanent court time patrons for the 2008-2009 and 2009-2010 tennis seasons and sorted the data by City residency and zip code.

Finding: The great majority of permanent court time patrons at the Mellon Park Bubble are City residents: 82% in 2008-2009 and 81% in 2009-2010.

Finding: Nearly two thirds of the City patrons reside in Squirrel Hill, Shadyside, Oakland and East Liberty zip codes: 64% in 2008-2009 and 63% in 2009-2010.

Mellon Tennis Clinics Attendance

Finding: Data compiled by Citiparks indicates that the Bubble tennis clinics are popular and fairly well attended, averaging 102 attendees per week and 5304 attendees per year in 2008.

Tennis Pro Time Sheets and Payroll

Finding: The Tennis Coordinator does not have access to the Outlook on the City intranet system and submits payroll information via her personal AOL email account.

Recommendation No. 5:

Payroll information includes sensitive information such as social security numbers and should be sent in more protected manner.

Mellon Park 'Bubble' Facility Security

Citiparks personnel informed the auditors that someone cut a slit in the outer membrane of the Bubble in spring of 2009. This cut was beside one of the emergency doors where the fencing cannot be closed and locked when the facility is not in use.

Finding: Two emergency doors on one side of the Bubble are secured with two metal posts that prevent the fencing from being closed and locked. The auditors were told that the City has solicited an estimate to remedy the problem. However, to date no action has been taken.

Recommendation No. 6:

Citiparks should fix the open fencing problem as soon as possible to prevent similar vandalism, especially since the security cameras have failed to capture the incident. Securing the fencing completely around the Bubble will enhance facility security.

Finding: The Mellon Park Bubble is well used and generates cash, due in large part to easy access to its East End location.

Recommendation No. 7:

Citiparks should investigate whether a similar year round facility would thrive in another section of the City. In addition to providing increased year round tennis opportunities, the facility could pay for itself while generating income for the City.

We are pleased that Citiparks Administration is implementing nearly all of our audit recommendations.

Sincerely,

Michael E. Lamb
City Controller

INTRODUCTION

This performance audit of Citiparks Tennis Program was conducted pursuant to Section 404 (c) of the Pittsburgh Home Rule Charter. The audit was requested by a member of Pittsburgh City Council and examines the payroll and cash controls and user demographics of the Mellon Park Tennis Center and Schenley Park Summer Tennis Camps.

OVERVIEW

The Department of Public Works website identifies 33 City-wide park facilities that contain tennis courts. With the exception of Mellon Park these courts are seasonal facilities, e.g., mostly used spring through fall, weather permitting. Except for tournament permits, court time at the seasonal facilities is free and allocated on a “first come, first serve” basis. Citiparks Tennis Program consists of summer tennis camps at Schenley Park and year round lessons at the Mellon Park Tennis Center.

The Tennis Program is managed by a Tennis Coordinator out of the Biddle Building in Frick Park. The Tennis Coordinator is a tennis professional (pro) whose duties include issuing permits for tournaments, scheduling tennis pros to teach Citiparks tennis camps and tennis lessons and submitting tennis pro timesheets for payment.

Schenley Park

Summer tennis camps are held at the outdoor court facilities in Schenley Park for children 4-17 years old. Citiparks sponsors 6 one week sessions, late June through early August. Camp takes place Monday through Friday, 9 a.m. to noon. “Tiny tot” sessions for children aged 4-7 years are one hour from 9 a.m. to 10 a.m... Tiny tots can register for a day or weekly session; all other registration are for the week long camp. According to the Citiparks website, registration is on site daily at 8:45 a.m. and camp fees are payable by check only, to Treasurer, City of Pittsburgh. Schenley tennis camp fees for 2009 were \$130.00/session (\$110.00 for pre-registered participants) for older children and \$60.00 per session or \$12.00 per day for Tiny Tots. The Tiny tot program is a combination of both camp and clinics which are held outside at Schenley and inside at the Mellon Park Bubble.

The Schenley Tennis Camps are staffed by the tennis pros. When there are tournaments, the Tennis Director Pro issues a permit to the teams playing. This prevents the tournaments teams and other players vying for the same courts.

Mellon Park

The five covered courts in Mellon Park are enclosed in a tent like structure and offer year round tennis by being air conditioned in the summer and heated in the winter. The "Bubble" as it is called, needs to be constantly pressurized. 2003 was the first year the bubble was open as a partial season. Since 2004 the Bubble has been open year round. After the first partial season, the Bubble was taken down, lifted by cranes and trucked to storage. During the summer, with the heat and elements, the tennis court floor where the bubble had been became warped in places. This had to be repaired and it was decided then that the Bubble should stay up year round. The Bubble had to be insulated for adding air conditioning.

The Bubble is open 7 days a week, 7:30 a.m. to 11:00 p.m., October through May 1 and 9:00 a.m. to 7:30 p.m., May 2 through September. Hours are reduced for spring, summer and early fall outdoor tennis court seasons. The facility offers year round tennis clinics for different age groups, permanent court time reservations and hourly court time rental. Year round patrons can book permanent court time. Hourly court time can be reserved by phone. Walk in patrons without reservations can pay for available court time.

The Bubble is staffed by one full time and four part time City employees. Tennis pros are paid to provide Citiparks program lessons and can book left over time to offer private tennis lessons. Some tennis pros offer City lessons and private lessons.

OBJECTIVES

1. To assess the payroll and cash controls of the Citiparks Tennis Program.
2. To assess the user demographics of the Mellon Park Tennis Center and Schenley Park Summer Tennis Program.
3. To make recommendations for improvement.

SCOPE

Audit scope is limited to the 2009 Schenley Park Summer Tennis Program and 2008-2009 year round program at Mellon Park.

METHODOLOGY

The auditors met with the Citiparks Director and Assistant Director, two Tennis Coordinators and Accounting staff. The auditors observed cash controls at the Mellon Park Tennis Center and a Schenley Park Summer Tennis Camp. The Tennis Coordinator was interviewed at the Biddle Building about payroll and tennis pro scheduling. The auditors viewed the security at Mellon Park Tennis Center and discussed security and cash procedures with the facility employees.

The following documentation was obtained and reviewed: Excel spreadsheet with enrollment data and payment data for permanent court time at Mellon Park; copies of registration forms, checks and attendance sheets for the Schenley Summer Tennis Program.

FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Cash Controls

Payments for tennis lessons and court time are made by cash or check.

Permanent Court Time at Mellon Park

Prior to October 1, checks payable to Treasurer, City of Pittsburgh are sent into the main Citiparks Office in the City-County Building by tennis regulars for permanent court time. These checks are deposited into the tennis trust fund. Permanent court times are one hour per week for thirty weeks, October 1 through April. Early morning is \$600 per season. Prime time is \$660 per season, Super Prime time is \$900 per season and Night Owls is \$600 per season. On the weekends court time is \$900 from 7 am to 6 pm and \$600 from 6 pm to 8 pm. Permanent court time is available May 1 through September 30 at half price.

According to Citiparks personnel, permanent court time patrons receive a 10% discount if they pay in full by June 30th. Permanent court time patrons can also pay in three installments. The first installment is due June 30, the second is due December 1 and the third February 28. Because of staff changes, the first installment for the upcoming season was pushed up to July 17. Invoices are sent out when payment is due and reminder notices are sent if an installment payment is not received by the due date.

As of August 7, 2009, 33 permanent court time patrons had not paid the first installment payment. The auditors were told that everyone pays up eventually, and the payment records for the previous season seem to support this. No delinquencies were noted for the 2008-2009 permanent court time patrons.

Finding: Permanent court time fees for the 2008-2009 tennis season generated \$122,132.77 revenue. As of August 7, 2009, \$66,490.09 has been received for the 2009-2010 season.

Permanent Court Time Payments

The auditors compared the 2008-2009 Permanent Court Time schedule with the Permanent Court Time payments received for that season.

Finding: Court time payments were recorded for all of the 93 individuals or organizations registered for permanent court time for the 2008-2009 season.

Occasional Court Time at Mellon Park

Pay as you play occasional court time is available throughout the week and ranges from \$20 to \$30 an hour, depending on the time of day. Seniors can pay \$7.00 for two hours between noon and 4:00 p.m. if time is available.

In the trailer adjacent to the Bubble tennis players can pay by check or cash. The cash register is set up to collect both. When a patron pays by cash or check, the register generates a receipt which is attached to the daily Occasional Time Sheet. The evening shift balances the cash register tape with the cash and checks, received during both shifts and puts the money and register tape in a safe that is bolted to the floor. The next morning, the full time employee reconciles the Occasional Time Sheet and attached receipts and fills out a Daily Cash Balance Sheet. The same procedure is done Monday morning for weekend receipts. Every two weeks staff from the main Parks office is called to come to the trailer to pick up the money and cash register tapes, which have been placed in an interoffice envelope.

Finding: In 2008, the Mellon Park Tennis Center collected \$73,459.17 in cash and checks from walk in patrons. Through July 24, 2009, \$51,159.25 was collected.

Finding: The winter months are the most lucrative for walk in patrons.

Finding: Cash and checks collected for one business day (two shifts) is put together in one bundle in the safe.

Recommendation No. 1:

At the end of each shift, employees should reconcile the cash and checks received during their shift with the register tape and sign off on it.

Finding: Citiparks Staff informed the auditors that walk-in deposits from the Bubble picked up an average of every two weeks. However, according to the deposit worksheet provided, only 17 deposits were made in 2008. During the months of July, September and November no deposits were made. Two months had one deposit, six months had two deposits and one month had three deposits. In 2009 thru July 24, nine deposits were made. February and April had two deposits seven months had only one deposit.

Recommendation No. 2:

Money should be picked up every two weeks at the bubble and deposited in the bank by the next working day in that week, if not the same day. Reconciliations do **not**

have to be done before the money is deposited. There are 26 two week periods in a year. There should be no less than 25 deposits annually.

According to Citiparks personnel, the Bubble is a good revenue generator. This revenue has enabled Citiparks to retire the Bubble debt early and set aside funds for the eventual 'bubble' replacement.

Petty Cash Payments at the Bubble

Finding: Occasionally money is paid out of the Bubble cash register for incidental items such as tennis balls. A vendor receipt is put in the register to account for the cash used.

Recommendation No. 3:

Citiparks should track the frequency and amount of these purchases and determine if a petty cash fund should be set up at the Bubble.

Summer Tennis Camps

Payment for summer tennis camps is collected at the Schenley Park tennis courts. The Tennis Coordinator and camp pros register participants. Registration information on the Citiparks website states "check only; payable to 'Treasurer, City of Pittsburgh'", but money orders are also accepted. The checks and money orders are placed into a #10 white envelope. The Tennis Coordinator takes the white envelope to the trailer at the Bubble, where it is put in the safe.

The tennis camp payments and Bubble money are placed in an interoffice mail envelope and taken to the main Citiparks Office. Downtown Parks Office personnel fill in the deposit slips and one person takes them to the bank with the money. A list of summer tennis camp participants is not sent to the Main Office with the money but is kept at the Biddle Building.

Summer Tennis Camp User Demographics

The auditors reviewed the registration forms submitted for the three 2009 Schenley Summer Tennis Camps.

Finding: The current registration form lists name, email, phone, age and emergency name and phone but no residency information such as street address or zip code.

Recommendation No. 4:

Summer tennis camp registration forms should include a street address and zip code. This would facilitate an analysis of tennis camp user demographics.

The auditors obtained copies of the checks used to pay for the three 2009 Schenley Summer Tennis Camps and sorted the checks by zip code. The camp registration forms were sorted by name of participant. Children participating in more than one camp were counted only once. Some families had multiple members participating in camp. Each family member was counted as an individual registrant.

Finding: In 2009, sixty seven children registered for one or more summer tennis camps at Schenley Park. Ninety four percent (94%) of registrants were City residents. Over half of the participants (55%) resided in East Liberty, Shadyside or Squirrel Hill zip codes with nearly a third of participants (31%) from Squirrel Hill.

Tennis Coordinators

At the audit entrance meeting in July, the City had two Tennis Coordinators working out of the Biddle Building in Frick Park. One coordinator subsequently resigned leaving one person responsible for the tennis clinics and lessons. The Tennis Coordinator is a part time subcontractor responsible for scheduling tennis pros for the City lessons and submitting time sheets for payroll.

Tennis Pro Time Sheets and Payroll

At the Summer Tennis Camps, the tennis pro who is assisting the Coordinator with registration lists the arrival and departure times for the teaching pros and signs off. Pros teaching Citiparks tennis lessons at the Bubble must sign in and sign out. These sheets are given to the Tennis Coordinator.

Finding: The Tennis Coordinator does not have access to the Outlook on the City intranet system and submits payroll information via her personal AOL email.

Recommendation No. 5:

Payroll information includes sensitive information such as social security numbers and should be sent in more protected manner.

Mellon Park Permanent Court Time User Demographics

The auditors obtained lists of permanent court time patrons for the 2008-2009 and 2009-2010 tennis seasons and sorted the data by City residency and zip code. The following shows the percent of unduplicated City and non-resident permanent court time patrons at the Bubble:

Mellon Park Permanent Court Time Patrons

Tennis Season	Total # Permanent Court Time Patrons	Number and Percent City Residents	Number and Percent Non-Residents
2008-2009	93	76 (82%)	17 (18%)
2009-2010	97	79 (81%)	18 (19%)

Finding: The great majority of permanent court time patrons at the Mellon Park Bubble are City residents: 82% in 2008-2009 and 81% in 2009-2010.

Finding: Nearly two thirds of the City patrons reside in Squirrel Hill, Shadyside, Oakland and East Liberty zip codes: 64% in 2008-2009 and 63% in 2009-2010.

Private Tennis Lessons at Mellon Park Bubble

In addition to teaching lessons Citiparks tennis clinics, tennis pros are permitted to rent court time at a discounted rate of \$22 and teach private lessons. There is no limit but according to Citiparks personnel:

"It varies because it depends on public use. The patrons & public comes first. If no one is scheduled, they are permitted to book time on the open courts. They are limited on weekends and not permitted to book large time slots. Courts must be available for public weekend use. Looking over last year's schedule it appears they booked anywhere from 1 - 2 hours "per week.

Mellon Tennis Clinics Attendance

Finding: Data compiled by Citiparks indicates that the Bubble tennis clinics are popular and fairly well attended. The following table shows the weekly and yearly average attendance by clinic session for 2008:

	Average Per Week		Average Per Year
Monday	15	Adults	780
Tuesday	20	Adults	1,040
Thursday	7	Adults	364
Saturday - Morning Session	25	Adults	1,300
Saturday - Afternoon Session	25	Adults	1,300
Tiny Tots on Saturday	10	Children	520
Total	102		5,304

Mellon Park Bubble Facility Security

Fencing

According to Citiparks personnel, in spring of 2009 someone cut a slit in the outer membrane of the Bubble. This cut was beside one of the emergency doors where the fencing cannot be closed and locked when the facility is not in use. Had the inner membrane been cut, the Bubble would have collapsed.

Finding: The auditors inspected the fencing surrounding the Bubble. Two emergency doors on one side of the Bubble are secured with two metal posts that prevent the fencing from being closed and locked. The auditors were told that the City has solicited an estimate to remedy the problem. However, to date no action has been taken.

Recommendation No. 6:

Citiparks should fix the open fencing problem as soon as possible to prevent similar vandalism, especially since the security cameras have failed to capture the incident. Securing the fencing completely around the Bubble will enhance facility security.

Security Cameras

There is a closed circuit camera system on the grounds with cameras in the bubble, parking lot and along the driveway. The administrative trailer beside the Bubble has two personnel from morning until evening. They can see who is playing in the bubble and who is coming up the lane by viewing the monitor in the trailer. Currently the camera at the parking lot is inoperative. It is believed that the wire in the ground is broken. The administrative trailer also has restrooms and a small lounge area with cable TV for the players.

Finding: The Mellon Park Bubble is well used and generates cash, due in large part to easy access to its East End location.

Recommendation No. 7:

Citiparks should investigate whether a similar year round facility would thrive in another section of the City. In addition to providing increase year round tennis opportunities, the facility could pay for itself while generating income for the City.

Tennis Tournaments

The City's outdoor tennis courts are used for tournaments during the outside playing season. The Bob O'Conner Tennis Tournament, sponsored by Citiparks, is held in June at Schenley Park. Each team member pays a fee of \$13.00 to register. Citiparks also co-sponsors two other summer tennis tournaments. The Paul Sullivan Tennis Tournament is held in partnership with the Frick Park Clay Court Tennis Club each July in Frick Park. The NAACP Tennis Tournament is held in partnership with the Highland Park Tennis Club and NAACP each August in Highland Park.

For non-City sponsored tournaments, the permit fee is \$10.00 per player or \$15.00 per double team.

During warmer weather, school children play tennis for two months on the outdoor courts. Pittsburgh Public Schools (PPS) do not pay a fee for the permits. Schools other than PPS and universities pay a fee of \$500.00 for the two months. If the private school tennis roster has 70% or more players who are city residents, the fee is waived.