



Division of Development Administration and Review

City of Pittsburgh, Department of City Planning

200 Ross Street, Third Floor

Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Minutes of the Meeting of February 2, 2012

Beginning at 12:30 PM

200 Ross Street

First Floor Hearing Room

Pittsburgh, PA 15219

In Attendance:

<i>Members</i>	<i>Staff</i>	<i>Others</i>
Noor Ismail	Sarah Quinn	Fiona Day
John Jennings		Eric Rodriguez
Arthur Sheffield		Sam Suzuki
Joseph Serrao		Angelique Bamaberg
Linda McClellan		Jamie Frenck
Ernie Hogan		Alexandra Kajakoroc
		Paige Krewson
		Nickie
		Nicole Neumeyer
		Alex Apostolou
		Sam Taylor
		Katie Derr
		Kelsey Kresse
		Drew Hohenwater
		Allison Mosco
		Kate Eichman
		Jeff David
		Chuck Valmassoni
		Evelyn Jones
		S. Vines
		Dan Deis
		Diana Nelson Jones
		Drew Chelosky
		Greg Mucha
		Amanda Swick

New Business

Approval of Minutes: In regards to the January 2012 minutes, Mr. Serrao moved to approve. Mr. Jennings seconded the motion. All members voted in favor. Ms. McClellan and Mr. Hogan abstain from voting.

Certificates of Appropriateness: In regards to the January 2012 Certificates of Appropriateness, Mr. Serrao moved to approve. Mr. Jennings seconded the motion, all members voted in favor.

Applications for Economic Hardship:

- Ms. Quinn hands out packets for 941 Liberty Ave Application for Economic Hardship. She says the Application for Economic Hardship will be on the agenda for the March meeting. She says counsel for the applicant simultaneously filed in the Court of Common Pleas. She says any procedural Requests can go to Jason Zollet in legal.
- Ms. Quinn says staff received paperwork for St. Nicholas' lawsuit against the HRC. She says any conversations should go through Jason Zollet in legal.
- Ms. Ismail says to refrain from commenting on ongoing cases.

Upcoming Demolitions:

NONE

Internal Business:

1. Ms. Quinn says staff sent in annual PHMC report for 2011 (there were 135 CoAs).
2. Ms. Quinn says she and HRC intern, Lee will be going to the city clerk's office in order to verify the list of city-designated properties.
3. Ms. Quinn says must take comment on Calvary Episcopal Church. She says the church is sponsoring application for nomination on the National Register of Historic Places. She says the church cannot use tax credits.
4. Mr. Serrao says if the church sells it they may be able to use the credit.
5. Ms. McClellan says there may be a piece of the church that is for-profit.
6. Ms. Hogan says the definition is if it is a revenue creating use it could be eligible for a basis and can sell it if they don't need the credit.
7. Ms. Quinn says from the time they vote on the 941 Penn Ave application they will have five days for finding of fact as per the ordinance.
8. Ms. Ismail says she would like to get another legal opinion on that matter.
9. Ms. Quinn says she will discuss in law meeting with Jason Zollett.
10. Ms. Quinn and Ms. Ismail say that Councilman Lavelle is the new Land Use and Economic Development Committee chair on City Council.
11. Ms. Hogan asks about PreservePGH.
12. Ms. Quinn says public meetings will be scheduled for document review, which will be available through exchange.
13. Ms. Ismail says there is a public meeting tomorrow night and staff will schedule a presentation to the mayor's office and will look at a roadmap for demolitions, but that will be an internal discussion.
14. Mr. Serrao asks about the sale of St. Nicholas.
15. Mr. Hogan says the diocese listed a property it put on the market in South Side, but they haven't listed St. Nicholas. So even though they said they couldn't according to Canon Law (but evidently this doesn't matter). He says the sales review is held up by diocese. He said he got a forward of a listing from a realtor about the property.
16. Mr. Serrao says he would like to have an executive session on precedent for Economic Hardship. He says the HRC is getting so many applications because there is no precedent. He said this issue was also present on the Art Commission and led to issues until a structure was established.
17. Ms. Quinn says she will put the meeting on the calendar and also says they could talk about the Preservation Plan at the session.
18. Ms. Quinn says Jay Vetere's will have a design at next month's meeting.
19. Mr. Hogan says nothing has happened with square-top windows.
20. Ms. Quinn says staff still has not received drawings from Diesel owner
21. Ms. Quinn says she saw Mr. Criscella who tried to get a CoA, even though they didn't replace windows in the method in previous CoA. He said that he replaced windows in the western most building and will

replace windows as units are finished. She says Pat Brown will be keeping an eye on the project. She told Mr. Criscella that they can review anything, but will not issue anything

22. Ms. Quinn says Mr. McSwiggen has done no work on the building.
23. Mr. Hogan asks about the Lincoln Ave \ in Allegheny West.
24. Ms. Quinn says she doesn't know.
25. Mr. Hogan asks for an enforcement report,
26. Ms. Quinn says ask BBI.
27. Mr. Jennings says give a list of what is still outstanding and BBI could put something together.
28. Ms. Quinn says Wayne from BBI could pull the information.
29. Ms. McClellan says the ordinance seems to say that there is a 65 day period for fact finding
30. Mr. Hogan says they need an opinion from legal about comment period.

Adjourn: Mr. Hogan moved to adjourn, Mr. Jennings seconded the motion, all voted in favor.

Discussion on hearing items follows on the attached pages.

2025 East Carson St

OWNER: Dick Stephens 2025 East Carson Street Pittsburgh, PA 15203	WARD:17TH LOT & BLOCK: 12-F-143 INSPECTOR:.....PAT BROWN COUNCIL DISTRICT:..... 3rd ZONING CLASSIFICATION:..... ARCH. RATING:	APPLICATION RECEIVED: 11/18/11 SITE VISITS: CERTIFICATES OF APP.:00-000
APPLICANT: Chuck Valmassoni 58 Burgess St		

NATIONAL REGISTER: LISTED ELIGIBLE.....

Proposed Changes: TABLED (twice): Modification of the main entrance.

Discussion:

1. Ms. Quinn says she has a letter from Southside Local Development Corporation
2. Chuck Valmassoni, contractor for S&S candy, says they will be installing stairs in entrance.
3. He says now the entrance is a hazard for since one step is on the outside, and one on the inside of door so they are having problems with people tripping. He says they will put down a 4x6 pad, 3 steps leading up, railing on two sides and down the stairs, faced with sandstone, with an awning over the top.
4. Ms.Serrao asks about the entrance.
5. Mr. Valmassoni says there is a step up.
6. Ms. McClellan says this is a disability issue.
7. Mr. Jennings says this is not an issue if there is a handicap entrance, but there needs to be a sign to direction people to other entrance.
8. Mr. Hogan asks about the stone mullion in the transom above the door.
9. Mr. Valmassoni says it is all stone.
10. Mr. Hogan says, then you will be altering the mullion.
11. Mr. Valmassoni says no, but the transom window above door will be shortened.
12. Mr. Serrao asks what is between door and window
13. Mr. Valmassoni says it is glass
14. Mr. Hogan asks what is between door and transom
15. Mr. Valmassoni says it is wood and hands the HRC photographs and asks the whole surrounding is stone
16. Mr. Valmassoni says yes, but that will not be altered.
17. Mr. Hogan says they will need an egress.
18. Mr. Jennings says also for the canopy.
19. Mr. Hogan says it doesn't look like wood
20. Mr. Serrao says he knows the building, but not the door.
21. Mr. Hogan asks if the surround around the door is stone.
22. Mr. Valmassoni says the stone only comes up to halfway through the door, but everything else is painted wood.
23. Mr. Serrao says technically you will not be affecting the brick opening.
24. Mr. says no they will just be raising the transom window and the door "3.
25. Mr. Valmassoni Hogan asks if he will be mimicking the style of other windows with the new transom.

- 26. Mr. Valmassoni says yes they could do that.
- 27. Ms. McClellan says there are no measurements on drawings and asks about the dimensions. She says there seems to be a big difference between the drawings.
- 28. Mr. Hogan asks what replacement door and materials will be.
- 29. Mr. Valmassoni says they will use the same door.
- 30. Mr. Hogan asks about proposed 6x4 awning, asks if he is asking for approval of the awning.
- 31. Mr. Valmassoni says yes
- 32. Ms. Quinn says she needs more info for awning, and that zoning would also need this info to approve.
- 33. Mr. Serrao asks what kind of awning will be put up.
- 34. Mr. Valmassoni says it will be a cloth and aluminum fixed awning.
- 35. Mr. Jennings says it will project over the entire width of the landing presumably.
- 36. Mr. Hogan says this will cover some of the transom.
- 37. Ms. Ismail says the drawings look like dimensions are off compared to what exists.
- 38. Mr. Hogan says the HRC will need a full articulation of what will be done in existing opening, what kind of stone façade, detail and material of metal railing, and is assuming that it will need to be closed railing
- 39. Mr. Jennings says any drop higher than 30” or less they need a guard they will need a guard
- 40. Mr. Serrao says this will be needed for BBI approval
- 41. Mr. Hogan says he will ask members to postpone for 30 days with request for more detailed drawings
- 42. Ms. Quinn says that staff will help with the revisions to the proposal.

MOTION:

Mr. Serrao Motions to postpone the application for more detailed drawings

Mr. Jennings Seconds the motion.

All members Voted in favor

..... **Motion passes.**

OWNER:

Dourid Aboud
802 Berkshire Avenue
Pittsburgh, PA 15226

WARD: 4TH

APPLICATION RECEIVED: 11/10/11

LOT & BLOCK: 28-M-123

SITE VISITS:

APPLICANT:

Dourid Aboud
802 Berkshire Avenue
Pittsburgh, PA 15226

INSPECTOR:.....BOB MCPHERSON

CERTIFICATES OF APP.:00-000

COUNCIL DISTRICT:..... 3rd

ZONING CLASSIFICATION:

ARCH. RATING:

NATIONAL REGISTER:

LISTED

ELIGIBLE.....

Proposed Changes: TABLED (twice) Installation of railing on front porch and siding installation on façade.

Discussion:

1. Dourid Aboud, owner, says he will put in a new railing on his building as drawn. He says he was asked to get architectural drawings and has done that. He says his architect assumes it will meet guidelines.
2. Mr. Hogan asks what material will compose the railing.
3. Mr. Aboud says it will be all treated wood (asks HRC to refer to drawings).
4. Mr. Hogan asks if he plans to paint.
5. Mr. Aboud says he will paint a green that will match green on the building already. He says there are two greens on the building already and it will be a mix of the two.
6. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment.
7. There is none.
8. Mr. Hogan says he is concerned with top rail width.
9. Mr. Serrao says it will be 3.5.'
10. Mr. Hogan says they will be using standard materials and square posts

MOTION:

Mr. Serrao Motions to approve the application as submitted with railing painted to match the green on the house.

Mr. Jennings Seconds the motion.

All members Voted in favor

..... **Motion passes.**

OWNER: Daniel and Kathleen Davis 1221 Buena Vista St Pittsburgh, PA 15212	WARD: 22ND LOT & BLOCK:23-J-317 INSPECTOR:..... MARK SANDERS COUNCIL DISTRICT: 6th ZONING CLASSIFICATION: ARCH. RATING:	APPLICATION RECEIVED: 1/4/12 SITE VISITS: CERTIFICATES OF APP.:00-000
APPLICANT: Daniel and Kathleen Davis 1221 Buena Vista St Pittsburgh, PA 15212		

NATIONAL REGISTER: LISTED ELIGIBLE.....

Proposed Changes: Installation of a conservatory-style enclosure for an existing porch.

Discussion:

1. Dan Davis, owner says he purchased the house in 2000 completely renovated interior and included a new porch at back of house in between rear house and garage. He says the garage fronts on Grover’s way. He says they are proposing to take the existing deck and cover it with a three season weatherproof enclosure including walls, ceiling and windows throughout.
2. Mr. Davis says he has a hearing next week with Zoning Commission, because the construction as designed will require a zoning variance on one side bordering the property line, but not the other. (Refers to drawings)
3. Mr. Davis says that where boards are to the left of the door, the bottom half is existing and deck is where black line cuts through the wall. He says the deck is currently surrounded by a railing which would come down, and walls would be put up in same location.
4. Mr.Davis says the proposal side of building would be rough cedar finish with transparent seal which ages and would match existing fences in back alley. He says the windows would be all vinyl windows in a lighter off-white cream color to match existing house trim.
5. Mr. Hogan says this location is currently masked from the alley by garage.
6. Mr. Davis says yes.
7. Mr. Hogan asks if the perspective from the deck is this what you are covering (refers to drawing).
8. Mr. Davis says towards the bottom of railing, railing would be removed and that is where wall would be.
9. Mr. Hogan He asks what the side facing the alley would be finished in.
10. Mr. Davis says the wall would be a natural rough cedar with a transparent sealer to match deck and railings.
11. Mr. Hogan asks if it is a plank or plywood.
12. Mr. Davis says it is a plank with ¾” width.
13. Mr. Hogan asks for dimension.
14. Mr. Davis says it is about 14’ wide by 6’ long (asks HRC to refer to drawings).
15. Mr. Hogan asks if the same materials will be used throughout.
16. Mr. Davis says the materials for the side facing the yard will be the same as those facing the alley.
17. Mr. Hogan asks if they will see the cedar wall with windows from alley view.
18. Mr. Davis says yes.
19. Mr. Hogan asks if it is on a main boulevard.
20. Ms. Quinn shows photos of alley.

- 21. Mr. Davis says it is the beginning of industrial portion of Brighton road, in the other direction occupied and vacant buildings toward West Park
- 22. Mr. Hogan asks about the garage.
- 23. Mr. Davis says almost all garages in alley are cinderblock.
- 24. Mr. Hogan asks if there will be windows on the piece facing the property line.
- 25. Mr. Davis says yes, but only half will be seen since half will be in between the two homes.
- 26. Mr. Jennings says he will not be allowed to have openings less than 3’ feet away from property line due to fire separation, would be different if it were a public way.
- 27. Mr. Davis asks if this is applicable if there is another building or open space.
- 28. Mr. Jennings says if it is a property line you can’t have windows, but if it is a public space it would be a different story.
- 29. Mr. Davis says he will discuss with zoning.
- 30. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment.
- 31. Greg Mukin, says he lives three houses down and supports the project.
- 32. Mr. Hogan says he believes he is meeting requirements on the code.
- 33. Mr. Jennings says his concern is for the wall on the property line.
- 34. Mr. Hogan says he guesses he will have to give up some glazing, he says the question is will he have to come back or grant some lee-way with staff to review. He says he will probably need fire-rated cedar.
- 35. Mr. Jennings says he agrees.
- 36. Mr. Serrao says he agrees on staff review.

MOTION:

Mr. Serrao **Motions to approve porch with condition that the application, post-review by zoning and BBI, any changes should be brought back to staff for review and approval.**

Mr. Jennings **Seconds the motion.**

All members **Voted in favor**

..... **Motion passes.**

AMENDMENT TO MOTION:

Mr. Hogan says a CoA will not be issued until BBI and zoning approve.

Mr. Serrao..... **Agrees to amend motion.**

Mr. Jennings..... **Seconds**

..... **Motion passes**

OWNER:
ALLEGHENY COUNTY
542 4TH AVE
PITTSBURGH, PA 15219
APPLICANT:
Apostolou Associates
47 Bailey Ave
Pittsburgh, PA 15219

WARD:1ST
LOT & BLOCK:.....2-J-44
INSPECTOR:..... BOB MOLYNEAUX
COUNCIL DISTRICT:..... 6th
ZONING CLASSIFICATION:
ARCH. RATING:

APPLICATION RECEIVED: 1/16/12
SITE VISITS:
CERTIFICATES OF APP.:00-000

NATIONAL REGISTER: LISTED ELIGIBLE.....

Proposed Changes: Installing metal louvers into non-historic windows and cutting a new doorway into a wall.

Discussion:

1. Alex Apostolou from Apostolou Associates architects for the project. She says the project involves mostly interior renovations. She says on the outside of the building there are existing aluminum windows installed in 2004 with AC units in, these AC panes will be replaced with existing glazing. She says on the south side (3rd Ave) there are existing 3 openings below arches with AC units will be enlarged because the interior of building at the first floor level will only get light from those windows.
2. Mr. Hogan says those windows were not original
3. Alex says no, it was the autopsy room.
4. Ms. Apostolou Says they will be adding new door directly next to the existing column metal door and will be removing the existing hazardous waster shed. She says the exhaust from the autopsy room will be removed.
5. She says the northeast side of building is coated in black soot. She says in '04 the building was cleaned but missed this, they are proposing to clean to match the rest of the building.
6. She says the NE towers window will be replaced (elevation 2) and they will need louvers for fresh air intake. The arched window and the two small windows behind it would be replaced for fresh air intake.
7. Mr. Hogan says this will be south elevation, and asks if the one tower to the right will have windows replaced with louvers.
8. Alex says yes, only alteration to openings is in the back with three windows and the door for ADA entrance.
9. Mr. Serrao asks what the louver color will be.
10. Alex says it will match the existing aluminum windows.
11. Mr. Hogan asks if they are replacing the windows that are existing where the AC units will be removed.
12. Ms. Apostolou says no, they will be replacing the pane.
13. Mr. Hogan says this meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
14. Mr. Hogan asks about the north elevation
15. Ms. Apostolou says the roof up against parking garage, there are 2 existing air conditioning units will be removed a chiller will be placed there on a platform.
16. Mr. Hogan asks about the fire stair.
17. Ms. Apostolou says it is a new access stair to the roof to provide access to the platform.
18. Mr. Hogan asks about the size of the chiller.
19. Ms. Apostolou says doesn't know at top of her head.
20. Mr. Hogan asks if the unit will be placed in front of the windows.

- 21. Ms. Apostolou says yes, but these lights already get no windows.
- 22. Mr. Jennings asks if those windows shine into the chapel.
- 23. Ms. Apostolou says the windows are stained glass.
- 24. Alex says that will remain.
- 25. Mr. Hogan asks about louvers on south side.
- 26. She says they are existing and remaining.
- 27. Mr. Hogan says he believes she was in front of HRC last year. He says he is pleased that she added the handicap entrance to rear
- 28. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment
- 29. There is none

MOTION:

Mr. Serrao.....Motions to approve installation of metal louvers, new chilling unit on North façade with access stair and platform, new handicap entrance, cutting of three windows on south elevation as specified in drawing dated 02/01/11.

Mr. Jennings Seconds the motion.

All members Voted in favor

..... **Motion passes**

MOTION TO ADJOURN

Mr. Serrao..... Motions to adjourn

Ms Ismail.....Seconds the motion

All members.....Voted in favor.

.....**Motion passes**

Pittsburgh HRC – March 7, 2012
Certificates of Appropriateness Report – February 2012

Staff Approval	C of A Number	Date Issued	Address	Historic District	Work Approved
N	12-006	2-Feb-12	3612 Dawson Street	Oakland Square	Installation of railing
N	12-007	2-Feb-12	1221 Buena Vista Street	Mexican War Streets	Conservatory installation
N	12-008	2-Feb-12	542 Fourth Avenue	Individual	Window replacement and new egress
Y	12-009	2-Feb-12	2017 E Carson Street	East Carson Street	In-kind replacement of vinyl windows on the rear of the building
Y	12-011	13-Feb-12	1323-1325 E Carson Street	East Carson Street	Signage
Y	12-012	13-Feb-12	933 Penn Avenue	Penn-Liberty	Signage
Y	12-013	17-Feb-12	1819 E Carson Street	East Carson Street	Signage
Y	12-014	23-Feb-12	2132 E Carson Street	East Carson Street	Signage
Y	12-015	23-Feb-12	1616 Chateau Street	Manchester	Painting
Y	12-016	23-Feb-12	718 N Beatty	Alpha Terrace	Installation of brackets and roof shingle repair in-kind
Y	12-017	27-Feb-12	928 Western Avenue	Allegheny West	In-kind repair of soffit/facia and painting of exterior wooden trim dark brown