



Division of Development Administration and Review

City of Pittsburgh, Department of City Planning

200 Ross Street, Third Floor

Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Minutes of the Meeting of March 3, 2010

Beginning at 12:30 PM

200 Ross Street

First Floor Hearing Room

Pittsburgh, PA 15219

In Attendance:

<u>Members</u>	<u>Staff</u>	<u>Others</u>
Michael Stern	Shelly Martz	Tsambiko Capperis
Noor Ismail	Makenzie Diehl	Paul Whitehead
Ernie Hogan		Evelyn Jones
Linda McClellan		R Blaicia
Arthur Sheffield		David Morgan
Erik Harless		Peter Culley
Joe Serrao		Jerry Morosco
		Rick Belloli
		Bob Russ
		Adam DeSimone
		Pat DeSimone
		John Daughtry
		Jeff Mills

Old Business

Nominations Report: There is one building in the nomination process. An affirmative vote was granted by the Planning Commission for the Iron City Brewery nomination on February 16, 2010. The nomination will be scheduled for a public hearing at City Council, but the date has not yet been determined.

New Business

Approval of Minutes: No minutes submitted for approval due to exceptional circumstances; staff person Molnar out on maternity leave.

Certificates of Appropriateness: Mr. Stern directed the commissioners to the Certificates of Appropriateness. In regards to the February 2010 Certificates of Appropriateness, Mr. Stern moved to approve, Ms. Ismail seconded the motion, all voted in favor.

Other: Mr. Stern called upon Mr. Stanely Lowe of the Manchester Citizens Corporation for a neighborhood update and status of 1218 N Franklin St. Mr Lowe thanked Ernie Hogan for spending three hours in Manchester to discuss the future of the 84 properties listed for demolition by BBI. Mr. Lowe stated he realized he was at the wrong table in regards to this matter, and requested to be removed from all future agendas. Ms. Ismail asked if Mr. Lowe plans on coming to the URA with any further plans. Mr. Lowe answered that yes, it is the only viable option. He also added that the MCC met with their Councilman, Dan Lavelle, and asked for a meeting with the mayor. Ms. Ismail said she is still confused on where everything stands. Mr. Lowe said a number of financial institutions such as First Niagra and PNC are committed contributing finances to the project. He said the MCC needs ongoing development with the URA, BBI, and other officials in order to engage further institutions. Mr. Lowe stated the Mr. Lavelle is willing to organize these meetings. Ms. Ismail stated that for the record, the URA has requested a financial plan.

Mr. Hogan contributed that the issues at hand is not simply Manchester based, and he would like to request a list of all properties in city-designated historic districts on the demolition list, because they need to be protected. Mr. Hogan said he read the Manchester plan created by the MCC and took his own images. He does not believe the image of 1218 N Franklin projected on the PowerPoint is an accurate portrayal of the property and its surroundings. He added there is an exciting momentum throughout the district with new construction, the “Great House Sale”, and the committal of resources for restoration by 40 different parties. Mr. Hogan concluded that the HRC is making isolated decisions that could have long term impacts.

Applications for Economic Hardship: None

Upcoming Demolitions:

- None

Adjourn: Mr. Hogan motioned to adjourn, Ms. McClellan seconded the motion, all voted in favor.

Discussion on hearing items follows on the attached pages.

OWNER: Theresa Maude Hendricks 811 Semple Avenue Pittsburgh, PA 15202	WARD:..... 21 st LOT & BLOCK:22-L-103 INSPECTOR:Mark Sanders COUNCIL DISTRICT:	APPLICATION RECEIVED: SITE VISITS: CERTIFICATES OF APP.: 00-000
APPLICANT: City of Pittsburgh	ZONING CLASSIFICATION: .R1A-VH ARCH. RATING: .Important (typical)	
NATIONAL REGISTER:	LISTED..... <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	ELIGIBLE <input type="checkbox"/>

Proposed Changes:

Update on plans for abating condemnation notice, under consideration for demolition

Discussion:

1. Russell Blaich of BBI reported that no changes have been made to 1218 N Franklin since May of 2009. He stated that the house is condemned and there is water damage throughout. Mr. Hogan asked if the rest of the demolitions on Franklin St have been approved, and Mr. Blaich answered, yes.
2. Ms. Ismail added that the mayor’s office conducted a survey of the site, with owner permission.
3. Mr. Hogan said that after researching the property he found that it was tax delinquent and suggested the MCC go through the tax reserve process.
4. Mr. Stern calls for public comment. Stanley Lowe, of MCC says they are not opposed to demolition, but asks what funds are being used to demolish the building. Mr. Stern answers that he does not know.
5. Mr. Lowe continues, saying the MCC are the only people standing in place of demolition, and we can’t approach this issue building by building. He says the only reason the home at 1218 N Franklin is leaking is because of a damaged dormer and they can fix it. Mr. Stern asks what MCC’s timeline is for repair, and Mr. Lowe answers 45 days.
6. Mr. Stern says the HRC will hold off on demolition for 60 days, until the May HRC meeting. Also adds for the record that no one at the HRC table wants to demolish the historic fiber of the City and they do not want to approve any demolitions unless it is necessary.

1218 North Franklin

MOTION:

Mr. Hogan..... Motions to deny application for demolition

Mr. Sheffield..... Seconds the motion.

Mr. Serrao, Ms. Ismail, and Ms. McClellan.....Abstain from vote.

Mr. Stern says the legal interpretation is the request for demolition is denied.

Mr. Blaich shows Certificate of Appropriateness #07-033 issued on May 7, 2007.

Mr.Stern explains that is no longer valid, as it has expired. Tells Mr. Blaich he will have to re-apply.

OWNER: Tsambiko Capperis 1333 Liverpool Street Pittsburgh, PA	WARD: 21 st LOT & BLOCK:22-P-61 INSPECTOR:Mark Sanders COUNCIL DISTRICT:	APPLICATION RECEIVED: 11/16/2009 SITE VISITS: CERTIFICATES OF APP.: 00-000
APPLICANT: Tsambiko Capperis 1333 Liverpool Street Pittsburgh, PA	ZONING CLASSIFICATION: ARCH. RATING:	
NATIONAL REGISTER:	LISTED..... <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	ELIGIBLE <input type="checkbox"/>

Proposed Changes:

Construction of new carriage house / garage

Discussion:

1. The architect, Paul Whitehead, explained that he observed other garage structures on Warlo Street (the alley behind Liverpool on which the garage will sit), and tried to create a structure of similar character.
2. Mr. Whitehead explains again that it will be a two-story building, with garage underneath and storage above. The base will be of striated concrete block, which already exists. They will add the second story and paint the concrete block a subtle tan color.
3. Mr. Stern calls for public comment, none.

MOTION:

Mr. Serrao Motioned to approve.

Ms. McClellan..... Seconded the motion.

All members Voted in favor.

1220 Sheffield Street

OWNER:
Els Housing Partnership
1220 Sheffield Street
Pittsburgh, PA 15233

WARD:21st
LOT & BLOCK:22-R-125
INSPECTOR: Mark Sanders
COUNCIL DISTRICT:
ZONING CLASSIFICATION:
ARCH. RATING:

APPLICATION RECEIVED:
SITE VISITS:
CERTIFICATES OF APP.:
00-000

APPLICANT:
Mistick Construction
1300 Brighton Road
Pittsburgh, PA 15233

NATIONAL REGISTER:

LISTED.....

ELIGIBLE

Proposed Changes:

Proposed ADA ramp to include change in fenestration openings.

Discussion:

1. Peter Culley of Mistick Construction explains that the building is used as a management office on the first floor for apartment owners in the surrounding neighborhood. He says there is no existing handicap access. They are proposing a ramp on the side of the building with a 4’ rise, constructed with painted concrete block, and a steel handrail painted black. He explains that a new opening in the brick needs to be created on the side of the building.
2. Mr. Hogan asks if there are any other landscaping elements. Mr. Culley answers, no but that this ramp would hide existing air conditioning units.
3. Mr. Culley shows a photo of the side of the building and explains that there is an existing window but it located within a stairwell so it is unusable to render into a door opening.
4. Mr. Stern asks if there are any more plans for the opening and roof awning to be placed above the door. Mr. Culley says the door material has not been decided yet but the awning will be a standing seam metal roof.
5. Mr. Stern says this information needs to be formally submitted, also they should re-consider the color the painted block.
6. Mr. Stern asks for public comment, none.
7. Mr. Hogan says there is not enough understanding of the drawings and materials, asks for re-submittal to the Historic Preservation Office.

MOTION:

Mr. Hogan.....Motions to table until further drawings are submitted.

Mr. SerraoSeconds the motion.

All members.....Voted in favor.

OWNER:
BO MENG
1703 E CARSON STREET
PITTSBURGH, PA 15203

WARD: 17th
LOT & BLOCK: 12-E-305
INSPECTOR: PAT BROWN
COUNCIL DISTRICT:
ZONING CLASSIFICATION:
ARCH. RATING:

APPLICATION RECEIVED:
SITE VISITS:
CERTIFICATES OF APP.:
00-000

APPLICANT:
DAVID J. MORGAN
74 S 12TH STREET
PITTSBURGH, PA 15203

NATIONAL REGISTER:

LISTED

ELIGIBLE

Proposed Changes:

Proposed modification to rear roofline, and new construction.

Discussion:

1. Architect, David Morgan, explained his plans to modify the rear roofline, removing the top floor (under the gable) and add a new addition in the middle portion of the building.
2. Southside Local Review Committee members Bob Russ and Gerald Morosco outlined the discussion points they had shared with David at their meeting. Bob Russ explained they felt he was “going too far” and that he should reconfigure the drawings to look less dramatic and to preserve more of the elements of the rear portion of the building.
3. Mr. Morosco said he did not attend the meeting but in his opinion the cornice and dormer on the rear roofline are original and contribute to the historic character of the building.
4. David says he does not disagree with any of these comments but they have to consider the function of the building as a restaurant on the first floor, and living space on the second and third.
5. Mr. Stern says he would like to see a revised rear second floor dormer scheme and asks for more photographs of the existing conditions of building and its surroundings.

MOTION:

Mr. Hogan.....Motions to table until further drawings are submitted.

Ms. McClellanSeconds the motion.

All members.....Voted in favor.

1707 East Carson Street

OWNER: Mary DeMauro 201 London Towne Drive Pittsburgh, Pa 15226	WARD:17 th LOT & BLOCK:..... 0012-E-00307 INSPECTOR: Bob Molyneaux	APPLICATION RECEIVED: 00/00/00 SITE VISITS: 00/00/00 CERTIFICATES OF APP.: 00-000
APPLICANT: David Morgan Architects 74 South 12 th Street Pittsburgh, PA 15203	COUNCIL DISTRICT: ZONING CLASSIFICATION: LNC ARCH. RATING: Typical	
NATIONAL REGISTER:	LISTED <input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	ELIGIBLE <input type="checkbox"/>

Proposed Changes:

Proposed replacement of storefront, including new lighting and signage.

Discussion:

1. Architect, David Morgan, explains that the owner is trying to update the restaurant. He has upgraded the interior and now plans to remove the existing wood storefront and replace it with a tile façade. Says the suggestions given to him by the SSLRC were to minimize the signboard and to add a fixed canvas awning with open ends. He explains that the tiles will be 12x12 matte, gray, porcelain.
2. Bob Russ of the SSLRC adds that Mr. Morgan has taken well to comments and they are in agreement.

MOTION:

Mr. SerraoMotions to approve with submission of new drawings and materials.

Mr. SternSeconds the motion.

All members.....Voted in favor.

51-53 South 12th Street

OWNER:
SRP1, LLC
94 South 13th Street
Pittsburgh, PA 15203

WARD: 17TH
LOT & BLOCK: ... 3-H-173; 3-H-172
INSPECTOR: PAT BROWN

APPLICATION RECEIVED:

SITE VISITS:

CERTIFICATES OF APP.:

APPLICANT:
Jen Bee Design, LLC
1001 Victory Drive
Allison Park, PA 15101

COUNCIL DISTRICT:
ZONING CLASSIFICATION:
ARCH. RATING:

00-000

NATIONAL REGISTER:

LISTED

ELIGIBLE

Proposed Changes:

Proposed rehabilitation of building façade including replacement of fenestration and entry door at first floor level.

Discussion:

1. Architect, Jen Bee, introduces her proposal for façade modification. Explains the storefront will be constructed mainly of operable glass panels with fixed panels above. There will be trim work in the signage area and new siding applied to restore the mansard roof
2. Mr. Hogan asks what is the primary material of the “nano” wall system. Ms. Bee answers that it is aluminum. She also adds that there will be a closed, retractable, canvas awning.
3. Mr. Hogan asks if Ms. Bee’s client has looked into URA Streetface funding, as even more could be done to preserve and rehabilitate this building. She answers, yes.

MOTION:

Mr. Hogan.....Motions to approve with submission of new drawings and materials, and suggestion to repaint 53 South 12th Street as opposed to cleaning the masonry, and on 51 S 12th Street to use the same sidelight glass on the façade.

Mr. SerraoSeconds the motion.

All members.....Voted in favor.

1601-1605 East Carson Street

OWNER:
16th & Carson Street Partners LLC
1601 E Carson Street
Pittsburgh, PA 15203

WARD:17th
LOT & BLOCK: 12-E-290; 12-E-292
INSPECTOR: PAT BROWN

APPLICATION RECEIVED:

SITE VISITS:

CERTIFICATES OF APP.:

APPLICANT:
16th & Carson Street Partners LLC
1601 E Carson Street
Pittsburgh, PA 15203

COUNCIL DISTRICT:
ZONING CLASSIFICATION:
ARCH. RATING:

00-000

NATIONAL REGISTER:

LISTED.....

ELIGIBLE

Proposed Changes:

Proposed modification of western wall, and installation of rooftop deck.

Discussion:

1. Owner, Adam DeSimone, explains that in 1992 the building was modified to its current state of black stainless steel. He explains his proposal to modify the western wall and to add a stainless steel railing (which would be visible from the right of way) to surround the proposed rooftop deck. He explains that the deck will be floating, sitting above the existing pitched roof (the pitch is 5.5’ high). The deck dimensions are 40’x60’ which is the full width of the building. Additionally an 8’ parapet well of brick would be added to conceal the deck from the East Carson Street right of way.
2. Mr. Serrao asks how one will access the deck and how it will be lit. Mr. DeSimone explains that there are two existing internal staircases and it will be lit with uplighting.
3. Mr. Stern asks for public comment and Bob Russ of the SSLRC says they did not have time to form a consensus, but he thinks it will be very visible from the public right of way and it will adversely affect the roofline. Mr. DeSimone adds in his defense that he is on the agenda for the Southside design committee meeting and he has actively communicated with neighbors in the area.
4. Mr. Morosco, SSLRC, says he feels that the deck will be conspicuous and rooftop decks are certainly not part of 19th Century architecture. Also says that he cannot fully understand the drawings.
5. Mr. Hogan says that Mr. DeSimone should have a further meeting with the SSLRC and come back to HRC next month.
6. Mr. DeSimone asks for further suggestions.
7. Mr. Hogan explains that they need to have a full grasp of the impacts of this modification.
8. Mr. Stern says it would help if it were decreased in size and were “lighter” and less dramatic visually, and if it did not project as far to the front of the building.
9. Mr. Morosco adds that the ordinance reads that new features should be placed out of view from the right of way.

10. Mr. Hogan asks for an indication of Mr. DeSimone’s timeline. Mr. DeSimone says he would like to have it open by May 1st.
11. Mr. Stern again suggests he revise his submission, meet with the SSLRC and to come back next month. Mitigate the degree to which it is conspicuous.

MOTION:

Mr. Hogan.....Motions to table the application with the understanding that Mr. DeSimone can bring back the case and argue its minimal impact.

Mr. SerraoSeconds the motion.

All members.....Voted in favor.
