

CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

Minutes of the Meeting of April 5, 2016
Beginning at 2:03 p.m.

PRESENT OF THE COMMISSION: Chairwoman Christine Mondor,
Gitnik, Brown, Askey, Burton-Faulk,
Blackwell, Deitrick, Dick, Pezzino

PRESENT OF THE STAFF: Gastil, Layman, Hanna, Rakus, Kramer,
Ray

AGENDA ITEMS COVERED IN THESE MINUTES

| <i>Item</i> | <i>Page No.</i> |
|--|-----------------|
| 1. PDP #16-037, Reedsdale Street at Art Rooney, New Parking Structure | 2 |
| 2. PDP #16-032, 20 Stanwix St, Exterior Renovations | 5 |
| 3. Zone Change Petition 787, C-800, 5600 Forward Ave change to LNC | 7 |
| 4. Susan Brahm Gunn Consolidation, 35 Claybourne St, 7 th Ward | 10 |
| 5. St. Clair Apartments Plan of Lots, 5812 Rippey St., 11 th Ward | 11 |
| 6. Revised Synergy Capital Subdivision, 144 43 rd St., 9 th Ward | 12 |
| 7. Midwife Center Consolidation Plan, 2825 Penn Ave., 6 th Ward | 13 |
| 8. Buncher Company Lot Consolidation Plan, Murray and Forward, 14 th & 15 th Wards | 14 |
| 9. ATM Associates Plan of Lots, 6345-6351 Aylesboro Ave., 14 th Ward | 15 |

Ms. Mondor chaired today’s meeting and called the meeting to order.

A. ACTION ON THE MINUTES

On a motion duly moved by Ms. Burton-Faulk and seconded by Ms. Askey the minutes from the March 8, 2015 meeting were approved.

Ms. Detrick made mention that it would be effective if the minutes for the meeting minutes from the last meeting can be approved at the proceeding meeting to help the commissioners keep track of their voting and recommendations.

B. CORRESPONDENCE (See Attachment A for staff reports.)

Ms. Mondor stated that the Commission was in receipt of correspondence

- Letter from Greenfield Community Association in opposition of Zone Change Petition 787, C-800, 5600 Forward Avenue.
- Letter from Audrey Glickman opposing Zone Change Petition 787, C-800, 5600 Forward Avenue.

C. DEVELOPMENT REVIEWS (See **Attachment B** for staff reports.)

1. Hearing and Action: Project Development Plan #16-037, Reedsdale Street at Art Rooney,

Mr. Layman made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Mr. Layman recommended approval of the proposal.

Rich Young of WTW representing the Stadium Authority of the City of Pittsburgh presented the plan for new construction of a 6 story 1,000 space commercial parking structure to occupy a portion of the North Shore parcel known as Lot 1. This application also constitutes an amendment to the North Shore Master Plan. The applicant has submitted an addendum to the plan which addresses only the changes relevant to Lot 1. They are pursuing the Gold Level certification for garages.

The plan will result in a net increase of approximately 600 new parking spaces with associated landscaping, and a new pedestrian promenade connecting the garage entrance to W. General Robinson Street.

He also reviewed results of the traffic study and described the routes to and from the garage on a normal day and when there are events at the venues.

The Chairwoman called for comments from the Public.

Vivian Lee, President and CEO of Riverlife, spoke in support of the plan however would like timely details. Riverlife believes there should be area-wide planning connections, additional transportation planning and inclusion of the rest room facilities. They are in support of the provision bike riders and charging stations.

John DeSantis 719 Brighton Road on behalf of the Allegheny West Civic Council spoke stating that they are in support of the plan and the ongoing efforts to help with the parking issues on the Northside of Pittsburgh.

There being no more comments from the Public, the Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the Commissioners.

Ms. Mondor wanted to know about the rating system for green garages.

Mr. Young stated that The Green Parking System takes into account certain things relating to operational efficiencies. Currently they are 11 points short of the Gold certification.

Ms. Mondor asked for explanation relating to the proximity of T Station.

Mr. Young stated it was about 1 block.

Ms. Deitrick wanted to know about the off times relating to the Egress.

Mr. Young stated that the normally limit the parking during day due to week day evening events.

Ms. Deitrick asked about the fencing contrast and felt that the look could have been better.

Mr. Gitnik believes the air foils should be continued. The building looks nicer from a distance. He also wanted to know how he would walk to the LRT?

Mr. Young stated it is all sidewalks to the LRT.

Mr. Gitnik asked about restrooms stating that other things may happen in the parking lot.

Mr. Young during events there are portable johns along the street. The main reason is adding a restroom now will delay the project

Doug Straley Project Manager for The Stadium Authority hopes to put the restroom in the future but due to budgetary concerns, and sewage plan modules they will look at it later. They want the garage to be open for the Pirates season next year. They would appreciate at least 1 year to install the restrooms.

Mr. Brown asked for clarifications on the amount of storm water that will be captured and what is impact use of the Solar panel.

Mr. Young stated that 20% of the water will go into the bio-swales.

Mr. Young stated about 100% not including the elevators.

There being no more questions or comments from the Commissioners, the Chairwoman called for the motion.

MOTION: That the Planning Commission of the City of Pittsburgh approves Project Development Plan #16-037, for new construction of a 6 story, 1,000 space commercial parking structure based on the application filed by the Stadium Authority, property owner, with the following conditions:

1. That final plans, elevations, and materials, shall be reviewed and approved by the Zoning Administrator prior to approval of an application for a building permit, and review of a revised design to address concerns about the open spandrels above vehicle entrances shall be reviewed and approved by the Zoning Administrator prior to the issuance of an occupancy permit;
2. That a final landscaping plan, including any alternative compliance proposals, shall be reviewed and approved by the Zoning Administrator prior to issuance of an occupancy permit;
3. That a transportation study be approved by the City's transportation staff prior to issuance of a building permit and any required improvements must be addressed prior to issuance of the final certificate of occupancy, and
4. A storm water management plan shall be submitted for review and approval by City Planning staff prior to issuance of a building permit; and

5. Applicant shall fit out the first floor of the parking garage with accessible public restrooms within one year from issuance of the occupancy permit.

MOVED BY Ms. Pezzino; SECONDED BY Ms. Askey.

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Gitnik, Brown, Askey, Burton-Faulk, Blackwell, Deitrick, Dick, Pezzino

OPPOSED: None **CARRIED**

2. Hearing & Action: Project Development Plan #16-032, 20 Stanwix Street, exterior renovations

Ms. Rakus made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Ms. Rakus recommended approval of the proposal.

Dina Snyder with Strada Architects reviewed the aesthetic upgrades of the spaces at 20 Stanwix Street. The development includes design changes and new landscaping for the two plazas. One plaza is located at Stanwix Street at First Avenue and the second is along Fort Pitt Boulevard. The plans include removal of the sculpture to soften the plaza. They are working with the Office of Public Art and Southerby to find a local home for the piece. No irrigation will be needed for the planters.

The Chairwoman called for comments from the Public.

Rachel Clifff spoke about the removal of the public art work. Asking why they are removing the artwork - Ricky El's One Up One Down was installed 1982 wondering if it could be relocated to another site with donated funds.

There being no more comments from the Public, the Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the Commission members.

Ms. Dick wanted to know if the Birch Trees are drought tolerant.

Ms. Snyder said yes.

Mr. Gitnik asked about the options for removing the art.

Ms. Snyder will share the information with Mr. Gitnik for his information.

Ms. Detrick wanted to know if the owner is willing to work with the city to find a new home for the art.

Ms. Snyder said yes.

Ms. Snyder stated that water is penetrating into the plaza and that is the main reason for the removal.

There being no more questions or comments from the Commission, the Chairwoman called for the motion.

MOTION: That Planning Commission of the City of Pittsburgh approves Project Development Plan #16-032 for exterior renovation based on the application and drawings filed by Strada, on behalf of M&J Wilcow, property owner, with the following condition:

1. Final construction plans including final site plan and landscaping plan shall be submitted for review and approval by the Zoning Administrator prior to an application for a building permit.

MOVED BY Ms. Dick; SECONDED BY Ms. Blackwell

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Gitnik, Brown, Askey, Burton-Faulk, Blackwell, Deitrick, Dick, Pezzino

OPPOSED: None

CARRIED

3. Hearing & Action: Land Use Control File No. C-787, Zone Change Petition #800, 5600 Forward Avenue (Buncher Company)

Ms. Rakus made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Ms. Rakus recommended approval of the proposal.

Mike Kutzer Vice President with the Buncher Company presented information regarding to their request for the rezoning of five parcels from Two-Unit Residential Low Density and Park (P) to Local Neighborhood Commercial (LNC) at the corner of Forward Avenue and Beechwood Boulevard the Squirrel Hill Neighborhood. The site is approximately 1 acre they would like to clean up the site and reactivate and market the property.

The Chairwoman called for comments from the Public.

Audrey Glickman of 3548 Beechwood Boulevard spoke in opposition of the plan stating that the site should be a park and provide a calming to the traffic.

There being no more comments from the Public, the Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the Commission members.

Ms. Pezzino wanted to know how much of the area is zoned a park.

Mr. Kutzer stated that there was zone change at some point prior to Bucher's purchase of the site.

Ms. Rakus stated that is was a C5 old zoning district. Not sure of the recommendation that was made during the updating of the code in 1999.

Mr. Gastil stated that Plighted Designation study has been done there are 7 criteria 1 criteria must be met. It will come to the Commission at some point and to his understanding the Squirrel Hill Coalition and Councilman O'Connor are on board with this. The process should be if it advances there will be a hearing and will be brought to you for a briefing and hearing.

Ms. Deitrick stated that telling us that the community is supporting and presenting a letter are two different things.

Ms. Blackwell wanted to know how many community engagement meetings were held.

Mr. Kutzer stated there were not meeting because they had nothing to present.

Mr. Gitnik stated you do know what can be built on an LNC so didn't you at least present something to the community.

Mr. Kutzer stated they have nothing to present so there was nothing to discuss.

Mr. Gitnik stated that community engagement is important. Why can't it be donated?

Mr. Kutzer stated that they cannot donate if the funds must be kept separate.

Ms. Deitrick stated that there are alternatives to this site. It is not that hard to meet with the community to discuss a Zoning Change.

Mr. Kutzer stated he is sure there will be community engagement once there is something to discuss.

Mr. Gitnik wanted to know if the adjacent land were notified.

Ms. Rakus stated yes and no comments came back.

Mr. Gitnik asked if the commission could table this and obtain some community engagement.

Mr. Kutzer stated that would rather move on so they can respond to interested parties.

Ms. Blackwell stated that she feels the applicant should engage the community. You are discussing possibilities and you should notify the community.

Mr. Kutzer stated that the property was re-zoned after they purchased it without their knowledge. The building was zoned LNC and Parks we demolished part of the building due to its structure.

Mr. Gastil suggested that the Commission should cease the debate about the non-conforming use with City Law.

Ms. Mondor asked for a motion for approval or a recommendation to delay.

Mr. Gitnik made a recommendation to continue until the City Law Department clarifies some of the issues.

Ms. Deitrick stated that she would like to see community engagement as well.

MOTION was made to delay above stated motion to obtain more information from the Department of City Planning/Law Department.

MOVED BY Ms. Dick; SECONDED BY Ms. Blackwell

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Gitnik, Brown, Askey, Burton-Faulk, Blackwell, Deitrick, Dick, Pezzino

OPPOSED: None

CARRIED

E. PLAN OF LOTS (See Attachment C.)

4. Susan Brahm Gunn Consolidation Plan (5444 Claybourne Street), 7th Ward

Mr. Miller made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Director Gastil stated that the subdivision committee had met and recommends approval of the plan. The Chairwoman called for a motion.

MOTION: That the Susan Brahm Gunn Consolidation Plan, submitted by Susan Brahm Gunn, dated January 28, 2016, and received by the Planning Commission April 5, 2016 be approved and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto. (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY Ms. Deitrick; SECONDED BY Ms. Burton-Faulk.

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Gitnik, Brown, Askey, Blackwell, Burton-Faulk, Deitrick, Dick, Pezzino

OPPOSED: None **CARRIED**

5. St. Clair Apartments Plan of Lots (5812 Rippey Street), 11th Ward

Mr. Miller made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Director Gastil stated that the subdivision committee had met and recommends approval of the plan. The Chairwoman called for a motion.

MOTION: That the St. Clair Apartments, L.P. Plan of Lots, submitted by East Liberty Development, Inc., dated January 28, 2016 and received by the Planning Commission April 5, 2016 be approved and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto. (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY Ms. Deitrick; SECONDED BY Ms. Burton-Faulk.

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Gitnik, Brown, Askey, Blackwell, Burton-Faulk, Deitrick, Dick, Pezzino

OPPOSED: None **CARRIED**

6. Revised Synergy Capital Subdivision Plan (144 43rd Street), 9th Ward

Mr. Miller made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Director Gastil stated that the subdivision committee had met and recommends approval of the plan. The Chairwoman called for a motion.

MOTION: That the Synergy Capital Subdivision Plan, 9th Ward, City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, prepared for Synergy Capital LP by Allegheny Land Surveying, dated March 2, 2016 and received by the Planning Commission April 5, 2016 be approved and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto. (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY Ms. Deitrick; SECONDED BY Ms. Burton-Faulk.

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Gitnik, Brown, Askey, Burton-Faulk, Deitrick, Dick, Pezzino

Ms. Blackwell ABSTAINED

OPPOSED: None **CARRIED**

7. Midwife Center Consolidation Plan (2625 Penn Avenue), 6th Ward

Mr. Miller made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Director Gastil stated that the subdivision committee had met and recommends approval of the plan. The Chairwoman called for a motion.

MOTION: That the Midwife Center Consolidation Plan, submitted by The Midwife Center for Birth and Woman’s Health, dated September 20, 2015 and received by the Planning Commission April 5, 2016 be approved and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto. (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY Ms. Deitrick; SECONDED BY Ms. Burton-Faulk.

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Gitnik, Brown, Askey, Blackwell, Burton-Faulk, Deitrick, Dick, Pezzino

OPPOSED: None **CARRIED**

Ms. Pezzino asked if she could publicly disclose that she serves on a Committee within the Midwife Center.

- 8. Buncher Company Lot Consolidation Plan (Between Forward Avenue and Murray Avenue), 14th and 15th Wards

Mr. Miller made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Director Gastil stated that the subdivision committee had met and recommends approval of the plan. The Chairwoman called for a motion.

Mr. Miller stated that there is nothing to prevent a consolidated split zone lot that has to be reviewed by the Zoning Board of the Adjustment.

MOTION: To continue until the more information is obtained from the Department and City Law.

MOVED BY Ms. Dick; SECONDED BY Ms. Blackwell.

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Gitnik, Brown, Askey, Burton-Faulk, Blackwell, Deitrick, Dick, Pezzino

OPPOSED: None **CARRIED**

- 9. Allegheny County Sanitary Authority and WJB Entities, LLC Plan of Lots (Stafford Street at West Carson Street), 20th Ward

Mr. Miller made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Director Gastil stated that the subdivision committee had met and recommends approval of the plan. The Chairwoman called for a motion.

MOTION: That the Allegheny County Sanitary Authority and WJB Entities, LLC Plan of Lots, prepared for the Allegheny County Sanitary Authority and WJB Entities, LLC dated March 30, 2016 and received by the Planning Commission April 5, 2016 be approved and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto. (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY Ms. Deitrick; SECONDED BY Ms. Burton-Faulk.

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Gitnik, Brown, Askey, Blackwell, Burton-Faulk, Deitrick, Dick, Pezzino

OPPOSED: None **CARRIED**

