

## Questions to City of Pittsburgh

### ARLE Request for Proposals

#### **Question 1**

RFP Page 4, Section 2.2.2: No camera system may be capable of being manipulated from a remote location for any purpose.

RFP Page 17, Section 2.15.2: The camera system must be capable of allowing City personnel to complete remote downloads; verify calibration and shutdown the camera system.

The “remote” references in RFP sections 2.2.2 and 2.15.2 seem to conflict with each other. Would the City please clarify if it will allow the camera system to be remotely accessed? In addition, would the City consider modifying section 2.15.2 to read, “The camera system must be capable of allowing vendor personnel to complete remote downloads, verify calibration and shutdown the camera system”?

#### **Response 1**

*The camera system may be remotely accessed but not remotely modified. Modifications to the cameras view and operational parameters should only be made on location.*

#### **Question 2**

RFP Page 7, Section 2.5.3: For each hour exceeding the twenty-four (24) hours allotted for repair or replacement of inoperable equipment, the vendor must pay the City liquidated damages per piece of inoperable equipment or camera location at the hourly rate of seventy-five dollars (\$75.00).

Would the City consider modifying the liquidated damages of \$75 per hour to \$75 per day?

#### **Response 2**

*No, the contractor is expected to have adequate spare parts on hand to keep the system operational. The contractor shall have 24 hours to make repairs.*

#### **Question 3**

RFP Page 12, Section 2.9.1: The vendor may be required to perform feasibility and/or baseline studies at intersections being considered or selected for inclusion in the program. Proposals must include the methodology of the studies. Any traffic studies conducted as part of a site selection process must occur at the target location and for a period of at least twenty-four (24) continuous hours.

Will the City consider modifying this requirement to allow for a site selection process that is based on a more efficient and effective predictive model that uses data elements such as crash data,

constructability, intersection attributes and traffic flow; instead of a process that is based on field observation or video monitoring?

**Response 3**

*The requirement only states that vendors may be required to complete studies. It does not dictate the type of study and asks the vendor to supply the methodology for the study.*

**Question 4**

RFP Page 12, Section 2.10.2: The vendor will be responsible to provide updated traffic signal record drawings showing all actual field locations of all equipment.

Would the City please clarify if the updated drawings would only need to show updates that are made to the vendor's red-light camera system equipment, or is the vendor expected to provide updated drawings related to changes to the intersections, not made by the vendor, at which the camera systems are installed?

**Response 4**

*The vendor is responsible to provide accurate drawings showing all new equipment related to the camera system and upgrades required by the City and Penndot. Drawings will also include pavement marking modifications as well as existing equipment to remain. The existing record drawings will be provided to the vendor in PDF format.*

**Question 5**

RFP Page 31, Section 7: Proposal should be no more than twenty (20) pages.

Would the City consider removing the page limit of 20 pages for the proposal? This will allow for a straightforward, clear response to each of the City' Scope of Work requirements, so that it is clear to the City how the vendor complies with each of the City's requirements.

**Response 5**

*The proposal shall be limited to 20 - single sided, 8 1/2" x 11" pages. The appendices will **not** be counted toward the page limit; however the appendices should include supporting or supplementary information only.*

**Question 6**

Is the MBE/WBE/Veteran Owned Solicitation and Commitment form the only form that the vendor is required to submit with its proposal?

**Response 6**

*All forms required to be submitted with the proposal are available on the website, <http://pittsburghpa.gov/omb/contract-bids> and attached to these responses.*

**Question 7**

RFP Pages 33 and 34, Section 12.6: Respondent must confirm its willingness to enter into a Professional Services agreement with the City and to comply with the terms agreed to by the parties' therein. The City's Professional Services agreement terms include, but are not limited to, insurance (liability and workers compensation) and indemnification requirements. Respondent acknowledges that the City's final selection of a Respondent, if any, is contingent upon prior authorization by Pittsburgh City Council to enter into a Professional Services agreement for these services after the selection process set forth in Section VIII herein is completed.

Would the City please provide its Professional Services agreement terms, including its insurance requirements and indemnification requirements, which are referenced in section 12.6?

**Response 7**

*A template of the City's Professional Services contract is attached.*

**Question 8**

RFP Page 29: In this section it states: "3.1.12 Include financial statements for the last four (4) years, examined by an independent Certified Public Accountant who is not an employee of the vendor."

Given the length of our audited financial statements, can Bidders provide these documents in electronic format only?

**Response 8**

*Financial statements can be provided electronically.*

**Question 9**

RFP Page 31: In this section it states: "Proposal should be no more than twenty (20) pages; single sided, standard, readable, print on standard 8.5x11 papers."

The RFP restricts page size to 8 ½ X 11 inch paper. For complex documents like organizational charts or Microsoft Project plans and architecture diagrams, may Bidders use larger paper folded down to 8 ½ X 11 inch size?

**Response 9**

*Complex documents such as these can be provided on 11x17 inch paper and folded to 8 ½ x11 to provide legibility.*

**Question 10**

RFP Page 35: In this section it states: “In order to demonstrate good faith commitment to these goals, all bidders are required to complete and submit with their bids either: the attached MBE / WBE / Veteran Owned Solicitation and Commitment Form (which details the efforts made by the bidder to obtain such participation), or the attached MBE/WBE/Veteran Owned Solicitation and Commitment Form–Waiver Request, which details why no MBE/WBE/Veteran-Owned business participation could be obtained. Failure to submit either of these forms will result in rejection of the bid. Copies of these forms are provided.”

Would the City please provide the commitment forms? The forms were not attached to the RFP.

**Response 10**

*All forms required to be submitted with the proposal are available on the website, <http://pittsburghpa.gov/omb/contract-bids> and attached to these responses.*

**Question 11**

RFP Page29: In this section the City requests “Appendices”. Will the 20 page limit include the appendices or are they excluded from the page limit?

**Response 11**

*The proposal shall be limited to 20 - single sided, 8 1/2” x 11” pages. The appendices will **not** be counted toward the page limit; however the appendices should include supporting or supplementary information only.*

**Question 12**

RFP Page 8: RFP Sections 2.6.2 and 2.6.3 seem to contain the same requirement. Would the City please clarify?

“The proposing vendor must have sufficient experience in providing large scale and full service Automated Red Enforcement Systems and services to cities of similar size.”

**Response 12**

*Please disregard 2.6.3.*

**Question 13**

RFP Page 27 Section 2.22: The RFP states that Vendors should assume “a minimum of six automated red light enforcement systems.” Would the City please confirm that by a minimum of six systems, the City means enforcement at 6 approaches and not 6 intersections (which could include upwards of 24 approaches)?

The number of installed systems can impact pricing. In order to facilitate an consistent evaluation of vendor prices, will the City evaluate vendor prices based on only six systems or some greater number of systems?

Additionally, please describe the City's plans, if any, for expansion beyond six systems.

**Response 13**

*After further consideration, the city intends to begin with ten intersections for the automated red light enforcement program. Please assume four approaches per intersection for a total of forty camera systems.*

**Question 14**

When an intersection is chosen for enforcement, will all the approaches of that intersection be enforced or will only selected approaches be chosen?

**Response 14**

*Ideally all approaches will be covered. However, one or more approaches may not be monitored due to site specific reasons.*

**Question 15**

The RFP requires a four-year base contract with 2 one-year options. Act 84 which authorizes Red Light Enforcement in Pennsylvania has a sunset provision which is set to expire on July 15, 2017. Is it the City's intention to have the vendor use the remaining contract term and option years to amortize non-recurring costs should the sunset provision not be extended?

**Response 15**

*The City intends to pay a monthly fee for the length of the contract, either the full four years or the reduced time period in the event the law expires in July, 2017.*

**Question 16**

What department or departments does the City anticipate will hold adjudication hearings and how often will hearings be held?

**Response 16**

*We anticipate that adjudication hearings will be coordinated by the Pittsburgh Parking Authority and held on a schedule similar to what is currently offered for parking violations.*

**Question 17**

Would the City please provide a draft contract?

**Response 17**

*A template of the City's Professional Services contract is attached.*

**Question 18**

RFP Page 16 Sections 2.13.2 and 2.13.4: It seems that requirement number 2.13.3 is missing. Would the City clarify if this numbered incorrectly or is there indeed a missing requirement?

**Response 18**

*This section is numbered incorrectly. All requirements are listed in the RFP.*

**Question 19**

RFP Page 10 Section 2.7.5: In this section it states "The customer service representatives will be paid the prevailing industry wage."

Would the City please define prevailing wage? Also, are there any other positions that will be paid a prevailing wage? Are union subcontractors required?

**Response 19**

*The prevailing wage ordinance is found in Title 1 Section 161.35 of the City of Pittsburgh Code, available here:*

[https://www.municode.com/library/pa/pittsburgh/codes/code\\_of\\_ordinances?nodeId=HORUCHPIPE\\_TITONEAD\\_ARTVIIPR\\_CH161CO\\_S161.35PILIWA](https://www.municode.com/library/pa/pittsburgh/codes/code_of_ordinances?nodeId=HORUCHPIPE_TITONEAD_ARTVIIPR_CH161CO_S161.35PILIWA)

*This ordinance applies to all vendor and subcontractor employees.*

**Question 20**

RFP Page 34 Section 13: Would the City please clarify whether the MBE/WBE/VET goals are independent or whether a single entity can satisfy multiple goals (e.g., can the work performed by a single firm count towards both the MBE and the Veteran goal)?

**Response 20**

*The MBE/WBE/VET goals are not independent. One firm can count toward multiple goals.*

**Question 21**

Will the vendor be allowed to use any existing infrastructure like poles, underground conduit for the purpose of installation of the camera system?

**Response 21**

*If available and in the proper position, the vendor may ask the City for permission to use existing. It is not anticipated that existing infrastructure will be available in most locations.*

**Question 22**

Please provide a copy of the prevailing wage ordinance and confirm the job classification which applies to the work to be performed by the vendor under this RFP?

**Response 22**

*The prevailing wage ordinance is found in Title 1 Section 161.35 of the City of Pittsburgh Code, available here:*

[https://www.municode.com/library/pa/pittsburgh/codes/code\\_of\\_ordinances?nodeId=HORUCHPIPE\\_TITONEAD\\_ARTVIIPR\\_CH161CO\\_S161.35PILIWA](https://www.municode.com/library/pa/pittsburgh/codes/code_of_ordinances?nodeId=HORUCHPIPE_TITONEAD_ARTVIIPR_CH161CO_S161.35PILIWA)

*This ordinance applies to all vendor and subcontractor employees.*

**Question 23**

Will you please provide details on the City's insurance requirements?

**Response 23**

*A sample contract is attached, which includes the City's insurance requirements.*

**Question 24**

How many systems are anticipated at the beginning of the contract? Does the City anticipate activating additional systems throughout the program and if so, at what rate (quantity per year)?

**Response 24**

*The City intends to begin with ten intersections for the automated red light enforcement program.*

*Please assume four approaches per intersection for a total of forty camera systems.*

*We do anticipate adding additional systems throughout the life of the program. For planning purposes, please assume a minimum of 5 additional intersections per year.*

**Question 25**

Please provide a list of identified intersections. If a list has been identified but not narrowed down, please provide the top 20 intersections that are being considered. This will allow our team to evaluate the site prior to submission.

**Response 25**

*Candidate locations will not be provided at this time. Once PennDOT has reviewed and provided comment to the preliminary list, those locations will be provided to the vendor.*

**Question 26**

The RFP references a program setup including active systems and dummy systems. Will the City please further clarify the envisioned programs in more detail? Is the program to include 6 active approaches with additional dummy enclosure sites setup? If so, how many dummy sites are expected and how often shall the systems be rotated? Please explain the reasoning and goals of the dummy sites.

**Response 26**

*After further consideration, the city intends to begin with ten intersections for the automated red light enforcement program. Please assume four approaches per intersection for a total of forty camera systems. The City does not intend to have any dummy sites. The proposed camera should have different housing options to allow for a contextually sensitive fit on the street.*

**Question 27**

How many hours per month, per system, do you anticipate each system to be in an active/enforcement mode (a mode issuing enforceable citations)? Please describe how the warning period will be rolled out for each system.

**Response 27**

*Our intent is for each camera system to be in active/enforcement mode 24 hours a day unless technical issues prevent enforcement for a given intersection. In these cases, the selected vendor will have 24 hours to resolve the issue before monetary penalties begin.*

*State law requires that new systems are in warning mode for the first 60 days following installation at the initial intersection. Subsequently, the warning period for each additional intersection will be 30 days. It is anticipated that the City's system will be consistent with state code.*

**Question 28**

Section 2.1.8: Please confirm that the record examination relates only to records related to the Pittsburgh contract.

**Response 28**

*Yes, record examination will only apply to those records related to the contract with the City of Pittsburgh.*

**Question 29**

Section 2.4.3: Requirement 2.4.3 requests custom designed poles to meet City specifications. What percentage of pole (or how many) are expected to be custom designed for the City?

**Response 29**

*The poles used in the automated red light enforcement system will visually complement the existing poles at the intersection or in the streetscape. All poles required for installation of the camera systems must be approved by the City. The City's standard poles have been designed for traffic signal or lighting equipment. The vendor must provide structural calculations showing that the pole and foundation design are adequate to support the camera system.*

*For new traffic signal installations, the city uses either the Penndot standard round tapered pole, typically painted black or a square pole painted gray.*

**Question 30**

Section 2.4.3: What is the City's estimated cost for providing and installing signs, per system, over the entire life of the contract, including replacement of damaged signs during the contract period?

**Response 30**

*After further consideration, the Vendor shall install the signage and ensure that is in place while the camera system is operational.*

**Question 31**

Section 2.4.3: Point 2.4.3 says the vendor is responsible for pavement markings at the intersection including, but not limited to, stop bars, crosswalks, lane use arrows, lane lines and double yellow lines within 150 feet of the intersection. Please confirm that the vendor is only responsible for pavement markings should the markings be disturbed during the installation period.

**Response 31**

*The vendor will be responsible for markings as required by PennDOT as a condition for approval of a given intersection. The intent is that the markings will be installed in a durable material at the turn on of the system since pavement markings especially stop bars are critical in operation of the system. Ongoing maintenance of pavement markings will be the responsibility of Public Works after the initial installation.*

**Question 32**

Section 2.5.1: What are the obstructions, currently identified, at each identified intersection that might interfere with the operation of a red light photo enforcement system?

**Response 32**

*We do not have intersections identified and approved at this time; however, examples of obstructions could be existing signage or street trees. Care should be taken at the time of camera installation to minimize the number of obstructions that require removal or relocation of existing roadside features.*

**Question 33**

Section 2.7: Does the City have a preference for a local office location or is there a possibility to cohabitate in an existing City office location? If is the latter, what would the City charge for that office location?

**Response 33**

*The City prefers that a local office location (customer service center) is sited in a central location with easy public transit access and free parking available for customers. While the City is open to the possibility of cohabitating in an existing City office location, we do not believe there is a location that would meet those requirements.*

**Question 34**

Section 2.10.1: Several requirements, including 2.10.1, specify that the vendor shall be responsible for all costs associated with upgrades required by PennDot or the City. What are the estimated required upgrades, per identified intersection, in order to be in compliance with PennDot and the City?

**Response 34**

*We do not know specific upgrades required for each intersection at this point since the intersections have not been identified. Common upgrades we anticipate will be the addition of countdown pedestrian signals, audible pedestrian signals, upgraded pavement markings and upgraded signage.*

**Question 35**

Section 2.13.6: 2.13.6 indicates that recorded images and other data will be for the exclusive use of the City, its authorized agents, and law enforcement officials. If a subpoena is issued by a court to the vendor to release images and/or video and we refuse to comply we may be subject to sanction and/or other actions. Will the jurisdiction indemnify the vendor in requests such as these? How are these type of situations currently handled?

**Response 35**

*The Stage legislation for automated red light enforcement systems specifies the following:*

(3) Notwithstanding any other provision of law, information prepared under this section and information relating to violations under this section which is kept by the municipality, its authorized agents or employees, including recorded images, written records, reports or facsimiles, names and addresses, shall be for the exclusive use of the municipality, its authorized agents, its employees and law enforcement officials for the purpose of discharging their duties under this section and under any ordinances and resolutions of the municipality. The information shall not be deemed a public record under the act of February 14, 2008 (P.L.6, No.3), known as the Right-to-Know Law. The information shall not be discoverable by court order or otherwise, nor shall it be offered in evidence in any action or proceeding which is not directly related to a violation of this section or any ordinance or resolution of the municipality. The restrictions set forth under this paragraph shall not be deemed to preclude a court of competent jurisdiction from issuing an order directing that the information be provided to law enforcement officials if the information is reasonably described and is requested solely in connection with a criminal law enforcement action.

**Question 36**

Section 2.15.2: Please clarify the amber light calibration and red light calibration requirement. This setup and calibration is not a function that a vendor takes responsibility for; this is a setting by the City's Traffic Engineers.

**Response 36**

*The vendor will not be responsible for setting the amber or red phases but verifying that they are in accordance with the PennDOT permit plan. If a discrepancy is found the vendor must immediately notify the City to take corrective action.*

**Question 37**

Section 2.18.4: What types of systems, cameras and data files is the City requesting be connected to our system? How will the data be used - what types of application uses does the City plan to perform with this loaded data?

**Response 37**

*The City does not intend to connect any cameras or systems to the automated red light system. In the event that the vendor proposes or must use different cameras, the cameras must communicate like information to a single system and single database.*

**Question 38**

Section 2.18.6: Will it be required to utilize the Remote Deposit Capture technology at the local office?

**Response 38**

*Yes, the City requires that Remote Deposit Capture is used for checking transactions conducted at the Customer Service Center.*

**Question 39**

Sections 2.18.7, 2.19.2 and 2.20.1: As City program statistics are confidential and cannot be disclosed without permission from each City, our proposal shall include general information, non-specific program details (e.g. a quantity range for violations issued, registered owner success rate, call center statistics on a larger scale). Please confirm this approach is acceptable.

**Response 39**

*The City understands that specific program details are confidential. It is acceptable to include a range for these program statistics as long as the benchmark cities selected are all similar in scope to Pittsburgh's proposed red light enforcement system so that the ranges provided are narrow and statistics are applicable to the Pittsburgh program.*

**Question 40**

How will data from 2.19.2 (registered owner requests) and 2.20 (collection details) be reconciled?

**Response 40**

*The vendor is responsible for providing a plan to secure payment from the registered owner.*

**Question 41**

Section 2.20.8: The RFP requires a walk-in customer service center but 2.20.8 references being able to accept walk-in payments at other locations around the city, will you please elaborate on the desired payment methods/locations.

**Response 41**

*This section refers to providing self-service terminals at other key locations for customers to make payments. For example, a vendor may propose to locate a kiosk at a shopping plaza or other convenient location. These self-service terminals will supplement the customer service center.*

**Question 42**

Page 31, 7: The Economy of Proposals section details which items shall not count towards the 20 page limit. Will you please consider excluding the following pages from the page count:

- Section tabs
- All lists requested under 2.1 Business Ethics, pg 13, 2.11.7, pg20,2.18.7
- Implementation schedule
- Appendix such as: certificate of insurance, voluntary disclosure, sample paperwork, sample incidents, sample reports, financial statements, etc.

**Response 42**

*Section tabs, lists of detailed information referenced in your 20 page response such as those required in section 2.1, a detailed implementation schedule, and appendices will **not** count toward the 20 page limit.*

**Question 43**

Page 31, 7: Will the City accept an enclosed CD containing program examples?

**Response 43**

*Yes, the City will accept an enclosed CD will program examples.*

**Question 44**

Section 11: The last three paragraphs of Section 11: Proposal Submission (top of page 33) precludes marking items confidential/trade secret/proprietary. The RFP reads as if information cannot be marked confidential, however it states "The content of all proposals will be maintained as confidential until the Final Respondent selection is publically announced, but may be subject to disclosure pursuant to applicable law thereafter." As Pennsylvania's public records law protects trade secrets, will vendors have the opportunity to redact if the City receives a FOIA request?

**Response 44**

*Yes the City will allow the vendor to redact items in a proposal that are confidential or proprietary in nature consistent with the FOIA.*

**Question 45**

Section 14.1: As mentioned in the Respondent's Responsibility in 14.1, all material and work products become property of the City. Please provide clarification on this requirement; who determines what is or is not material and/or work products prepared, developed or obtained through agreement with the client that shall then become the City's property?

**Response 45**

*The contract will determine what information is considered a work product under this program which will become the property of the City.*

**Question 46**

By approaches, you mean what specifically; six cameras or six intersections?

**Response 46**

*After further consideration, the city intends to begin with ten intersections for the automated red light enforcement program. Please assume four approaches per intersection for a total of forty camera systems.*

**Question 47**

Does the location of the processing center need to be approved by the city?

**Response 47**

*The location of the processing center does need to be approved by the City to ensure it is within the City limits as required. However, the City does not intend to review and approve the processing center location in additional detail.*

**Question 48**

Is the desire for the city to have the traffic center and the customer service center be in the same location?

**Response 48**

*The data processing center and the customer service center do not need to be in the same location. The City requests that vendors propose the most economical location for both uses as part of its submission.*

**Question 49**

Could the violations be paid through the Parking Authority or would that be separate – the violations paid to the city?

**Response 49**

*Violations would be paid through the Parking Authority separately from parking violations.*

**Question 50**

Do you intend to inform us of what these different criteria will be weighted?

**Response 50**

*We do not intend to share the evaluation weighting.*

**Question 51**

Do you anticipate on-site demonstrations or field demonstrations?

**Response 51**

*The City may require field demonstrations where the proposed camera system(s) are currently in operation as part of its final selection process. We will communicate if this is required after reviewing all submitted proposals.*

**Question 52**

Could you elaborate on the check cashing procedure that is referenced in 2.18.6 that's found on Page 20?

**Response 52**

*The City requires that Remote Deposit Capture is used for checking transactions conducted at the Customer Service Center.*

**Question 53**

Will there be a chance for follow-up questions that are not answered, in case they are not answered?

**Response 53**

*Any follow up questions based on the answers provided must be submitted in writing to Amanda Purcell at [Amanda.Broadwater@pittsburghpa.gov](mailto:Amanda.Broadwater@pittsburghpa.gov) by 3:00 PM on Tuesday, December 2<sup>nd</sup> 2014. Responses to follow-up questions will be posted by COB on Friday, December 5<sup>th</sup> 2014.*

**Question 54**

Any limits to the appendices, the things for you to move in the appendices?

**Response 54**

*The proposal shall be limited to 20 - single sided, 8 1/2" x 11" pages. The appendices will **not** be counted toward the page limit; however the appendices should include supporting or supplementary information only.*

**Question 55**

What's the calibration of the timing of the lighting? Are you requiring us to have some control? Are you asking for us to come up with diagnostics to verify it and ultimately you're going to let the camera be responsible for it?

**Response 55**

*The vendor will not be responsible for setting the amber or red phases but verifying that they are in accordance with the PennDOT permit plan by visual check. If a discrepancy is found the vendor must immediately notify the City to take corrective action.*

**Question 56**

Page 15 Section 2.11.18: It says the camera system must monitor the status of the red light via the controller terminals that feed the signal head. You use the word "must." Does that mean that that precludes us from using a wireless system? Do we have to use some sort of wired connection to the traffic controlling or can we use other technologies?

**Response 56**

*The City is open to other technologies that would not require a wired connection to the controller terminals.*