

50  
1-24-2012



URBAN REDEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY  
AWARD JUSTIFICATION FORM

PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

PROJECT NAME: Fourth Avenue Garage

SERVICES REQUESTED: Feasibility Study

CONTRACT DURATION: Approximately 3 months

DATE OF RFP: November 30, 2011

PROPOSAL DUE DATE: December 19, 2011

PROPOSALS REQUESTED: Solicited via URA website, and sent to eight (8) firms who had  
(Number) previously submitted for similar work in East Liberty

PROPOSALS RECEIVED: 7  
(Number)

PROPOSERS SUBMITTING: See attached  
(Name)

PROPOSER SELECTED: Desman Associates

CONTRACTED AMOUNT: \$15,000

CRITERIA FOR SELECTION: Ability to do work, lowest cost, certified MBE

REJECTED PROPOSALS: All other proposals at least \$7,000 higher  
(Reason)

DEPARTMENT/AUTHORITY RECOMMENDING AWARD: Urban Redevelopment Authority

WAS AWARD MADE TO LOWEST QUALIFIED PROPOSER? YES  NO

IF NO, DEPARTMENT AND/OR AUTHORITY MUST PROVIDE EXPLANATION:

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

Fourth Ave. Parking Garage Study  
General Thoughts/Observations  
Sarah Deibler  
Dec. 19, 2011

\*\*General Thoughts: There were no obvious omissions from any of the received packets based on the RFP. The physical presentation was wide-ranging, but had little impact on the quality of the proposal itself (i.e. the best presentation was not necessarily the best on substance).

**WilburSmith Associates:**

- Bottom Line: \$48, 815.00
- Presentation was nice, unified.
- A big plus to the fact that we've worked with them before.

*High*

*Good*

**Walter P Moore:**

- Bottom Line: \$22,500.00
- Very classy presentation
- Experience seems in line, but very little of it is local.
- Curious about their W/MBE qualifications.

*Downside*

*Not local*

**Walker Parking Consultants**

- Bottom Line: \$27, 850.00
- Extensive experience and lots of it local.
- Worked with them before.

*Local*

**Trans Associates/Chance Management**

- Bottom Line: \$49, 872.00
- Trans Assoc. has quite a bit of local experience, Chance is at-least in-state.
- Presentation very clear.

*High*

*Downside*

**URS/ French Engineering**

- Bottom Line: \$60, 319.57
- Provided a nice evaluation of the current parking challenges here.
- Very clear W/MBE qualifications.
- Local, but pricey!

*High*

*Downside*

*Good*

**Level G Associates**

- Bottom Line: \$27, 500.00
- “Meh” presentation.
- Though has experience, none of it is local or even in-state.
- Simply not impressed with overall package.

*New York*

**Desman Associates**

- Bottom Line: \$15,500.00
- Yuck presentation (hand-written disc??)
- Cheapest for a reason...?

*Not local*