

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
PUBLIC PARKING AUTHORITY OF PITTSBURGH
THURSDAY OCTOBER 15, 2015**

Having been duly advertised in accordance with the Sunshine Act No. 84 of 1986, a regular meeting of the Public Parking Authority of Pittsburgh was held on October 15, 2015 at 10:03 a.m. at 232 Boulevard of the Allies, Pittsburgh, PA 15222-1616. The following Board members were present at the start of the meeting: Cathy Qureshi, Jeff Cohen and Matthew Barron. Present from staff were: David Onorato, Anthony Boule, Christopher Speers, Judi DeVito, Jo-Ann Williams, Chris Holt, James Smith, Tracy Sowinski, Tom Vennero, Janet Staab, Kathryn Van Why, Philip Savino, Scott McNaugher and Patricia Konesky. Also present were Jason Wrona of Buchanan Ingersoll, William Stewart of Strategic Communications, Debra Gibson of the City of Pittsburgh and Matt Repasky of Desman Associates.

MINUTES

Ms. Qureshi asked for approval of the minutes from the regular meeting held on September 17, 2015.

Upon motion by Mr. Barron and seconded by Mr. Cohen, the minutes were approved as follows: Mr. Cohen, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Ms. Qureshi, yes.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Ms. Qureshi asked if there were any public comments.

There were no public comments.

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that Authority staff would be using the newly acquired technology during today's meeting and asked for its cooperation and patience. He stated that this is a green initiative that saves on costs of printing board packets and said we hope to expand its use going forward.

Mr. Onorato updated the Board on the on-going repairs at Third Avenue Garage, stating that construction began last month and should continue through 2016.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the repairs at Smithfield/Liberty Garage are complete but there is still on-going plumbing work in the basement. He stated that he anticipates the work to be completed and all spaces returned to use by the end of this year.

Mr. Onorato advised that lot maintenance projects at the Mon Wharf, East Carson Street and Beechview have been completed, with the only work remaining is the LED lighting at the East Carson Street lot. He confirmed that all lots are open for parking at their full capacity.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the closing for Bond Refinancing is to occur on October 28 and the members will be invited to participate in the closing.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Pennsylvania Parking Association held its annual conference in Pittsburgh last month, estimating that about 130 attendees and 25 vendors participated. He advised that the Parking Authority registered about 20 employees who attended the Customer Service and Conflict Resolution sessions. He stated that there was positive feedback on the conference from the attendees who came from outside Pittsburgh.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that there will be a launch ceremony for the Pay-By-Phone service on October 29, 2015 at 1:00 p.m. in Market Square and said they will be receiving a formal invitation to the ceremony. He advised that their board packets contain a sample of the flyers to be circulated to announce the start of pay-by-phone service.

Mr. Onorato stated that he has been in contact with Andrew Masich of the Heinz History Center and will be coordinating the donation of a series of old single-space meters as well as the very first multi-space, pay-by-plate meter that was installed in the City. He advised that CALE has agreed to replace that meter at no-cost, so the actual "first" meter could be removed from service and placed on display at the Center.

Mr. Onorato updated the Board on some of the monthly and quarterly reports included in today's packet. He noted that the Finance Report shows that through September, with 75 percent of the budget year completed, the Authority is right on target with both expenses and revenues at 73 and 75 percent, respectively.

Mr. Onorato said the Facility Report shows that we are on pace to meet or exceed the budget. He noted that there is a significant increase from last year and attributes this to the rate increases that took effect August 2014 and August 2015. He advised that the year-to-date report indicates that revenues are up about 28 percent due to the rate increases.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Enforcement Reports, noting that approximately 22,000 tickets have been issued this September.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Residential Permit Parking Report, noting that the City has been increasing the number of districts resulting in an increase in revenues from the sale of permits and visitors passes. He noted that there were 6,234 permits and 4,297 visitors passes were issued, year-to-date. He reminded the Board that the Authority is in the process of upgrading this process so that customers can apply for and/or renew permits and passes on-line. He advised that the Authority and City Council are working together on this project.

Ms. Qureshi inquired when the last time the cost of a permit was increased.

Mr. Onorato stated that the \$20.00 cost per permit per year and the \$1.00 cost per visitor's pass have remained constant for years and stated these costs are set by City Council.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Gross Street and Lot Revenue Report, noting that street meter and lot collections have increased from last year, with the number of lot leases down due to the loss of 200 corporate leases in the East Liberty lot.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Parking Court Report which indicates that with 75 percent of the budget year completed we are on pace to exceed our budget projections for ticket sourced revenue. He noted that with the new City Co-Op agreement, all of this revenue less expenses will go directly to the City.

Ms. Qureshi asked Mr. Onorato if he had any idea why revenues were down earlier in the year.

Mr. Onorato responded that it is a timing issue, noting that Parking Court issues quarterly notices to ticket holders notifying them of outstanding tickets and boot eligibility. He said he believes this practice may have an impact on payments.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Utilization Report, which shows a snapshot of space utilization at the 2:00 p.m. and 10:00 p.m. timeslots. The report shows that at 2:00 p.m., 10 of the Authority's 13 garages are at 92 percent of capacity, with the three below that level being Shadyside, Smithfield/Liberty and Grant Street Transportation Center. He noted that the lower utilization rate at Smithfield/Liberty was due to construction.

Ms. Qureshi asked for clarification of her understanding of data in the report is that, in comparison of the 2014 and 2015 numbers for the Oliver Garage, usage at 11:00 a.m. is down two percent this year compared to last year.

Mr. Onorato responded that her understanding is correct.

Mr. Onorato updated the Board on the Transient and Net Revenue Graphs and stated that the transient lease revenues have increased from 2014 to 2015. He noted that the next report shows the transactions by number of vehicles, which indicates that we are returning to the same utilization we saw before the rate increase last year.

Ms. Cohen stated that he would like the Authority staff to take a close look at specific places when there is a large discrepancy, such as May 2015 for example, where there was a \$10,000 difference between years.

Mr. Speers responded that his department does look into all discrepancies, noting that this particular instance involved the garages that realized the highest increase. He added that the occupancy report tells the full story.

Mr. Cohen stated that it appears the Authority is very close to peaking-out on garage rates and it is very important that we do not push the boundaries to a point where the bottom line is affected drastically.

Mr. Onorato discussed the quarterly Downtown Housing Report and noted that with more people moving downtown the Authority saw an increase of 54 downtown housing leases over this quarter. He noted that the three most utilized locations for these leases are the Oliver and Mellon Square Garages and Grant Street Transportation Center.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Multi-Space Meter Report, which show the number of meters and spaces in each district and the revenues associated with each. He noted that credit-card transactions account for 83 percent of the revenues and coins account for the remaining 17 percent.

Ms. Qureshi stated that with credit card transactions come credit-card fees and asked if this is looked at as an expense.

Ms. Williams confirmed it is reported as an expense.

Mr. Onorato responded that the Authority pays approximately \$95,000 per month for credit-card fees alone.

Mr. Cohen asked if the Authority met with PNC regarding these cost of the fees, something the Board asked staff to do at a previous meeting.

Mr. Onorato responded that there have been two meetings with PNC since the Boards' request and reported that PNC has agreed to lower its fees. Mr. Onorato said he has asked the bank to further reduce its newly offered rate and we are currently awaiting a response.

Mr. Cohen advised Mr. Onorato to let PNC know that while we are loyal, we do expect them to be fair. He stated that he would like to see their proposed rates before any agreement is reached.

Mr. Onorato discussed the Revenue Per Space Report, which lists gross revenues at an average of \$3,048 per space in 2015 compared to \$2,697 per space last year, with Mellon Square being the number one generator and Second Avenue being the least. He said both rankings are in accord with our rate structure across the system. Mr. Onorato noted that the industry uses the per-space revenue calculations for many of its comparison measures.

Ms. Qureshi inquired about the Minority (MBE/WBE) report, and noted that the \$5-million job that Nathan Contracting is currently completing reflects a strong commitment to minority participation that should be mentioned in a favorable way. She congratulated both Nathan Contracting and the Authority for hiring minority and women-owned businesses. She said she assumes that this report is highlighting only the contracts that have MBE participation and there are perhaps some that do not. She noted that she feels this information would be useful to see and asks that this form be updated going forward to include all of the project contracts, whether or not they have minority participation.

Ms. Qureshi asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

RESOLUTIONS

RESOLUTION NO. 46 OF OCTOBER 2015, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO APPROVE FINAL PAYMENT TO ANDREAS PAINTING CONTRACTORS, INCORPORATED FOR SURFACE PAINTING AT THE SMITHFIELD/LIBERTY PARKING GARAGE, was read by Ms. Qureshi and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority is seeking authorization to release final payment, noting that it will not occur until the punch list is completed to the satisfaction of the Authority and Desman Associates. He noted that the original contract was for \$372,418 and there was a \$32,000 change order of approximately nine percent of the original contract, which was for services outside the original scope of work. He noted that there was 18.3-percent MBE participation on this project with an additional 2.34 percent in payroll compensation for MBE, bringing the total MBE participation to 20.65 percent.

Ms. Qureshi noted that a change order at nine percent is high but recalled that this was for work that the Authority-initiated and was outside the scope of the original project.

Mr. Onorato stated that the Authority does monitor and work to keep change orders lower than nine percent.

Ms. Qureshi asked if there were any questions.

There were none.

Upon motion by Mr. Cohen and seconded by Mr. Barron, Resolution No. 46 of 2015 was approved as follows: Mr. Cohen, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Ms. Qureshi, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 47 OF OCTOBER 2015, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO APPROVE FINAL PAYMENT TO NATHAN CONTRACTING, LP FOR REPAIRS AND PREVENTATIVE MAINTENANCE AT THE SMITHFIELD/LIBERTY PARKING GARAGE, was read by Ms. Qureshi and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised the original contract amount was \$4,893,040.00 with one change order for \$159,715.00, which was approximately three percent of the original amount, bringing the new contract total to \$5,052,755.00. He noted that MBE participation was 12 percent and WBE participation was eight percent and payroll was an additional four percent for a total minority participation of almost 25 percent. Mr. Onorato encouraged the Board members to visit the Smithfield/Liberty garage to see the finished product first-hand.

Upon motion by Mr. Barron and seconded by Mr. Cohen, Resolution No. 47 of 2015 was approved as follows: Mr. Cohen, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Ms. Qureshi, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 48 OF OCTOBER 2015, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO PURCHASE NEW DATA WIRING FROM PREMIER TECHNOLOGY SYSTEMS, INC. (PTS) FOR ALL GARAGE FACILITIES INCLUDING THE ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICE AND PARKING COURT, was read by Ms. Qureshi and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the wiring being replaced is at least 15 years old, and in anticipation of implementing a new phone system in 2016, this would be the initial ground work. He deferred to Mr. Savino to answer any technical questions that the Board may have.

Mr. Savino showed the board actual CAT5A wiring which holds a 100 MB (megabit) to one G (gigabit) transfer speed and CAT6A will give the ability up to 10G. He mentioned that the industry's use CAT5A will be phasing out and the Authority would like to be proactive in installation to be ready for the phone upgrade in early 2016.

Ms. Qureshi asked if this upgrade will affect the pay-by-plate machines and the other garage facilities.

Mr. Savino responded that this upgrade will not affect the pay-by-plate machines, but it will interconnect all of our facilities phone system, internet, voice-over IP and credit-card transactions.

Ms. Qureshi stated that the price in the resolution seemed somewhat specific and asked how we reached that amount.

Mr. Savino stated that we had used the State Contract, and that Co-Stars did all of the bidding at the state level, and received pricing from CDW which contracts to PTS, a company located in Cannonsburg.

Ms. Qureshi asked if there was a specific reason why this was not listed as such in the resolution being presented.

Mr. Onorato stated this was an oversight and the vendor in this instance should have been included in the resolution.

Mr. Cohen inquired if this was a planned upgrade for the Authority that was included in the budget. He again voiced his preference that the Parking Authority, being a City Authority, try to work with companies located within the city whenever possible.

Mr. Onorato responded that this was a planned upgrade and was included in our budget but noted that the Authority is required to follow procurement law when selecting vendors.

Mr. Wrona added that from a procurement perspective, a commodity is a low-price bid, and regardless of where the vendor is located we are required to award to the vendor with the lowest bid. He said the alternative is to issue an RFP and include incentives to accommodate a specific location, but that this process is not generally used in a low-price bid.

Mr. Cohen cited Desman Associates, which is located outside of the city and stated that although we are pleased with their services, asked if there were any architectural engineering firms located in the city that the Authority could use.

Mr. Onorato responded that Desman does have an office within the city and introduced Mr. Repasky from Desman who was present.

Mr. Repasky advised that Desman is a small company with approximately five to 10 people in each office, adding that the Pittsburgh office has one fulltime staff member.

Ms. Qureshi asked if the resolution should be amended to read that “the Executive Director is authorized to award a contract to PTS off of the Co-Stars contract in the amount”.

The Board and Mr. Onorato agreed that the resolution be amended.

Upon motion by Mr. Barron and seconded by Mr. Cohen, Amended Resolution No. 48 of 2015 was approved as follows: Mr. Cohen, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Ms. Qureshi, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 49 OF OCTOBER 2015, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO PURCHASE A NEW CORE NETWORK SWITCH FROM CDWG FOR THE ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICE DATA ROOM, was read by Ms. Qureshi and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato deferred to Mr. Savino for the explanation, noting that he believes that this resolution will also need to be amended to include the vendor’s information.

Mr. Savino advised that Cisco is the manufacturer and the core switch is a central device that traffics data and communication and said the existing one is currently at its end of life after more than 10 years of service. He stated that the POE (power over Ethernet) portion is in preparation of the phone upgrade scheduled to be implemented next year. He also noted that the Authority staff will be installing this switch and it is being purchased from CDW.

Upon motion by Mr. Cohen and seconded by Mr. Barron, Amended Resolution No. 49 of 2015 was approved as follows: Mr. Cohen, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Ms. Qureshi, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 50 OF OCTOBER 2015, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING FREE PARKING FOR TRANSIENT CUSTOMERS ON “BLACK FRIDAY” AND ALL DAY FOR FIVE (5) SATURDAYS PRIOR TO CHRISTMAS AT ALL AUTHORITY-OWNED AND LEASED

GARAGES FOR THE 2015 HOLIDAY SEASON , was read by Ms. Qureshi and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato stated that we are working with the City and the Pittsburgh Downtown Partnership to encourage people to visit, shop and dine downtown during the holiday season by offering free parking in our garages on Black Friday and the five Saturdays before Christmas. He stated that approximately 50,000 transactions last year on those six days resulted in an estimated revenue loss of \$275,000. He stated that the Authority has participated in this program for the past five years.

Ms. Qureshi asked if patrons are still required to pay at the meters.

Mr. Onorato responded that this program applies only to parking in garages and payment would still be required to park at metered spaces. He noted, however, that the resolution being introduced next is for free metered parking on one of those days, Small Business Saturday.

Mr. Barron asked if the Authority has received any feedback from the PDP or business owners to determine if this program actually increases patron volume downtown.

Mr. Onorato responded that Mr. Boule has had conversation with the PDP and stated that they do have a report that shows that there is a significant increase in utilization during this time period. He said the program is well-supported by the downtown businesses.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that the Authority received a letter last year from one downtown business owner, S.W. Randall, thanking the Authority for this program and reporting that it had a positive effect on his business.

Mr. Cohen expressed his concern that with large retailers such as Saks and Macy having closed, this program may not be beneficial in drawing shoppers to the district. He did state that he is glad it extends to the Shadyside and Oakland areas as the many businesses there probably benefit from it.

Upon motion by Mr. Barron and seconded by Mr. Cohen, Resolution No. 50 of 2015 was approved as follows: Mr. Cohen, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Ms. Qureshi, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 51 OF OCTOBER 2015, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING FREE PARKING FOR TRANSIENT CUSTOMERS ON "SMALL BUSINESS SATURDAY" NOVEMBER 28, 2015 AT ALL AUTHORITY-OWNED NEIGHBORHOOD LOTS AND ON-STREET METERS, was read by Ms. Qureshi and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato stated that the Authority has participated in this program, which promotes small business growth by allowing free parking for patrons who shop and dine at local small businesses. He stated that on Saturdays in November last year there were approximately 22,000 transactions amounting to \$39,000. He also noted, that, while the previous resolution approved

free parking in the garages, this resolution would extend to metered parking for this one Saturday only.

Ms. Qureshi asked if the Authority would program the kiosks to notify customers that parking on that one day would be free.

Mr. Onorato stated that the information appeared on the kiosks for the last two years and would again this year.

Mr. Cohen asked if the Authority enforces and issues tickets the day before Christmas.

Mr. Onorato responded that the Authority does enforce meters on Christmas Eve day, as this is not a holiday within the AFSCME contract.. He advised that Christmas Day and the day following it are recognized holidays.

Upon motion by Mr. Barron and seconded by Mr. Cohen, Resolution No. 51 of 2015 was approved as follows: Mr. Cohen, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Ms. Qureshi, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 52 OF OCTOBER 2015, "A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO NEGOTIATE AND ENTER INTO AN ELECTRIC VEHICLE CHARGING SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH BLINK NETWORK, LLC, was read by Ms. Qureshi and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised the Board that Blink received a grant from the PA Department of Energy and Alternative Fuel with incentives to distribute electrical vehicle station chargers. He also advised that the Authority is seeking additional opportunities to install Level II chargers, which charge a vehicle in approximately four hours. He stated that Blink will be responsible for the purchase of the chargers, together with all installation and maintenance costs, and would retain ownership during the length of the contract. He stated that unlike the charging units installed earlier this year in the First Avenue Garage, there would be a use fee of \$.49 per kilowatt hour for members of the car-charging group and .59 cents for non-members. He advised the Board that the Authority will be reimbursed for the cost the electricity provided and receive seven percent of the program's net revenues.

Ms. Qureshi asked if these charging units would take up spaces in the facilities.

Mr. Onorato advised that while we won't lose any spaces, we will dedicate spaces within the garage for electric vehicles only. He advised that the Authority currently has two electric-vehicle charging spaces at First Avenue and four at Grant Street Transportation Center, which are all highly utilized. He advised the Board that a representative from Blink is in town today and will be visiting Authority garages and lots to identify the best locations for the new installations.

Mr. Barron stated that he is aware that the City is looking to switch its fleet vehicles to

electric and asked if it has been in touch with the Authority regarding the placement of charging units in the Authority's Second Avenue lot. He stated that the weight of the DC fast-charging models limits the locations where they can be installed.

Ms. Qureshi stated that she supports moving in this direction but has concern as to the revenue – per-space performance of the locations where they will be installed.

Mr. Speers responded that the Authority has been a part of these meeting.

Upon motion by Mr. Barron and seconded by Mr. Cohen, Resolution No. 52 of 2015 was approved as follows: Mr. Cohen, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Ms. Qureshi, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 53 OF OCTOBER 2015, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING FINAL PAYMENT TO COSTA CONTRACTING, INC. FOR CONCRETE REPAIRS AT THE MON WHARF PARKING FACILITY, was read by Ms. Qureshi and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that the Authority piggy-backed off the City contract for the concrete repair work at the Mon Wharf and said that all of the work has been completed. He stated that approximately 22,000 square feet of concrete was replaced.

Ms. Qureshi asked if the initial contract was approved by the Board.

Mr. Onorato responded that the original contract was not presented to the Board, noting that it was not awarded by an RFP but was piggy-backed off a City contract. He stated that it was an oversight and should have been presented for approval.

Upon motion by Mr. Barron and seconded by Mr. Cohen, Resolution No. 53 of 2015 was approved as follows: Mr. Cohen, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Ms. Qureshi, yes.

RESOLUTION NO. 54 OF OCTOBER 2015, “A RESOLUTION AUTHORIZING THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR TO UTILIZE WINDOW WASHING SERVICES FOR AUTHORITY-OPERATED GARAGES FROM THE COUNTY OF ALLEGHENY CONTRACT WITH IDEAL PROPERTY MAINTENANCE, LLC., was read by Ms. Qureshi and considered by the Board.

Mr. Onorato advised that this resolution is for window-washing services at the Grant Street Transportation Center and said the scope of work will include the beams and steel structures between the elevator and the window.

Ms. Qureshi asked where Ideal Property Maintenance is based.

Mr. Smith responded that this firm is located in Pittsburgh and they do have a City/County contract.

Mr. Barron asked the contract term.

Mr. Onorato responded that this proposal is for one specific job, not on-going services.

Mr. Cohen inquired how long this project will take.

Mr. Smith responded that there are many entities involved and the work will require coordination. He advised that this will require a closure of Liberty Avenue to accommodate a crane boom/operator truck to wash the exterior and said he anticipates a 10-day timeframe for the project.

Mr. Barron asked if this type of cleaning was done in the past at this facility.

Mr. Speers responded that it was performed in 2013 and was completed within a two-week timeframe. He noted that the elevator shafts required the most attention because they retain the most dirt due to the ventilation.

Mr. Cohen asked if the Authority would incur this cost total each time the windows are cleaned.

Mr. Onorato confirmed that we estimate an approximate cost of \$15,000 each time the windows at Grant Street are cleaned and an approximate cost of \$10,000 at First Avenue garage. He noted that the Authority does budget for this service every two years.

Ms. Qureshi asked that the Authority makes sure that all vendors involved are properly insured.

Upon motion by Mr. Barron and seconded by Mr. Cohen, Resolution No. 54 of 2015 was approved as follows: Mr. Cohen, yes; Mr. Barron, yes; Ms. Qureshi, yes.

OLD/NEW BUSINESS

Ms. Qureshi asked if there was any old or new business.

There was none.

Ms. Qureshi stated there would be an Executive Session held directly following this meeting to discuss matters of real estate and Union negotiations.

The next Board meeting is scheduled for Thursday, November 19, 2015 at 10:00 a.m.

Upon motion by Mr. Barron and seconded by Mr. Cohen the meeting was adjourned at 10:58 a.m. with all Board Members in approval.

APPROVED TO CONTENT



Chairman

**ACCEPTED FOR FILING IN THE AUTHORITY'S BOOK OF
MINUTES**



Approval