Table 5

We know "Rent Control" programs already work in major metropolitan cities, like Portland and New York City. How can we get ahead of the curve in Pittsburgh to institute a rent control program as part of our city legislation?

A look at the classified ads in rent-controlled cities reveals that 

\[ \Delta \text{Inflation} \]

2nd \[ \Delta \text{The website for a central location about homeownership} \]

Rent control is part of a system of rent regulation administered by a court or a public authority which limits the changes that can be made in the $2 of
Price ceiling
3) long term affordability more than 5 years, concrete language of how to invest, pushed out of affordability when income has slight income increase.

: Have concrete numbers for how many new units.

3) Rehab of vacant housing stock, infill development

- Social investment in families in need of affordable housing: training, education, educate on homeownership, educate those in public housing.
- Clear outreach about affordable housing opportunities, flexible scheduling.
- Inclusionary Zoning for deep affordability
- Financial literacy education - flexible scheduling, educate people on how to keep their homes - educate on predatory programs.
- "Maximize the impact of resources" by ensuring lasting affordability - not let tax credits expire in 15-30 years.
- Affordable housing should be designed as a stepping stone - need supportive services.
- If a developer does not have good social
Service program + permanent affordable contract can't use public dollars.
- Housing finance workshops. Mortgages for MOMs. Collecting all existing resources + doing community outreach.
- Monitoring that these things are actually happening & report out.
- Community Land Trust: as an option of a tool - everyone can own a home affordably + also not make a profit off the houses.

Questions: Make resources more accessible. How do they work on getting that to the community? Supportive services required by affordable housing developers - have a local support system.

- Diversity of Task Forces / racially?

- What's the point of us coming? What are you going to do w/ this input?


- Hill: Fast changes, huge rise in downtown, fast growth of Oakland.

- Rental housing going up a lot since 2007.

- Benefits from market rate affordable units.

- Speculator purchasers/flippers.

- Foreign investors (mostly Asian), ramped up.

- Demolition.

- Employee of Hill: Long time residents feel like an outsider/not in their home/neighborhood.

Follow Up Questions:

- Door knocking to buy homes as is and then flip their homes to eliminate affordability.

- Programs to protect: deferred loans to assist w/home repairs.

- Seniors offered and mortgages. Can't so they don't own their homes any more. Can't have kids inherit their homes now. Regret it.

- Is there a way to assist seniors w/that understanding it.

- As a homeowner can benefit from housing value increase but don't like the neighborhood changing.
Students coming in, loss of longtime residents - students are transients - lose familiarity have kids around to play w/ kids -

Arsenal 25% mobility rate - shifting between schools - family permanence

Policy to address the problems - requires the market to respond in creative ways/financing. Get solid policies that have developers answer to community.

History of tenant advocacy - public housing opportunity for residents to directly speak to developers, we know what the issues are so had to use get the solutions to developers,

Ambiguous language - don't like

Protect cultural legacy of neighborhoods

Specifically Black resident displacement - acceleration of - racial component

Behind on conversation - so much displacement already happen. Closing down schools or bussing students - don't believe 30% is enough, for affordable housing,

Policies, community outreach, + integration of housing resources - homeownership
Why does the AHTF lack racial diversity? And representation from community based organization doing this work in communities?
Notes

Meeting

New mixed-income housing developments include affordable

Community

During revitalization efforts, how
can we include city homeowners
who are already living in these
neighborhoods? Helped in a

Affordable Housing Task Force Deliberative Community Forums
are facilitated by
City of Pittsburgh Department of City Planning
City of Pittsburgh Office of Community Affairs
with assistance from
The Art of Democracy

The Art of Democracy
Engaging difference as a resource for civic innovation

Affordable Housing Task Force Deliberative Community Forums
Rent Control?

Pittsburgh Human Rights City
Accessible Affordable Housing

East Liberty
Tax credit only 30 years
Lower Hill only 10 years, affordable
Prophecy - might extend tax credits - our world become market
Oak Hill - 30 years
"delays the inevitable" what can we do about it
what can we do without control post cars
transition old housing to new units - displacement
once people (leave) they might not come back

Walking community
Interest in lower Hill - 12,000 res units - what % start at 20%
First 200 units - what % affordable for housing
Create neighborhood with all amenities for all ages

Mixed Income

different sites - studio - number of bedrooms
mix of housing types - ranch type
build for all abilities
age in place

What about people making more but spendly more
maybe not only income-based
meed measurable goals
more safety net policies
stitch together - fill gaps
reverse incentive
preserve + care for existing housing
invest in vacant homes + owned old home
open access to programs + renew accessible
more single bedroom units
new development should all have affordable units near transit & public
lottery for affordable housing - mixed income
affordable needs to include transportation
no eviction - need 18 mo notice
income - not only determinant

what does it take to establish rent control
steps

Our table noted that defining affordability based on income ignores burdens such as health care and student debt, that can so forth people earning over a certain amount can still need housing assistance. How can Pittsburgh define affordability and implement programs such as rent control to meet the needs of everyone who needs housing assistance?
Will the City meet

How will the City address the requirements of the Fair Housing Act to address help repair the damages of racist housing policies of the past and prevent the displacement of Black residents?

In light of decades of racist housing, employment and housing laws and policies, how will the City address the requirements of the Fair Housing Act to affirmatively further fair housing task and prevent displacement of low-income Black residents from their long-time neighborhoods and most critical needs for food, jobs, transit, health care

In light of
Notes from Affordable Housing Task Force
Deborah Pottrell-Parker: "This process is out of control." New housing is being built that's not affordable. Low-income tax credit cost goes up every year. I never hear anyone talk about rent controls. Why isn't there rent control? I want to see rent control presented to elected officials. Policy makes it hard, politically, to address. I'm not sure we need to be connected into. We don't hear about buildings going up until it's too late. I do something about it... I live in Oakland and rents going up so fast. I've been here for 40 years."

Community Benefit Agreements not respected

Once tax credits are gone, landlords

Affordable period for both rent control and others?

Instead of very national norm, should be based on community income

Median Income

Tax credit housing

Development housing. Once you're in housing, rent is based on

Bedroom size and AMI

Rent to own

Rehabilitation of existing structure

Who would rehab?
When you make your recommendations to City Council will you recommend that “affordability” be redefined to meet the needs of Pittsburgh residents, based on Pittsburghs

#3 Affordability

Will you help repair the damages of racist housing policies of the past by redefining affordability according to the Pittsburgh's Area Median Income / Poverty Income more reflective of black residents' incomes in our city to prevent their displacement?

Will you help repair the damages of racist housing policies of the past by redefining affordability according to the income
When you make your policy recommendations will you as
Will you read
AHF #5 - PANELIST QUESTIONS

1. WHERE CAN INFO BE ACQUIRED REGARDING HOME OWNERSHIP?

2. WILL THERE BE A HOUSING TRUST FUND? (INCOME TARGET)

3. WHY AREN'T THERE RESIDENTS ON THE AHF?

4. HOW CAN THE CITY APPROACH RENT CONTROL?

5. HOW IS AFFORDABILITY ACCOUNTED FOR PEOPLE W/O DISPOSABLE INCOME?
   (PEOPLE WHO EARN BACK BUT CAN'T AFFORD $1,000 RENTS)

6. HOW CAN EXISTING RESIDENTS STAY DURING REVITALIZATION OF NEIGHBORHOOD?

7. SENIOR HOUSING, GAP FINANCING FOR PROJECT - WHAT ADDITIONAL SOURCES AVAILABLE?
   (RECOMMENDATIONS BEING TAILORED TO NEIGHBORHOOD?)
   (WHAT MODELS ARE BEING LOOKED AT?)

8. WHY AREN'T GRASS W.OOT GROUPS ON THE TASK FORCE? HOW DOES IT BECOME EASIER TO REHAB MOWSES + ACCESS FUNDS FOR REHAB?

9. QUALITY OF LIFE ISSUES ADDRESSED IN AFFORDABLE HOUSING?
   (HOW IS AFFORDABILITY DEFINED?)
Will there be any policies on rent control and the "affordability factor" for housing in Pgh.
Affordable Housing Task Force

What do you think of the current housing situation? How is the protocol of affordable housing set up? Do you think it is fair and balanced?

- BM Gresson - are you aware of the current housing situation?
- The current situation is not ideal. There is a lack of affordable housing options in the community.
- Many people are forced to move away from the area due to the high rent prices.
- Some homeowners have also been forced to sell their houses due to the financial burden.
- The current housing policies are not sufficient to address the needs of the community.

Goals:
- Affordable housing for all
- Preservation of existing housing
- Increase in the number of affordable housing units

Specific Issues:
- High rent prices
- Lack of affordable housing options
- Homelessness

Barriers to Affordable Housing:
- High cost of living
- Limited access to affordable housing
- Lack of government support

Proposed Solutions:
- Increase funding for affordable housing programs
- Implement rent control measures
- Provide incentives for developers to build affordable housing
- Increase public awareness of the affordable housing crisis

What can we do to improve the situation?
- Advocate for policy changes
- Support local affordable housing initiatives
- Educate the community about the importance of affordable housing
Questions for the Deliberative Community Forum

Deliberative Community Forums seek to "engage difference as a resource." They are an opportunity to learn about and to learn from the lived experience and practical wisdom of people from diverse backgrounds. At this stage, The Affordable Housing Task Force is seeking input from residents about priorities and opportunities for the current and projected future landscape of housing affordability in the City of Pittsburgh.

During the Deliberative Community Forum you will have the chance to discuss the following questions with other residents in small groups:

- What changes and challenges have you experienced in your neighborhood/the city related to housing?
- How well do you think that the housing priorities and values put forward this evening by the Affordable Housing Task Force will address the housing needs of the City and the housing needs of you and your neighbors? What other housing priorities might you add to the list?
- What types of housing initiatives and programs do you think will be most helpful for the City in the coming year? What specific housing needs would you and your neighbors like the City to address in the coming year?

Notes:

- Northside (Chief-Kirkbride) model where residents are supported in efforts to become homeowners.
- Need to provide support to homeowners and areas being revitalized so that they can remain in the neighborhood and not be forced to sell a more.
- Development of a community land trust, community involved in plan.
- Contracts with development that mandate certain lot of units affordable when money from development come from good money.
- owner-occupied
  - housing stabilization and revitalization
  - this is the work of Rebuilding Together organization
    - has focus on seniors, but helps others as well
    - is income-based - could be a program/initiative
  - this is a program suggestion for example of housing

- need policy around developers coming in and moving people out; those that get federal funding

Area - "sleazy landlords,"... need protection for tenants.
Notes: Table 2

Question 1

- Taxes are a big concern. Woman owns house in Hill District - prices going up all around her. Concern for seniors!

* B/c of all the development - taxes are going up. It takes a lot of paperwork - how do seniors manage it?

- One woman has trouble of grandkids in her backyard. Can only obtain a case from city but it's not helping.

- Assessments do two purposes - pricing & eligibility.

- Looking at this as a social problem - this housing issue is along race line.

- How is the city going to communicate efforts to those who are not connected to anything? Long hours? Senior who don't have access?

- Is city addressing racial disparities?

- Crawford - is mixed income, diverse neighborhood but w/ less African Americans.

- New development by Civic Arena. 30% was supposed to be affordable but was it reduced? Is there inclusionary mandates for developers?
Question 2

Goal 1 - on stabilizing communities.

-Feels like a new focus which is positive don't need to start all over.

- Another feels like the city is accommodating affluent newcomers... a retail disparity occurred.
- Lack of retail in Hill District.
- Stability of this neighborhood feels nonexistent.
- Crime is happening in Eastfield.

* Rent stabilization - is that included in the policy recommendations of the Task Force?

Transportation also becomes an issue when people are pushed out.
1. Where do we access to information for all incomes, for programs, and assistance for senior homeowners?

2. Our table discussed
Q2
- They already have their minds made up.
- Why is there a hotel in my neighborhood that I can't afford?

Q3
- It's really technical...
  + We need lots of tools in tool box.
  + Getting people ready to become homeowners.
  + The plan has to be just as quick/Aggressive as developers.
  + Has to
  + We need to have Damage Control as well.
How to give people hope or explain to them that their opinions matter? When what can an average person do when lots of these changes are already in place? What is going to happen to low income people?
Table 9
- Is the Task Force ready to put the findings into actionable projects?
- What gap funding can be provided to developers, and how do we get banks to support more affordable housing?
AFFORDABLE HOUSING, 3/29

Q1. Rum Plaza - Residents eviction - 66 yo
20-30 years of dislocation
This is first year it is being discussed
since 1990 - no one has said anything
adults & children suffer
new people - walnut - are not sitting down w/ residents
what are they going to replace it with?

High 6 - hill - room listening
6 Lib highrises residents
concerns are not new but voices fell on
deaf ears

"we as poor people are always in a
reaction mode"

City officials know many programs but
residents still don't
If we don't want to have a {sincere convo
about race, the convo doesn't change
testified} at many events/walks
but no one listens
"But this is good" we have lost 30K units of housing.
• daughter has a master's and can't live in 3-Lib.
  not a neigh anymore - corporate
  not child-oriented, built for singles
  is seen as a loss of neigh value

  don't know neighbors
  google bringing ppl in from out of state
  to use ppl from city for rebuilding

• Bedford Manor -
  moved to Homestead - priced out
  effects communities of color most
  when blocks are torn down they
  don't build enough to replace
  builders getting few breaks/funding
  but don't consider ppl who had
  this city together

  new ppl in city do not know hard
  times so they vote in a way
  that doesn't consider poor ppl
needs to be preventative measures that comes in from the fed's goes to stadiums, roads, etc. should go to housing.

Q2 GOALS

Needs assessment - we have been assessed to death
- we already know
- waste of tax $ - city just wants to hire friends
- do it in house

Community assessment - ppl on boards aren't have no housing instability
- AFFH doesn't exist in PGH
- ppl have to go out
-)
- Girl moved to Penn Hills can't get anywhere on transit due to moving

We have to change style of living/job 80% of transit depends
"all the city has to do..."

- Stabilize Houses - Sells
- friends have been discriminated against - wants to buy purchased by corporation

- Animal Rescue - why?
  - when people need housing
  - "it's like the city is against common people living here"

- Creating Quality....

- give people neighborhood choice
  - often AFFHH is in an undesirable place.
  - Figure out things that may not be politically feasible

- Figure out things that may not be politically feasible

- Developers - mandate community process on:
  - type of BLDGs
  - green space
  - target rents

- Family oriented
- Google is not invested in the city

"raping us and the city is allowing it to happen since 1993"
Q 3  
Education - ppl don't know till something happens
- booklet/pamphlet in all rental offices
  Rent based on income
  Inclusionary zoning
  is mandatory
  to commercial & residential development
  pays into AFFH trust fund
  must have community control
  Developers always make $?
  should not be hinges on the
  gift of fed $, incentives, etc.

Questions

Are these long term residents sitting on the task force?

Can we require Developers to produce a Community Impact Report?
AFFORDABLE HOUSING, 3/27

- Friendship is highly developing, which is affecting subdivisions.
- Timing is an issue—it will be too late by the time this gets passed.
- We know about Penn Plaza, but even surrounding neighborhoods are experiencing private relocation and shifting boundaries.
- # of units has decreased—scale not meeting demand.
- I couldn't afford my house now if I didn't own it.
- General public don't keep up with all the different housing policies.
TABLE 15

- I grew up in Lamar. Changes I see is that now there are a lot more rentals, which don't build community. This is a tight-knit community.
- Challenge for people to buy homes.
- Challenge in getting people to understand policy.
- Case managers don't follow rules - they hoard bus passes and other benefits.
- It's tough to navigate the system, especially for the working poor.
**TABLE 6**
- Squirrel Hill has an expensive market and has little vacant land.
- Affordable housing only serves 50% AMI - not the most vulnerable people.

**TABLE 7**
- Why do we fight with developers?
- Some communities don't know about zoning and the process to advocate.
- Transparency + accountability.
- What is the process?
- It's not just people who are displaced - it's also businesses.
- Developers need to have more access to information.
TABLE 7

- How do you define community? Lawrenceville has many communities. Which community are you trying to stabilize?

- Developments should not have skywalks

- Too much happens after the fact, very reactive
  - We need to be more proactive and aggressive
  - Comp plan w/ strong implementation needed
  - Need a long-range strategy
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table II</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Redeveloped buildings are unaffordable</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>TRANSLIT</em> near affordable housing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pittsburgh has a housing gap of 21,580 units (according to a report by PA Regional Housing Alliance)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Need a way to get people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACCESSIBLE housing (ADA)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>People being pushed out lack vehicle and get pushed out to the suburbs where there is little transit (Pittsburgh)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QUALITY OF LIFE</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PROPOSED IDEAS

- Changes needed in zoning code

- No more tax abatements, or make them tied to things in return

- Make affordable housing mandatory for new developments

- Inclusionary zoning for large developments

- How do you prove that you deserve the affordable unit?

- Is mixed income the best option?

- It's not just housing - need a sense of community, day care, and social services

- Will this meet the need?
This process is very jargony

- What is the real market?  
  - Need based or potential based?

- Will this actually help, or will it just be a tick off the box?
- Tired of meetings, need action

The language is
- "need" at meetings
- Languages interpreters
- Local facilitators rather than consultants from the neighborhoods
- Childcare
- Disability interpreters
- Food

Need follow-up meeting
QUESTIONS

- How do we leverage new development to be equitable for all people?

- How is affordable defined? (simple and understandable)

- How can low income people be involved in the task force?

- At what percentage is something affordable?

- New affordable housing should be accessible + near groceries + transit + workforce

- How many goals have you accomplished?

- How will you gather input from community members?
Questions

- Will historic preservation be considered?
- Accountability
  Transparency
- Housing assistance + resources
- How do we hold private developers accountable?
- How do we keep community engaged
- Creative financing?
- What will we do to not be San Francisco?
- How do you create neighborhoods of choice? Mixed income?
- Projects that get subsidies shouldn't give back
Questions

• Why are there new units not being built near transit?

• Neighborhoods should be about
  - housing, transit
  - work/house force
  - schools, food

• What role can private citizens have to be informed?

• How do we ensure the "true" market demand for all people has been addressed?

• Will the task force require any zoning code changes?

• Where is the data inventory?

• What is being done to desegregate?
Questions

- Who sits on the Task force?
- Why no residents on the task force?
- Why is RACE not considered?
  How will you address AA's directly.
- East Liberty Transit Center has no
  catk unit
- Workforce Development
- Access to amenities

Jargon
- Why no
  Laureltonville/ship?
- gentrification
  policy mech.
- task force
  viable
- framework
- engagement
- No concrete answers - too
early in process
- needs assessment
• What is the City's plan to bring in middle home owners occupied housing?

• Are there any plans to offer selection of home partnership programs to buy a home, identify reliable sources for remodeling/fixing a home after purchasing.

• Why are other neighborhoods getting investment, for example, East End.
Table 5 questions

1. How can AHTF educate homeowners of resources available to them, but also work with schools or educators to build the community?

2. How can resources be more effective and equitable to reach underserved communities?
Affordable Housing Deliberative Forum

- Affordable housing = Section 8 ruins neighborhoods - people fear, trash, crime.
- Have to have affordable housing + respect neighborhood. Inspectors don't respond.

- People don't take care of their yards.
- Find a way to maintain the neighborhood + have affordable housing without driving people out.

Fairywood

- Projects closed
- Affordable housing would be welcomed
- Plenty of empty houses on the street.
- Call City + they never come, then the houses fall down + it's too late - we're losing housing.
- Taking rates + paying landlords, but slumlords don't fix up houses.
- Constantly call 311, but building inspectors don't come.

Houses fall down + are demoed, catch fire - City would rather tear them down than fix them.
- Empty lots aren't maintained, are overgrown.
- Neighborhoods in the West End are becoming un nice.
- Neighborhoods in the East End are becoming nice.
- People buy the houses Super cheap + then they don't live there + don't care about the property.
- Fairywood had amenities, then a flood and amenities disappeared + raised rents + lost school.

Closed the projects + move the people into the neighborhood - get vouchers.

- Who do you call when someone doesn't respect their houses when they come into a neighborhood with affordable housing.
- Send extra help - inspectors, cleaning, etc. + take responsibility for not destroying the neighborhood.
Missing: Affordable housing for seniors
In Fairway seniors are trying to move out bc taxes, utilities, rent too high
• Screen people in affordable housing - trial basis: 2 yrs.

Slum landlords are the problem.
Section 8 ensures you keep the property clean.
City inspectors are a problem.

Ideal
Selling - 6 story building, scenic, amenities

Politics play a lot in what goes on.
Garbage in street

#3
30% on housing a disincentive? In Public Housing - Section 8.
For sale housing rehab - would work best in Sheraden bc of abandoned. Put folks to work + put houses back on market - that would be best

Afraid 5% someone buying houses + becoming a slumlord.
Housing training programs - responsible owners. Mortgages should reflect
Mixed income housing

Sheraden is still an affordable place to live. How do we get the Task Force to handle people moving out + heading to Sheraden-Fair?

311 is laughable.
* Format
Air grievances first
The discussion began with complaints about the state of the current housing: many vacant, dilapidated, neglected. One participant mentioned that there are 5 vacant houses on her street. Several participants agreed that building inspectors do not do their job. Often they “inspect” houses from the street, never leaving their cars.

There is little sense of community. Renters are often transients who do not become invested in the community. Many landlords and many tenants make no effort to maintain the property, so some occupied but poorly maintained housing also reduces the attractiveness of the neighborhood.

The dispersion of the residents of the former Broadhead Manor project into the neighborhood with no regard to the effect on the existing residents created additional problems.

There are few community resources that would help foster a sense of community. There is no post office or bank branch. A locally owned grocery store, the Sheridan Market, closed because losses, partly due to crime, kept the owner from making a living. It has become impossible for a small business to succeed in the area. There are few places that are safe to walk.

There are few resources for youth to spend time constructively. While some participants cited a lack of parks, another claimed that there is a nice park but the youth do not use it.

There is a lack of street lighting. Recently two lights were installed near a school bus stop, but the rest of the street is dark where students need to walk on winter mornings.

Suggestions for task force process and area improvements:

- Task force members should walk through some of the area, talk with residents, ask questions
- The city should consider a recreation center with organized programming. One participant identified a former school building on Landis Street that could be repurposed.
- There is a need for some program to help people, often but not always employed single mothers, who earn too much for section 8 housing but not enough to afford buying a house.
- Some bars should be closed.

Forum process:

Two participants began the evening by expressing criticism of the process and an opinion that nothing would come of it and it was a waste of time. After a while, one of these participants then became involved in the discussion and contributed a significant portion of the information above, but still declared again at the end that it was a waste of time and did not fill out a survey.

The other participant became agitated when I asked that they not discuss the process but begin the discussion of the questions, and she began to leave. Someone who I think was part of the staff came over, walked away with her and must have convinced her to return. She did then participate to some extent, but I don’t think she filled out a survey. I appreciate the person who came to speak with her, because I could not see how to do so at any length and work with the other participants. I do think I could have handled her initial complaint more gently.

I came away with the impression that this area has been neglected by the city. Some people are very discouraged and cynical about any apparent attempt by the city to listen to them or solicit their opinions as being just for show and not a serious effort to include them.

Sue Broughton
Table 6

What are the mechanisms for ongoing input, feedback & accountability with community members (including advocacy groups & low-income people)?

(i.e., sharing meeting minutes)

Are you willing to email minutes and the final report to people who attended this meeting?
Do you have specific tangible numbers/goals to accompany your general goal?

Are you considering strategic strategies for low-interest affordable loans so folks can remain in their own homes—either to fund rehab, keep up with ↑ taxes/assessments

How to ensure that affordable homes ensure accessibility for disabled residents—handicap accessibility/access to transportation/food
Are you researching strategies to allow existing residents to remain in their communities?
How will you ensure that new affordable housing is accessible both for individuals with disabilities and to access to transit and food?
Do you have strategies for financing affordable and accessible so residents can remain in P6H
Panel Questions

1. Are you content with the growth of Pittsburgh housing? If not, do you expect
   1. what is your vision for the upcoming framework of affordable housing in the context of Pittsburgh’s economic growth?
      - inclusive zoning

2. What do you personally feel about what is the price for affordable housing for Pittsburgh’s 90’s neighborhoods?
   - A monthly average for a 1, 2 bedroom, studio, etc.
   - No more than $3 of your income

   Gaps in financing go to
   - Housing Trust Fund
      Q: Outside the working teams, the TF has put together, what price ranges have been discussed?

   In our table topics around access to good amenities like hospitals, good-paying jobs, schools, good transportation & affordable grocery stores have all come up. The Housing Authority Task Force has affordable in its name, some seen, new done. Affordable prices may vary depending on a variety of factors.
#1. There are existing programs & opportunities for small business owners, residents, & developers, and those at risk for displacement. What is the city doing to educate all of these groups?

#4. Are there policies that focus on how to avoid the displacement of African-Americans (specifically)?
What is process for development
Goals are great - but ultimately what is process to make sure they happen
Need for community voice + accountability
How do these get approved

Added: community process, proactive plan for city, access to information, access to transportation, defining communities - what does stabilize existing communities mean?

What is a community? - Google complex?
Community preempting developers - there are fights, but after the fact
More partnership between city & community
Having a community plan of what we want the city to look like
What is the plan to make this happen?
Find a way to integrate newcomers?
Housing and transportation must be considered together
Look to other cities

Need for low-income mortgage product from banks
Models for city to get people mortgages
Explosion of public housing for more than 30 years
Stipulations on housing URA - takes time to get into property
City needs to pressure developers to incentivize housing
Master plan for the city - should have standard number for the city
Pressure on developers to chip in
Application for tax abatement from developers
Land bank has potential - but what's happening
Section 8 waitlist
Home ownership
Mixed income housing
Different solutions
1. Wilkinsburg - ridiculous. Ghost town. Bloomfield - rent being raised, have to move outside of city. Transportation displaced.

East Liberty - gentrified. Penn Plaza evictions - people forced out of town.

Hill District - had to move out house to East Liberty now rent is raising - nothing better to building. Can't move unless out city.

Looking for housing in triangle - found 3 bedroom, most 2 bedroom are alone what paid be comfortable.

Greenfield - majority homeowners, past 10-15 years change to younger pop. how long can this go on before affordability changes. Could be the next neighborhood.

Bloomfield - rent has gone up, but conditions of house haven't gone down.

Communication is poor - people don't know it's an issue.

2. Too late
   - Wonderful goals
   - Not sufficient - what will happen after this input.
   - Ideally communities should decide these goals.

   Not uncommon to have bad landlords.

   Guarantees of protections.

   When will this happen?

   Geography is important - preserving housing around transit.

   Sure some under contract - what will happen there.
Tiny House in Garfield may inflate the property assessments & thus the taxes

Tax increase caps?

Feeling of urgency - happening fast - need pursue all these things in parallel

Crack down on slum lords, not accepting Section 8 vouchers

Note though that some Section 8 tenants really run the property down & then leave

A HTF - doesn't trust them - too lackadaisical

- People need input before projects so far along
- They're going to recommend legislation - and then what?
  Ready to enforce? Hold accountable?
- Land bank idea established 3 years ago - even
- Never heard results from Transition Teams (Peduto)

Litter & graffiti problems - call 311 - not very responsive, for sure not within the mandated time period
Program "Love a Lot" - rent & take care of it - but how residents afford to do that?

- How do they define "affordable" - which median income figures using? Medians include higher-income populations
- The Housing Goals seem very vogue
- What's your timeframe for having the housing available, & how help people in the meantime?

How improve neighborhoods w/o displacing people?
3/29/16  Table 3 - Discussion Notes (Yoder)

Renovate existing buildings, many of which are very sound & handsome.
Fill in with businesses.
Can we have rent-control? Possibly - community land trust (trust owns the land).
Rent to own
How do you prevent displacement by the URA?
Why not enforcing the existing regulations, e.g. "affordable" new building flips to unaffordable after 10 years?
How many aff. units exist, & needed?
AHTF took two years to get to this point, time is wasting, properties being snatched up. Is it too late, in fact?

Does this include people who have already been forced out of the city?
Include Capacity for new people to move here?

Everything downtown is starting to look like NYC
Not really communities
Displayed penn plaza resident had trouble finding affordable housing outside the city, too.
Tangible numbers

Boom in private dev - how to ensure affordable units

How to capture value from dev - to fund affrod bldgs

Multi-ownership

Low interest affrodable loans - to stay in home for rehab

Accessibility
As you know, Council Woman Rudinak introduced Plain Language Writing Standards for the city. How does the task force plan to establish a simple definition of “affordable housing”, one not based on Annual Median Income or Percentage of Inclusionary and how will the task force include citizens, who have been personally affected by housing insecurity or are currently on a public housing waitlist, in developing that definition? Examples are adding Citizens to Taskforce or a citizen review board (like the one for the police) for the URA.
Table 8 1 of 2

1. Where does affordable housing be dispersed in an equitable way among neighborhood? Transit

2. Has the task force considered citizens adding citizens who have experienced a housing instability or on a wait list?

3. What is considered affordable housing? Benchmarking over time makes 10 year Question

1. Understandable Definition
2. Affordable Housing and Stakeholder Engagement to drive that?

Note: Development of Public Question
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Topic One</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1.</strong> Dilapidated, vacant properties.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2.</strong> Student accelerated transition in Allequippa.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>-</strong> Upside - redevelopment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>-</strong> Downside - affordability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3.</strong> Renters moving into brand new units.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>-</strong> They don't respect existing residents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.</strong> Crime</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>-</strong> City support/subsidy for market/luxury units</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>-</strong> Need direct policy to not incentivize lux units</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5.</strong> Uville - area median income can't afford house, let alone below median</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Topic Two</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1.</strong> Need to benchmark incomes - change over time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2.</strong> Citizen review board for URA/development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3.</strong> Goals are fine - but how?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.</strong> Define affordability</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5.</strong> How does new housing benefit ex-noon owners and tax payers?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6.</strong> What tools/resources exist/needed to rehab existing houses</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Notes:**
- Should be a note taken in addition to facilitator
- Concerns about rising rents  
- Topic Two affects understanding of affordability  
- Need to benchmark incomes - change over time
- Criminology
7. Add a low-income resident/women to AHTF.

**TOPIC THREE**

1. Policy-based, sensitive to income divisions and new development.
2. Inclusionary zoning - but not for whole city - only where needed. Can inclusionary zoning be calibrated to neighborhood markets?
3. What about green space?
1) What is plan to allow people to pick where they live instead of being located in less desirable options

2) How do you preserve mixed income that is attractive to many especially younger people

3) Year long process. What has been done past 10 months!! Why is public just getting involved now!!!
Affordable Housing Task Force MEETING #1

TABLE 1. How can we increase homeownership opportunities in Western Massachusetts?

- Provide workshops and classes on homeownership
- Increase access to affordable housing
- Strengthen ties with voluntary organizations
- Increase home buying incentives

TABLE 2. Who are the educators in homeownership opportunities in Western Massachusetts?

- Teachers
- Real estate agents
- Non-profit organizations
- Local governments

TABLE 3. What is the relationship between homeownership and local businesses?

- Homebuyers spend money in the community
- Homebuyers are more likely to invest in their homes and neighborhoods
- Homebuyers stabilize the local economy

TABLE 4. How does homeownership impact local economies?

- Homeowners have a vested interest in their property
- Homeowners are more likely to invest in their homes and neighborhoods
- Homeowners stabilize the local economy

TABLE 5. How do we educate people about the benefits of homeownership?

- Use workshops and classes
- Provide literature
- Use social media
- Engage with community leaders

TABLE 6. How do we retain homeowners in their neighborhoods?

- Offer incentives for homeowners
- Provide support for homeowners
- Engage with community leaders
- Use workshops and classes

TABLE 7. How can we encourage more people to become homeowners?

- Provide workshops and classes
- Increase access to affordable housing
- Increase home buying incentives
- Engage with community leaders
City of Pittsburgh
Affordable Housing Deliberative Community Forums
6 – 8:30 pm

Monday March 7, 2016
Tuesday March 15, 2016
Wednesday March 23, 2016
Tuesday March 29, 2016
Tuesday April 5, 2016
American Legion, Sheraden
Knoxville Lifespan Resource Center
National Association of Letter Carriers
Kingsley Association
Hill House Association

AGENDA

6:00    Check In/On-Site Registration

6:15    Welcome and Introduction
Ray Gastil, Director of City Planning
Tim Dawson, The Art of Democracy

6:30 – 7:20    Small-Group Discussions

7:25 – 8:15    Resource Panel Plenary Discussion

8:15 – 8:30    Complete Post-Forum Survey
Please return surveys to moderators or sign in desk
Panel Question

What is the role of the CDCs in addressing affordable housing?

Table 5. What is being done to address distribution of low-income residents? What increased the value of section 8, tenant payment subsidies?

Table 7. What is the AHTF doing in terms of new or increased affordable housing units?

Table 8. What mechanisms are in place to ensure that the city is willing to commit funds to affordable housing development?

Table 11. What is the city doing to fight displacement and protect the community?

White washing "minority communities" are the mechanisms for any accountability?

People were upset survey was given @ the end. How can the city force people to fight for funds to affordable housing? Is the city willing to commit funds to affordable housing development?

Table 12. What is the city doing to fight displacement and protect the community?

People were upset survey was given @ the end. How can the city force people to fight for funds to affordable housing?

Table 11. What is the AHTF doing in terms of new or increased affordable housing units?

Table 8. What mechanisms are in place to ensure that the city is willing to commit funds to affordable housing development?

Table 7. What is the AHTF doing in terms of new or increased affordable housing units?

Table 5. What is being done to address distribution of low-income residents? What increased the value of section 8, tenant payment subsidies?

Table 11. What is the city doing to fight displacement and protect the community?

White washing "minority communities" are the mechanisms for any accountability?

People were upset survey was given @ the end. How can the city force people to fight for funds to affordable housing?
City of Pittsburgh
Affordable Housing Deliberative Community Forum
6 – 8:30 pm

Monday March 7, 2016
Tuesday March 15, 2016
Wednesday March 23, 2016
Tuesday March 29, 2016
Tuesday April 5, 2016

American Legion, Sheraden
Knoxville Lifespan Resource Center
National Association of Letter Carriers
Kingsley Association
Hill House Association

AGENDA

6:00  Check In/On-Site Registration

6:15  Welcome and Introduction
Ray Gastil, Director of City Planning
Tim Dawson, The Art of Democracy

6:30 – 7:20  Small Group Discussions

7:25 – 8:15  Resource Panel Plenary Discussion

8:15 – 8:30  Complete Post-Forum Survey
Please return surveys to moderators or sign in desk

Questions are super. What will be the follow up?

Very important. Was there a follow up?

It was mentioned. How do people plan to answer the questions?

Lack of dishonesty and openness to answers. We need to be shifted to our goal.

Translation is still unclear. Language is still unknown.

The answers are very high level.

A very high level.
1. Existing affordable housing should be maintained.
2. Occupied affordable housing should be a priority over new development. Every unit should be treated when lost.
3. If you have no money you're not a player.
4. General city funds should be used for housing development.
5. Generational housing needs.
6. No policy or money.
7. There's a lot of interest in municipal function. Must fund affordable housing.
8. Taxes are being increased, where is the money going?
9. More needs to be more funding in the Section 8.
11. Direct programs are needed to address housing needs.
12. Public dollars should subsidize.
13. How do you stabilize communities?
14. Housing rehab should be done by a non-profit.
15. How do you prevent CDC that owns land but change their values and sell properties for profits.

As properties get developed on the northside residents are pushed from the flats into the hillsides.

Low income residents are being pushed out into the outer suburbs.

There needs to be policies that are helping to keep low income residents in place.

Ex: Fast food workers on northside living in McKees Port.

Transportation reform is as important as housing.

2.50 transportation rate is too high in relation to minimum wage.

Transportation should be a human right.

East Allegheny prices have significantly increase. The flats.

Policies to prevent displacement.

Can there be a 1:3 ratio for new developments (and affordable should be lower than median income).

City funding should be used for new developments that are affordable.

Neighborhood groups are also profit driven.

Co-operative housing owned by non-profits. LIC o- operative ownership economics.

What is the balance between market driven + affordable housing.

Anti-displacement strategy.
#3. How will you address the following 6:
Income, jobs, transportation, education, displaced residents, existing programs to attract residents.
Penn Plaza - E. End - private relocation - to Penn Hills?

- # of housing units under Hsg Auth - falling, scale too low
- Friendship - prices going up, flippers - hideous rehabs
- less diversity
- General econ development - jobs - transportation - educ.
- Construction workers not local, no affirmative action
- Commuting from Penn Hills expensive - sustainability
- No rent control - raised 17% on 1 yr. renewal
- How to keep people in their apt? Moving is costly!
- Renters rights? vs. absentee landlord → Q1
- Google - requirements?
- New fee? $17/unit - more inspection?
- "Handyman specials" - Lawrenceville - substandard

- Opps for training
- School district > 50% turnover yr. - parents moving
- Developers - Pgh can use zoning process to
- Require all development 10-15% affordable
- Incentivize this? Like community benefits agreements
- Property values ↑ when these improvements occur
- & taxes → new assessment in 2020 will be hard
- grandfather residents?

- Who articulates vision for whole city? Based on needs
- then develop support that vision - this is a new concern - EDM
- What happens after task force? - Show up @ hearings

Table 5
2.
- Marketplace vs. #3 - forget it, too late
- Walthamplace -
  - How hold new companies/dev to these?? Bring in -
  - Organic (no respect #2 Oakland Slums) -
  - how hold landlords to this?
- Not happening
  - What is "stabilize"? Same demographic? Diverse?
  - Add "prioritize needs of low income & minority communities"
  - Too general - be more action oriented
  - Accountability - rent control, standards for developers
  - State human rights of Pgh, including housing
  - Common problem - extortion by companies, sports teams

3.
- Educ'd housing rehab program - was done,
- Rent control!
- Zoning requirements for landlords - no slumlords
  - Educ re: renters rights
- Require developers to create a percent affordable
  - Favor buyers to live in homes (reduce flipping or
  - limit transfers to LLC) rent-to-own
  - Long commitment
- What about having developers of affordable housing re-
  - Reg'd to include commercial
- Transparency! Penn Plaza
Questions

* What does city do to protect rights of renters?
  * Esp. raising rents a lot - unsustainable
* Could new companies be req'd to participate in affordable housing and hire locals?
  * How encourage nonprofits & developers to
* Why are the incentives for affordable housing not working? Too time consuming? Too limited
  * Can it be made easier, more accessible
* Renters' rights?
  * Ordinance req 10

Q1: Can't - incentives - too levered

Q2
Why is there not a law or policy of no replacement before displacement?

What are you doing to mandate mixed housing in the City?

Who do we have here and what do we need to do to take care of us? (or, Who do we want to attract?)

How come poor & low-income don't know about the development in the City so they can give input?

Why is there no transparency in housing?

What have you done to bring about these goals? How many have you accomplished?

Questions from Table 9

LYNN
1. Lammer
   - house too dam
   - low income housing
   - homeowners couldn't get $, but now grant
     - plan don't my keep didn't come to frui-
     - lots @ side of house

Cornell Court (second floor)
   - now private property but my won't fix up, and needs cloth
   - can't do anything about it
   - new tenants & being screened
   - some 8 not really care a property

Luxury housing will get built, so why subsidize it / developers

People don't know how to maintain a house
  has support/resources

Slum landlords:
  - need to be cited / held responsible
TABLE 9

Aging stock that are expensive to repair -> hard to build affordable housing

Modular housing (960-704/Ft) is being embraced

Line by line housing & rental

City has got poor people wrong

- spleen being depopulated 60 years/decades
  - At Am. community

- displacement of Am by people mostly white people
  - Racism
  - Google, multi million

- reason

- residents not taking care of communities

My line

- deliberate displacement of poor people in US, via subsidizing people who move into the city; can afford, but ordinary folks have to pay taxes.

- need unified relief, I think, so as I grow in brand.
Some powers are fine, who old disagree
problem it took face her not power.

What it affordable housing? Do me it.

Re: q1. Reg't rent is not affordable
various stipulations that landlords require

[See what add? ]
- co-operative living

- units vs. high-rises
  - scattered site houses

- reusable units

- co-housing program
  - 24 homes owned, built, ...
  - for people who can afford it

mixed housing in neighborhoods

- mixed income

- rent caps

- decent-sized apartments

need jobs for unskilled workers

policy that recognizes housing as a h. right.

city sta. buy homes to root more ppl in.
when displace, get replacement
- no displacement w/o replacement

by in comparable community
- regular
- gated
- suburbs
- sidewalk
- train

zo in neighborhoods that are urban form
human-scaled

policy that does not allow developers to fast-track development
and to build expensive residential buildings like Walnut
Corridor
only permits for mixed income
Questions for the Deliberative Community Forum

Deliberative Community Forums seek to "engage difference as a resource." They are an opportunity to learn about and to learn from the lived experience and practical wisdom of people from diverse backgrounds. At this stage, The Affordable Housing Task Force is seeking input from residents about priorities and opportunities for the current and projected future landscape of housing affordability in the City of Pittsburgh.

During the Deliberative Community Forum you will have the chance to discuss the following questions with other residents in small groups:

- What changes and challenges have you experienced in your neighborhood/the city related to housing?
- How well do you think that the housing priorities and values put forward this evening by the Affordable Housing Task Force will address the housing needs of the City and the housing needs of you and your neighbors? What other housing priorities might you add to the list?
- What types of housing initiatives and programs do you think will be most helpful for the City in the coming year? What specific housing needs would you and your neighbors like the City to address in the coming year?

Notes:

"Expert" panel charged w/ gathering, analyz, synt. Information can't answer questions!

Affordable housing is only an issue because people poor people (disprop. Am) are systematically denied good education, living wages. Task force can make recommendations to Mayor/Council to develop a social economic policy that influences housing opportunities.
Questions for Tim:
- Why does each table not have a note-taker?
- Why does each table not have a member of the task force?
- What can a table do if only party (or their question) is answered?

Elanor's question:
Will a very diverse team truly be able to understand what they need to ask while the facilitator tries to change the dynamics of the meeting?
QUESTIONS & FOR PANEL:

1. How can developers be required to build affordable housing in new developments?

2. How was the task formed and why isn't there more community membership?

3. How is transportation being considered in the housing affordability scenario?

4. How can land banking be beneficial to the city?

5. Are there programs and policies to look at the lifespan of families and housing?

6. How is Pittsburgh's affordable housing definition differ from the federal government?

7. What is the accountability mechanism for the task force to fulfill ensuring housing affordability?

→ MODERATOR
How do you improve a neighborhood while maintaining integrity? Homes + Neighborhood

How does investment become equitable in the city?

PAMPHLET - EAST LIBERTY

What does affordable housing mean?

URA affordable housing is not "authentically" affordable. No rehab bowlers.

Neighborhood groups must lead the development process in order to be equitable.

"Education + Community Empowerment is missing."

How do you get everyone engaged?

Code enforcement = missing goal/priority

Mayor Murphy encouraged community empowerment.

Side lot process is actually working against affordable housing bc of value property.

1. What is the definition of affordable?
2. Transportation cost is not accounted for housing cost.
3. Income decline in workforce - how is wealth being built?
4. Race - South Hill - integration of neighborhoods is missing in many neighborhoods.

Mixed income communities are important to progress.

Built new construction w/o stabilizing the existing residents + homes.

How do we build community in the neighborhood?
LAND TRUST - MISSING PRIORITY - MAINTAIN COMMUNITY 
OWNERSHIP - MOST Powerful tool FOR RESIDENTS 
TAX CREDITS - Complex SYSTEM
  CARRICK GROCERY - IT TAKES 4 YRS FOR IT TO HAPPEN (9% Deal) 
THIS HINDS UP PROGRESS
NOT ENOUGH BIDS OF FUNDING FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING PRODUCTION 
FOR SALE HOUSING REHABILITATION
AFFORDABLE HOUSING FURS W/O GOVERNMENT FUNDING
5 YR COMMITMENT FROM REBUILDING TOGETHER + NEIGHBOURWORKS 
SHARING BUYERS LINED UP FOR
CO-OPERATIVE OWNERSHIP? WHY ISN'T THIS HAPPENING MORE NOW?

IF YOU HAVE SOMETHING NICE, THEN PEOPLE WILL TAKE PRIDE IN IT
STANDARDS ARE THE PROBLEM W/ THE SECTION 8 PROGRAM
INSPECTIONS ARE INSUFFICIENT
NEGATIVE BIAS IS PLACED ON SECTION 8
MANAGEMENT IS VERY IMPORTANT.

QUESTIONS:
1. HOW IS THE CITY BUILDING INCOME TO HELP MAINTAIN HOUSING AFFORDABILITY? "EVERY DAY JOBS, NO TECH JOBS"
2. CAN THE MINIMUM WAGE BE INCREASED?
3. WILL THAT ALCIVATE HOUSING BURDEN.
4. HOW DO YOU RECONCILE THE FEDERAL AFFORDABLE HOUSING DEFINITION TO ADDRESS THE PITTSBURGH NEEDS?
5. HOW CAN HOUSING AND TRANSPORTATION BE CONNECTED?
Comments from DD Neighborhoods
- No unity in South Pittsburgh (in terms of getting organized for what the neighborhood wants), Northside (Mexican War Streets) gets what they want

- Fine line you have to walk to maintain affordability. Friendship may be vulnerable to change

- Pittsburgh household context not appropriate for Pittsburgh household sizes today, need more rental opportunities

- Lack of opportunity for mix of uses
  TABLE 3

- "What is the process" and timeline of a house's life span, this is what we want and this is how we do

- Housing management needs to be taught

- Timing

- Poor jobs @ maximizing resources
  Central Northside $200k of taxes into each house
  6 people are making profit from public funding
  In the loudest voices influence but don't speak for everyone
  OR JANET - Bloomfield

Community Advocacy
Resources are needed in CDCs directly from the city.
Question: Table 1

1) How can the City leverage its power to see that developers, when they are issued permits, be required (or incentivized) to build low-income housing in their developments?

2) How can the people present tonight be assured that the Task Force recommendations will be acted upon?
**Renter - rental fees "chucked up" to external factors**

So, what affect do external factors?

- Lack of housing; dilapidated housing - houses w/ residents not being taken care of
- Broadhead Manor - no longer there - all families displaced
- Lawrenceville grew unaffordable
- Lots of displacement
- History of Pittsburgh - collapse of steel industry
  - Loss of jobs, best new economy brought different jobs
  - Means pushing lower income into Duquesne, McKeesport, etc.
- Stereotypes & stigmas that get attached to low income renters need for mixed income neighborhoods
- People need help when they first move into these mixed areas - support when evicted by section 8 landlord, for example
- Hard to lift yourself up if you have only been surrounded by low income housing
- There are variations in "low-income" - need to recognize differences
- Do we recognize right to proper/affordable housing
- "Brooklynization" of Pittsburgh - need 21,000 units of housing
- Rent by Section 8 has to be working but if you quit or lose job still they can stay in rental not having to work
- Welfare & requires you to be working but section 8 housing does not
  - Using Section 8 as a crutch
- Need guidelines for rental/low income housing
  - For ex. when a higher income individual is renting low income housing
  - As income goes up, people lose benefits
    - Values of AHTF is not what's actually happening
      - City is doing opposite
destroying and not replacing housing for those being displaced
- Insecurity in communities when they wonder if their own communities will be destroyed
electing - electing those who can help advocate

- How are they going to create affordable housing?
  - Want that being reflected in tenants

- In development, what percentage is reserved for affordable units. Is new going market value - losing more housing
  - How to attract developers with community in mind?

- Is there training for current landlords to be developers?
  - Selected landlords might be candidates who could help in more to help create affordable housing
- Thinking about affordable housing beyond rentals
- Thinking about home ownership

- Fear that AHTF is "window dressing"
- Education - home ownership: resources to according to income (brackets) = people could see what's feasible for them and what they need to do to move forward

- is when land prices is always a good thing? how can city find out who wants to stay in their areas and commit to this?

- best, when depressed neighborhoods also get good publicity this can be helpful

- how to involve poor in new bio-income development

- strengths in diversity makes for strong neighborhoods

- is there room for joint efforts between neighborhoods?

- CAT CARL Comm. acquire rehabilitation centers

Question 2 - How can developers be forced to build a certain % of affordable housing? Feasibility study for this idea being incorporated into task force (including housing) zoning variance?
Pre Discussion
Adjacency Laws (you can buy property next door at a reduced rate) – What about across the street. I am invested in that area even though I don’t live there anymore and I moved because the neighborhood is declining.
Landlord Fee (rental permit-$50 per year) – more places leads to a discount. Why??
Enright Park of East Liberty – it is heavily used but possibly going to be developed

Rent from a private owner, whenever rent increases, it is attributed to external issues (increase in cost for trash collection new sewer upgrade...)

Question 1 – What challenges have you accounted
There is less housing. They have become vacant pieces of land, the city does not maintain them. In this area they shut down a project and put in a section 8. Where the city is no longer responsible for cutting the grass, painting the fence and there is nothing you do but administer fines. This is not appropriate recourse. They do not pay the fines, they do not know how to maintain a house. They become eye sores.

I have been displaced twice due to doubling in my rent in two different neighborhoods.

In the history of Pittsburgh, there was a time when everyone had a job that was decently well paying. When the mills shut down Pittsburgh is the 2nd most segregated city in the nation.
Poor wages with UPMC because it is not organized
The working poor is being pushed into neighborhoods with poor housing, poor transportation, not grocery stores.
When the bubble bursts we are going to have wonderful places to squat in... how to we move away from the luxury apartment trend

There is a stereotype that affordable housing deterioration that de-incentivizes its development

When something is handed to you, in combination with low education, low income, low maintenance, leads to this dilapidation. This is why housing should be mixed. So the upper class housing can learn and be educated by those in low-income housing

When I lived in Hazelwood, the worst house was owned by a slumlord and the poor took excellent shape. But that was because they had generations of ownership. It’s the newly housed that have a problem

People in section 8 may also be falling short with food, medical, simple bills

Having a job doesn’t make you exempt from those issues. There are a lot of low-income people who may not recognize themselves that way
If 30% is affordable we must subsidize. Housing is a right. You need shelter.
Landlords justify 80%. The number of affordable units being built is infinitesimal
compared to what is needed.

Tenants in section 8 have to be working or have a disability. BUT, after they work
for a year, they quit and never get a job again to keep them qualified as low income.
They changed this for welfare but not for section 8.

'96 welfare changes was a theoretical positive push but people were forced into the
city for shift jobs without consideration for other topics such as childcare.
Increases in minimum wages can reduce other benefits. You are pushing forward
with one hand and pulling back with the other.

**Question 2 – How will the goals address the needs**

Stabilizing existing communities – I saw on tv someone making 200,000 a year to
live in low income. They paid a higher rent but they were still getting gov. money

AHTF has no power. They only make suggestions. So their values only go so far. We
are destroying and breaking down low income communities all over the place.
Happening right now in East Liberty. 200-300 units doesn't even match the number
destroyed so the AHTF values are great but they aren't meeting demand, they are
going into the opposite direction. I worry that this is window dressing.

Knocking on doors, people are really concerned about their security in their
neighborhood. There is definitely a feeling of impending upheaval or displacement.
We need the people that share our values on our city council and above in
government (city and state)

AH Policy hasn't changed in 50 years so hopefully will include funding and policy
changes

How are you going to create these changes? Charging the landlords won't do it

Somewhere I think it says that developers will be required to build a percentage of
affordable units

Yeah but that requirement only last so many years, that's why there is so much
going on in East Liberty, their 30 years are up. The city could require permits or
slow down profiteering developers.

Maybe we should train current landlords to become these community-based a
developer

Maybe a landlord that has renovated 10 houses successfully could qualify for this
training and support to build 10s or a few hundred units
Bakery square has made 4 boxes that act as their own closed communities that will not feed local business they will shop in Fox Chapel and they are transient they are renters they drain the community despite their wealth

Shifting from renters to owners may also stabilize the market...

**Question 3 - What types of housing programs and initiatives will be most beneficial in the next year?**

I think education is very important. And that in combination in terms of resources for their own search for housing that can help renters transition to owners. They need to be shown the realities of what homes of a certain price looks like and how much you have to work to own and maintain that home.

Increases in housing prices are seen by public officials as a positive but when it doesn't match the income in the area. What needs to be done is when housing starts to rise, the city needs to assess how many people want to stay and see their house or apt as a home. The city is responsible to those residents. They helped build the city. It is their right to stay. But the residents are seen as expendable because we don't need them to support the mills anymore.

Well is it nice to read nice things rather than bad things in the paper... it lifts us all up

Every neighborhood regardless of its income should be responsible to its communities.

Public schools are the great democratizers ...

Solution number one... a roof and structural soundness is all you need but they let them sit until the roof fall in

Barriers to housing – 180 days to find you section 8 accepted housing

Our strength is in our diversity. Strength of the city is in the strength of the neighborhoods. It’s a wonderful thing when people of different races and incomes comes together and all pull in the same direction

Block parties between neighborhoods to build diversity. I live in point breeze, make the house next door to me affordable and the hell with my “liberal” neighbors

So are you willing to move yourself into low-income areas??

In this economy, the gap in income is growing at an increasing
A program called “CARL” (community acquisition rehabilitation loans), “Neighbor works” educate people on home ownership/maintenance

Brainstorm
How do external factors affect housing price?
How do we change policy so that those in section 8 are encouraged to rise out of that living rather than settle?
How do we leverage the city’s power to only issue permits to developers who agree to incorporate low-income housing?
How do we maintain residents who call Pittsburgh their home?
How do we maintain diversity?
How do we fairly increase diversity to create less segregated and better-educated neighborhoods? (Educated in the sense of how to maintain a home)

Things left unresolved
There is a clear contradiction between the sentiment of some, that everyone deserves a home (and one that they actually call "home"), and other who feel that development and movement must happen to increase diversity that will lead to fairness and stability in the market (rich near poor leads to safer better kept homes for all).

Fear about Land Trust
With lack of ownership of the actual land, (1) the resident fails to gain full equity with their ownership, (2) allows land owner to do anything on “the property” of the resident (ie. Billboards, fracking, etc. ...)

has seen transformation of neighborhood

- loss of houses, torn down
- Friendship large houses converted to multi unit or separate unit houses
- the hill delapidated, new housing is expensive but not built to last
  - history of cultural community
  - history of renters - weren't given the opportunity for equity
  - deliberate policies to

housing goals
- Pitts SNAP online - statistics of population
  - housing stock should match income ranges

Sustainability - rent is only portion of living costs requirements

- Don't address - hasn't happened in Knoxville
  - no stabilization, property values have decreased
  - high rate of Section 8 housing
  - taxes went up
  - how does Section 8 housing tax breaks affect neighbor residents
    - when it comes to property taxes?

Region where housing cost is calculated?

- what would you add to the goals policies? for fair housing component
  - raise energy efficient standards
  - investment in community (low income)
what would you add?
- anything that recognizes market mechanism that works w/ market

- incentive to see investment in low income communities

- encourage home ownership - something to work towards

- businesses encouragement

**HOUSING NEEDS – INITIATIVES/PROGRAMS**

- raise the value of vouchers to encourage homeownership.

- tenant protection policy

- home owner association? co-op?

**Location**
- restrictions to homeownership
- registration of rental properties
to contact owners of properties

- educate people on homeownership value, equity

 prioritizing resources
- rental registry
- Safety/Security
- Homelessness
- Bullying & Education
- Resources for people transitioning to housing
- Displacement in public housing
- Homeowner Education
- Nuisance
- Crime
- Reverse gentrification

- Outreach & Homeowner Ed
- Beautification city wide, not just privileged neighborhoods
- Suspension/disposal system

- Pardon program/expungement?
  - People w/ criminal backgrounds
  - Stigma against aff. housing
  - Investment flees aff. housing
  - Redistribution of vacancies that city owns
  - Rehabilitate homes

- What percentage of these high rises/condos going up are low income/affordable?

- Affordable housing for seniors
- Dollar House Project
  - Refinance rehabilitation
Community crowdsourcing to rehabilitate the community.

- could there be city backed loans to rejuvenate housing?
  - trust/crowd fund

- is there a way to apply for your section of the city to get money for rejuvenation?
  - ex-offender
  - educate in particular neighborhoods

- localizing rejuvenation
  - tax rate aside
Topics discussed:
- Broad, socioeconomic
- Don't care about property
- 7-10 day sales at full price
- Interaction w/ URA
- Resources - availability

Potential question: how can resources for housing assistance be made more accessible available?
- Working class, everybody works
- Standardized test doesn't include new learn/standard
- Equality of place to stabilize homes?

Education - housing priority
Equality of life

Concerns:
- Neighborhood is torn down - response: "throw us to garbage"
- Vacant houses
- Lack of education
- Landlords maximize revenue don't maintain
- Lack of response
- Schools need to be aligned
- People are coming to the city expecting more, aren't staying
- Need to be helped...

Utilities relief, costs too high

How to facilitate construct Section 8?

What is unique? What was lost...

What type of housing is right for Shoreditch area?

For-sale housing rehab: "pride in place"

SCOTUS - you have to take a residency: Section 8 Affordable Housing Fair Housing Act (??)

Rent-to-Own Programs: trash clean up/pick up volunteering
Questions:
1. How can we maintain housing stock? Senior, working families.
2. How can we help people to own their homes?
3. How can we inform residents/housing seekers about resources available?
4. What resources are available to help community develop?

| How can we educate homeowners about resources available to them but also work with schools/educators to build the community? |
| How can resources be made effective and equitable to reach underserved communities |

Resource Panel Observations:
1. Localized Taxes - question w/ good response.
2. Landlords held accountable?
3. Bill is ineffective, but works for some.

Resource panel was well-equipped to answer questions.

*people began to leave tables to join friends/allys
Lack good public transportation, doctor stores, post office

City services to help before outlook repair problems

Pittsburgh Community Reinvestment Group, PCRC, Sheriden
if you don't know the neighborhood, you can't help the neighborhood

Question 3

- Purchase renovation
- Provide a reasonable way for people to update houses
- Provide resources, references
- Neighborhoods will not be able to rebuild if more Section 8
- Address neighborhood lines
- Responsible landlords / more accountability

Register in City is not optional

#311

- Dr. Cenning, UDC, Planning, Developer, Mira Money
- Rachel Falkenstein, PFA, Housing, Single-Family Home, Honduras
- Dale Schwartz, Housing, Alliances, Funding, Nonprofits
- Priestley, Neighborhood Allies, Technical Resources
  Talent and Leadership
- heightwork
  USA
- homehub.com
- land bank
- point of sale ordinances
- police or put in place to help purchase blighted homes
- rental rehab programs
Ray Sastel, Austin City Planning

Question 1
- Closed Broadhead/West Gate
  - No phills to operate homes
  - no services, Bank, Post Office
  - older residents
  - what is city of Pittsburgh to do

Need Transparency

We have Program

What does affordable housing mean? Home Ownership

Landlords absent

Loans - 37% down/no cash out plus lower to fix

We 3.75 interest 5% 6.7%

Question 2

How do own occupied homes

Need education about what/who each group do

HUD II what programs are out there

Need workshops II reliable people

Looking more at lower II need more middle income

Other priorities should be support for owner occupied homes

Need gated areas to protect senior citizens