



Division of Development Administration and Review
 City of Pittsburgh, Department of City Planning
 200 Ross Street, Third Floor
 Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Minutes of the Meeting of December 4, 2013
 Beginning at 12:30 PM
 200 Ross Street
 First Floor Hearing Room
 Pittsburgh, PA 15219

In Attendance:

<i>Members</i>	<i>Staff</i>	<i>Others</i>	
Linda McClellan	Sarah Quinn	Michael Kratsas	David Head
Joe Serrao	Sharon Spooner	Lara Bentz	Michael Mitcham
Noor Ismail		Jerome Williams	Matt Brind'Amour
Ernie Hogan		John DeMauro	Will Hardison
		Keith Cochran	Daryl Saunders
		David Kent	Tony Ceoffe
		Cliff Levine	Kristin Kipke
		Evelyn Jones	Adam DeSimone

Old Business—None.

New Business

Approval of Minutes: In regards to the October 2013 minutes, Mr. Serrao motions to approve and Ms. McClellan seconds; all are in favor and motion carries. In regards to the November 2013 minutes, Mr. Serrao motions to approve and Ms. McClellan seconds; all are in favor and motion carries.

Certificates of Appropriateness: In regards to the November 2013 Certificates of Appropriateness, Mr. Serrao motions to approve and Ms. Ismail seconds; all are in favor and motion carries.

Other:

- Ms. Quinn states that the nomination process for the Hunt Armory is finishing up, and another nomination was received recently for the Naser Tavern in Lawrenceville. She mentions that two contracts have been submitted to the law office. She also talks about historic nomination for the city steps; she spoke with Councilman Kraus about it, who advised that the nomination wait until the new administration comes in. She says that one of the benefits of the nomination is that the HRC public notification process will be in effect, which is much more thorough than any notification process available to Public Works.

Adjourn:

Mr. Serrao motions to adjourn.

Ms. McClellan seconds.

Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and meeting is adjourned.

The discussion of the agenda items follows.

12 Bedford Square

East Carson Street Historic District

Owner:

John Demauro
1707 E. Carson Street
Pittsburgh, Pa 15203

Ward: 17th

Lot and Block: 3-H-188

Inspector: Brian Ralston

Applicant:

Matt Brind'Amour
1273 Washington Pike
Bridgeville, Pa 15017

Council District: 3rd

Application Received: 10/18/13

National Register Status: Listed: Eligible:

Proposed Changes: Demolition and new construction.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Matt Brind'Amour steps to the podium; he is the designer for the project. He states that this is the third time they have presented this project. They started off just seeking a demolition, then came back with a residential design to replace the existing home, and now are presenting more of a commercial design per the advice of the Commission. They also met with the Southside Planning Forum this month, and have received a letter of support with some minor recommendations. He shows photos of the existing building that they are looking to demolish, explaining that it is a deteriorating house which has lost its original façade and has been condemned. They are proposing a new building for the site which will be an addition to The Urban Tap, which is a restaurant that fronts on East Carson Street. The structure will have a portion with a two-story roof to give the look of a higher storefront; this portion will hold the enclosed seating area. Another portion of the addition will provide a means of egress from the main building and also a space for Dumpsters. They are planning on an all brick façade, at least in the portion at 12 Bedford Square, and a pre-cast or wood signage cornice, and, at the recommendations of the Planning Forum, a cast stone product for the water table. They had thought about using a NanaWall system, but again at the recommendation of the Planning Forum they are now looking at operable casement windows along the front of the addition. For the rear of the building, which faces a city parking lot, they were considering using a stucco veneer, although they are open to other options. He states they also received a letter of support from the Chamber of Commerce.
 2. Mr. Serrao asks about the Dumpster area.
 3. Mr. Brind'Amour says it will be set back about 18 to 20 feet.
 4. Mr. Hogan asks about the one-story portion of the building that is screening the parking lot.
 5. Mr. Brind'Amour says it contains additional enclosed seating; the rear of the
-
-

addition contains outdoor seating and restrooms.

6. Mr. Hogan asks if the Dumpster area could be serviced from the rear.
7. Mr. Brind'Amour says no; the parking lot sits down about three feet and is a private parking lot and not a public right-of-way.
8. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment; there is none.

Motion:

9. Mr. Serrao motions to approve the demolition and new construction to comply with the general design drawings submitted, with final material selections for the masonry, windows, operable storefront system, doors and any other exterior finishes to be presented to staff for final approval.
 10. Ms. Ismail seconds.
 11. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

1811 E. Carson Street

East Carson Street Historic District

Owner:

46 + 2, Inc.
1811 E. Carson Street
Pittsburgh, Pa 15203

Ward: 17th

Lot and Block: 12-E-326

Inspector: Brian Ralston

Applicant:

Matt Brind'Amour
1273 Washington Pike
Bridgeville, Pa 15017

Council District: 3rd

Application Received: 10/18/13

National Register Status: **Listed:** **X** **Eligible:**

Proposed Changes: Storefront renovations and window replacement.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Matt Brind'Amour steps to the podium; he is the designer for the storefront renovation. He states that they have revised their plan a bit based on the recommendations of the South Side Planning Forum. They are proposing to remove the non-original green ceramic tile from the façade, and on the two outside edges of the façade they will be restoring the original brick. In the storefront area they are proposing steel plates painted black for the two center vertical uprights and the cross band. The water table area will be replaced with natural stone. The existing purple storefront will be replaced with an operable system with steel casement windows. They will use wood for the sign board with steel letters for the signage, and will install new goose neck lamps.
 2. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment; there is none.
-
-

Motion:

3. Mr. Serrao motions to approve the storefront renovation and window replacement as submitted in the drawings presented to the Commission.
 4. Ms. Ismail seconds.
 5. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

74 S. 18th Street

East Carson Street Historic District

Owner:

Will Hardison
74 S. 18th Street
Pittsburgh, Pa 15203

Ward: 17th

Lot and Block: 12-E-318

Inspector: Brian Ralston

Applicant:

Integrity
290 Park Road
Valencia, Pa 16059

Council District: 3rd

Application Received: 11/18/13

National Register Status: Listed: Eligible:

Proposed Changes: After-the-fact roof deck.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Will Hardison steps to the podium; he is the owner of the property. He states that he was before the Commission in October presenting the after-the-fact roof deck. He shows pictures of their new proposal and states that they have taken the Commission's suggestion and decided to raise the parapet wall, maintaining the same look and color. He explains that they have already removed the 6x6 posts that were visible above the parapet, and that when they are done the house will be 24 inches higher on one side and 40 inches higher on the other from the raised parapet.
 2. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment; there is none.
-
-

Motion:

3. Mr. Serrao motions to approve the after-the-fact roof deck modifications and wall renovation as submitted in the latest drawings.
 4. Ms. Ismail seconds.
 5. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

**810 Rockland Avenue
Beechwood Elementary**

Individual Landmark

Owner:

Pittsburgh Public Schools
1305 Muriel Street
Pittsburgh, Pa 15203

Ward: 19th

Lot and Block: 16-R-156

Inspector: Brian Ralston

Applicant:

HHSDR Architects
130 7th Street, Suite 201
Pittsburgh, Pa 15222

Council District: 4th

Application Received: 11/15/13

National Register Status: Listed: X Eligible:

Proposed Changes: Elevator addition.

Discussion:

1. Mr. David Kent and Mr. Andreas Domepakis with HHSDR Architects step to the podium. The applicants explain that they are not pursuing the corridor addition of their project at this time. Mr. Kent introduces the project, stating that the site is challenging in that it is terraced and each entrance is on a different elevation. He shows the accessible entrance but states that since there is no elevator currently, the ground floor is the only one that is accessible; the purpose of this project is to make the entire building accessible for students. He also shows a retaining wall that is cracked and will be rebuilt, and they will be adding a sidewalk and set of steps in that area for students as well.
 2. Mr. Domepakis states that this solution will maintain access around the building for fire and safety, which was a problem with the corridor addition. He talks about the solutions they came up with for the loading dock and truck access.
 3. Mr. Kent talks about the elevator addition, stating that they will try and match it closely to the existing building with the brick, stone, and windows. He states that the windows and doors were replaced relatively recently with double-hung aluminum windows and FRP doors which they will match.
 4. Mr. Domepakis mentions that they will be adding a decorative metal railing to the retaining wall as well.
 5. Mr. Serrao asks if they are using spandrel glass for the windows in the addition.
 6. Mr. Kent says they will be actual windows as they will be in the lobby of the elevator.
 7. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment; there is none.
-
-

Motion:

8. Mr. Serrao motions to approve the elevator addition and exterior renovations as submitted, with the modification that the corridor addition has been removed from the application. Final materials are to be submitted to staff for approval.
 9. Ms. Ismail seconds.
 10. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

1906 Chateau Street

Manchester Historic District

Owner:

Tama Fike Kean
1980 Stuart Avenue
Espyville, Pa 16424

Ward: 21st

Lot and Block: 22-E-276

Inspector: Jim Seskey

Applicant:

Marcus Fike
1906 Chateau Street
Pittsburgh, Pa 15233

Council District: 6th

Application Received: 9/16/13

National Register Status: Listed: Eligible:

Proposed Changes: After-the-fact enclosure of front porch.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Hogan explains that this is an after-the-fact installation that has been there for many years.
-
-

Motion:

2. Mr. Hogan states that he would like to entertain a motion to accept the property, based on the fact that the porch was there prior to the district.
 3. Mr. Serrao motions to accept the after-the-fact enclosure of the front porch and to waive the historic review requirement, based on the extended length of time and the possibility that the work was done prior to creation of the historic district.
 4. Ms. Ismail seconds.
 5. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

2 S. Market Place

Market Square Historic District

Owner:

N & P Properties
204 5th Avenue, Suite 404
Pittsburgh, Pa 15222

Ward: 1st

Lot and Block: 1-H-223

Inspector: Bob Molyneaux

Applicant:

Primanti Brothers
79 s. 23rd Street
Pittsburgh, Pa 15203

Council District: 6th

Application Received: 11/15/13

National Register Status: Listed: X Eligible:

Proposed Changes: Construction of a steel-framed canopy for outdoor seating.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Cliff Levine steps to the podium; he introduces Mike Kratsas, the director of development for Primanti's, and Doug Sipp, the architect for the project. He states that they are proposing a canopy for the Market Square Primanti's.
 2. Mr. Kratsas steps to the podium. He shows photos of the existing building, stating that it has been preserved and renovated, but they feel that it could be more historically accurate. He states that the goal is to put the retail back on the first floor and make it less sterile, and also to add a canopy over the café area. He states that the updates to Market Square have been great for business and they would like to add to it. He shows historic photos of the building and explains that it was originally two buildings that were consolidated into one. For the renovation of the first floor, they just punched openings that correspond to the windows on the upper floors. What they want to do is open up those windows, removing the piers in between so that they will have three retail openings on the first floor. The windows will be wooden, will wood paneling at the base of the storefront. He gives some context for the proposed canopy, stating that Market Square used to be more mercantile in the past, and the some vendors did have similar canopies for their retail storefronts. He shows a historic photo of one such canopy. He states that it will be a structural steel element, and the design will complement the building which is Federalist period. He says that the canopy will extend the use of the space compared to the retractable awning that they currently use. He also shows a different awning project in Market Square which he says has been very successful.
 3. Mr. Doug Sipp steps to the podium. He explains that they are looking to complement the building with the new canopy. He says they have some design elements to work with in the upper floors, including the simple cast-iron hoods over the double-hung windows, but that nothing is left of the original first-floor façade. He states again that the building was once two buildings, and says that the canopy will cover only part of the front façade. He says that in addition to the existing architectural details on the building, they are also looking to other turn-of-
-
-

the-last-century steel designs for inspiration. He says they tried to keep it as simple as possible, with the canopy to have a steel frame and steel roof, and the façade to have operable wooden windows. He talks a bit more about the detailing on the canopy.

4. Mr. Serrao comments that the canopy will cross the point where the two buildings were joined, but it doesn't go all the way across.
5. Mr. Hogan says that does seem awkward, and he feels that they might want to cover the whole façade, or shrink the canopy a bit.
6. Mr. Sipp says the uncovered part is the entrance to the apartments above, and they were trying to keep it separate. He says they are not opposed to extending the canopy.
7. Mr. Hogan asks if they are planning on doing any improvements to the apartment entrance area.
8. Mr. Sipp says the only thing they may do is replace the door.
9. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment; there is none.
10. The Commission discusses that they will need to maintain the proportions of the bays when they extend the canopy across the whole façade.

Motion:

11. Mr. Serrao motions to approve the construction of a steel-framed canopy for outdoor seating as submitted, with the amendment that final elevation drawings and final material selections be submitted to staff for approval.
 12. Mr. Hogan asks to amend the motion to include the condition that the canopy extends the full length of the building.
 13. Mr. Serrao amends the motion.
 14. Ms. McClellan seconds.
 15. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

1244 Resaca Place

Mexican War Streets Historic District

Owner:

Charles Yanders
100 E. Jefferson Street
Pittsburgh, Pa 15212

Ward: 22nd

Lot and Block: 23-K-72

Inspector: Jim Seskey

Applicant:

Windows R Us LLC
1116 Castle Shannon Boulevard
Pittsburgh, Pa 15234

Council District: 6th

Application Received: 11/15/13

National Register Status: **Listed:** **X** **Eligible:**

Proposed Changes: Window replacement with vinyl.

Discussion:

1. Mr. John McClure with Windows R Us steps to the podium. He states that they are looking for approval to replace seven windows on the side and rear of this property. He says some of the windows have already been replaced with vinyl. They will not be replacing any on the front of the building.
 2. Mr. Hogan asks if there is a walkway on the side of the building.
 3. Mr. McClure says there is an iron gate and a walkway on the side.
 4. Mr. Hogan asks if they are replacing any windows on the side bay of the house.
 5. Mr. McClure says no. There are some windows on the bay that have already been replaced.
 6. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment; there is none.
-
-

Motion:

7. Mr. Serrao motions to approve the window replacement for the rear and rear side of the building; no windows facing Resaca Place shall be replaced.
 8. Ms. McClellan seconds.
 9. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

960 Penn Avenue

Penn-Liberty Historic District

Owner:
GTMAC
960 Penn Avenue
Pittsburgh, Pa 15222

Ward: 2nd

Lot and Block: 9-N-122

Inspector: Bob Molyneaux

Applicant:
960 Penn LLC
1511 E. Carson Street
Pittsburgh, Pa 15203

Council District: 6th

Application Received: 11/13/13

National Register Status: Listed: X Eligible:

Proposed Changes: Signage.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Adam DeSimone steps to the podium; he is one of the principals of the AMP Group. He states that they were before the Commission previously for operable windows for the new restaurant in this space called Tenpenny. He states that they are partnering with a 3D metal printing company to print a nail for part of their sign installation. He shows historic photos of the building showing the signage of the building's former occupants. They are proposing a projecting sign for the corner of the building which will have two faces and the nail in between. The faces of the sign will be constructed of wooden planks, with letters made of galvanized steel painted black with LED lights behind to provide halo lighting.
 2. Ms. Quinn asks if they know how much the nail will weigh.
 3. Mr. DeSimone says it won't weigh very much; it might be around a hundred pounds or less. It will be very hollow due to the way it is printed.
 4. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment; there is none.
-
-

Motion:

5. Mr. Serrao motions to approve the signage as submitted.
 6. Ms. McClellan seconds.
 7. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

1401 Columbus Avenue

Manchester Historic District

Owner:

Manchester Housing Development
1319 Allegheny Avenue
Pittsburgh, Pa 15233

Ward: 21st

Lot and Block: 22-K-17

Inspector: Jim Seskey

Applicant:

Alliance Construction Group
1300 Brighton Road
Pittsburgh, Pa 15233

Council District: 6th

Application Received: 11/12/13

National Register Status: **Listed:** **X** **Eligible:**

Proposed Changes: Demolition of rear garage.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Bob Baumbach steps to the podium; he is the architect working with Manchester Citizens Corp on this project which is a restoration of a mixed-use corner building. The garage in question sits at the back of the site. He states that the mixed-use project will have retail on the first floor with apartments above, and they will need to provide some off-street parking. The preference for the parking is to have it back onto an alley rather than onto a main street, and this building would be in the way. He states that given the condition and non-optimal location, they would like to request to take it down.
 2. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment; there is none.
-
-

Motion:

3. Mr. Serrao motions to approve the demolition of the rear garage as submitted.
 4. Ms. McClellan seconds.
 5. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

**4025-29 Butler Street
Naser's Tavern**

Nomination for Historic Designation

Owner:

Lawrenceville Holdings III LP
4023 Butler Street
Pittsburgh, Pa 15201

Ward: 9th

Lot and Block: 49-F-9

Inspector: Mark Sanders

Nominator:

Lawrenceville Stakeholders Inc.
PO Box 40151
Pittsburgh, Pa 15201

Council District: 7th

Application Received: 11/20/13

National Register Status: **Listed:** **Eligible:**

Proposed Changes: Nomination for historic designation.

Discussion:

1. Ms. Quinn makes a short presentation about the building, describing its architecture and history. She states that the criteria for historic designation that she found the building meets are not necessarily the same as in the nomination. The first criterion is #3, as it was influenced by the Greek Revival style and was constructed to the smaller scale that was common in pre-Civil War business districts. The second criterion it meets is #7, as the hotel and tavern supported the development of the neighborhood and also supported commerce and transportation in the neighborhood and city. The next criterion it meets is #8, as the building was in the original plan of the town of Lawrenceville, which grew up around the Allegheny Arsenal. The final criterion it meets is #10, as the building retains its location and historic appearance and has been a significant component of the streetscape for 165 to 180 years. The building has also retained integrity of location and design. It occupies its original site and is still in the heart of the business district. The 20th century façade renovations used similar materials that complement the original design and historic additions. The building is still recognizable as a circa 1840 commercial property. She states that the nomination was well-written, and her recommendation is that the Commission provides a positive determination that the nomination potentially has merit.
 2. Mr. Hogan explains that the Commission is trying to determine today if the nomination meets at least one of the criteria for historic designation, so that it can move forward to a public hearing before the Commission makes its final recommendation. He says if they make a preliminary determination today, protection of the building starts immediately. He says he would like to understand more about the Naser family and their role in the community, and asks the nominator to step forward.
 3. Ms. Carol Peterson steps to the podium; she is a member of the nominating group, Lawrenceville Stakeholders, and is also an architectural historian. She talks about
-
-

the history of John Naser, the owner, and his family members who owned other properties in the neighborhood. She speaks about the importance of the tavern and hotel to the development of the business district and Arsenal area. She says that the small, squat form of the building is also very important, especially in contrast to the later, larger buildings around it; these buildings are generally the oldest in the city and deserve protection.

4. Mr. Hogan asks the owner of the building to step forward.
5. Mr. Mitch Zemel who is the attorney representing the owner, Mr. John Burgle with Lawrenceville Holdings, and Mr. Chris Lassey who is an architect and former board member of Preservation Pittsburgh, all step to the podium. Mr. Zemel states that they don't necessarily object to the historic designation, but he is concerned that the owner was only notified by voicemail the night before the nomination was submitted. He also expresses concern that the building is being looked at as one property, which they feel it is not. They don't have any intentions of altering the front façade, but they were looking at altering the back portions, which they feel should be considered separately.
6. Mr. Hogan says today they are only determining if the nomination has merit, and they should bring all of these concerns to the next meeting.

Motion:

7. Mr. Serrao motions to accept the nomination for historic designation on the grounds of criterion #3.
 8. Ms. McClellan seconds.
 9. Mr. Hogan agrees, and says that they need to do more research on the significance of the Naser family. He also feels that criterion #8 has relevance, as a lot of this pre-Civil War fabric has been lost throughout the city.
 10. Mr. Serrao amends his motion.
 11. Ms. McClellan seconds again.
 12. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

Certificates of Appropriateness Report - December 2013

Staff Approval	C of A Number	Date Issued	Application Address	Historic District	Work Approved
Y	13-158	2-Dec-13	1230 Monterey Street	Mexican War Streets	Alteration
Y	13-159	5-Dec-13	74 S 18th Street	East Carson Street	Addition/New Construction
N	13-160	5-Dec-13	1811 E Carson Street	East Carson Street	Alteration
N	13-161	5-Dec-13	810 Rockland Avenue	Individual	Addition/New Construction
N	13-162	5-Dec-13	1244 Resaca Place	Mexican War Streets	Alteration
N	13-163	5-Dec-13	960 Penn Avenue	Penn-Liberty	Sign
N	13-164	5-Dec-13	1401 Columbus Avenue	Manchester	Demolition
N	13-165	18-Dec-13	1201 Palo Alto Street	Mexican War Streets	Alteration
Y	13-166	2-Dec-13	1230 Monterey Street	Mexican War Streets	Alteration