



Division of Development Administration and Review
City of Pittsburgh, Department of City Planning
200 Ross Street, Third Floor
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Minutes of the Meeting of June 4, 2014
Beginning at 12:30 PM
200 Ross Street
First Floor Hearing Room
Pittsburgh, PA 15219

In Attendance:

<i>Members</i>	<i>Staff</i>	<i>Others</i>	
Linda McClellan	Sarah Quinn	Mark Fatla	Paul Schmitt
Joe Serrao	Sharon Spooner	Patrick Ecker	Jonathan Huck
Ray Gastil		Ronald Zarotney	Nick Kyriazi
Ernie Hogan		Rick Criscella	Jim McMullan
Erik Harless		Evelyn Jones	Doug Sipp
Maura Kennedy		Russell Blaich	Peter Landis

Old Business—None.

New Business

Approval of Minutes: In regards to the May 2014 minutes, Ms. McClellan motions to approve and Mr. Serrao seconds. Mr. Serrao asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.

Certificates of Appropriateness: In regards to the May Certificates of Appropriateness, Ms. McClellan motions to approve and Mr. Gastil seconds; all are in favor and motion carries.

Other:

1. Ms. Quinn states the she just received a letter from PHMC awarding a partial grant. She also talks about the current grant projects, stating that Michael Baker has been hired for the architectural inventory and Donovan Rypkema is going to work on the economic study. She also mentions the preservation conference, where she will be making a presentation with Councilman Lavelle.
2. Mr. Serrao wants to talk about the issues with previously approved roof decks. He states that he took a walking tour of the South Side, and he knows there are decks that were not built as approved. He says that Mr. Hogan is aware of the problem as well. He says that they did set a precedent with their approvals, and they have to find a way to reel these decks back in and be consistent so **they won't be looked at as examples by other applicants looking to build decks.**
3. Ms. Quinn says if he would email her the addresses, she will pull the files so they can look at what was approved.

Adjourn:

Mr. Serrao adjourns the meeting.

The discussion of the agenda items follows.

408 Cedar Avenue

Deushtown Historic District

Owner:
Griffy LLC
408 Cedar Avenue
Pittsburgh, Pa 15212

Ward: 23rd
Lot and Block: 8-D-147

Inspector: Todd Irwin

Applicant:
Jonathan Huck
Four Allegheny Center, Ste 601
Pittsburgh, Pa 15212

Council District: 6th

Application Received: 5/15/14

National Register Status: Listed: X Eligible:

Proposed Changes: Façade renovations including ADA ramp.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Mark Fatla steps to the podium; he is the executive director of the Northside Leadership Conference, who is managing the project. He also introduces their real estate director, Jon Huck, and their real estate intern, Patrick Ecker. Nick Kyriazi from the East Allegheny Community Council is also present. He states that this historic house was used for many years as a funeral home, so it has not been altered very much, and it is now being adapted for use as a law office. The main things they are looking to do include repairing and restoring the existing moldings, replacing the existing aluminum storm windows with new enameled aluminum ones, and replacing the light fixtures with more period-appropriate ones. They also included in the application the possibility of constructing an ADA ramp; however, it turns out that one is not required, so they will just be replacing the railing on the existing ramp. They have not made a final decision on the paint color; houses of this style would have had sashes painted a darker color with the trim around it being lighter, but they could also paint them the same color in order to not call attention to the storm windows. They are open to suggestion on this issue. He says there is an existing signboard that they are retaining, but they are not asking for any signage at this time.
 2. Mr. Gastil asks about the existing windows.
 3. Mr. Fatla says there are existing wooden windows with aluminum storm windows. They will just be repairing the wooden windows and painting them.
 4. Mr. Serrao asks for public comment.
 5. Mr. Kyriazi steps to the podium. He introduces a letter of support from his organization for the project. He also says that he thinks the better option would be to paint the storm windows the same color as the trim so they blend in.
 6. The Commission discusses the paint options. They feel that the two-color system is appropriate, but they will leave the final decision up to the applicants.
-
-

Motion:

7. Mr. McClellan motions to approve as submitted.
 8. Mr. Serrao adds that paint color is to be determined by the applicant.
 9. Ms. Kennedy seconds.
 10. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

1500 Bingham Street **East Carson Street Historic District**

Owner:

Ravi Kondaveeti
222 5th Avenue, Apt. 320
Pittsburgh, Pa 15222

Ward: 17th

Lot and Block: 3-H-99

Inspector: Brian Ralston

Applicant:

JMAC Architects
1273 Washington Pike
Bridgeville, Pa 15017

Council District: 3rd

Application Received: 4/17/14

National Register Status: **Listed:** **Eligible:**

Proposed Changes: Demolition and new construction.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Jim McMullen steps to the podium; he is the architect for the project. He states that this is the second time the project has come before the Commission, as last time they had some concerns about the massing and wanted them to meet with the LRC. He states that they did meet with the LRC and did incorporate some of their suggestions, particularly about massing—they were concerned that it didn't follow the rhythm that the existing street wall configuration has. They decided that instead of making a complex shape out of a simple form, they would create a series of simple forms, while keeping the materials consistent.
 2. Mr. Serrao notes that the materials include brick veneer, and asks what the other materials will be.
 3. Mr. McMullen says the colors will be mostly neutral beiges like the existing building. He says that in addition to the brick they will use a Hardie panel for the cornice. They will no longer be using any EIFS material.
 4. Mr. Serrao asks for public comment.
 5. Ms. Quinn presents a letter from the LRC.
 6. Mr. McMullen says the LRC was concerned about final sign-off on materials, which they are happy to accept as a condition of approval.
 7. Mr. Serrao agrees with the LRC that they will have to get encroachment permits for the cornices and overhangs, but he doesn't believe it a big enough issue to delay approval.
-
-

Motion:

8. Mr. Serrao motions to approve the application as submitted in the final drawings, with final materials to be submitted to staff for approval.
 9. Ms. Kennedy seconds.
 10. Mr. Serrao asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

1514 E. Carson Street

East Carson Street Historic District

Owner:

Ian Primosch
1514 E. Carson Street
Pittsburgh, Pa 15203

Ward: 17th

Lot and Block: 3-H-76

Inspector: Brian Ralston

Applicant:

Americo Construction
225 Butler Street
Pittsburgh, Pa 15223

Council District: 3rd

Application Received: 5/14/14

National Register Status: Listed: X Eligible:

Proposed Changes: Replacement of windows with operable system.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Rick Criscella steps to the podium. He explains the project, stating that they are looking to replace 3 out of four storefront windows with operable accordion-style windows. The windows will fold in one direction, and the mullions will complement the style of the rest of the building. They tried to make the mullions as narrow as possible to fit with the building.
 2. Mr. Serrao says that he is concerned about the mullions.
 3. Mr. Gastil asks if the windows will project into the street when open.
 4. Mr. Criscella says no, they will open into the interior.
 5. Mr. Gastil asks for more clarification on the mullions.
 6. Mr. Criscella says that when the windows are closed they will give the appearance of mullions. When they are open it will just be one large opening, with no mullions. He says that the sash will be an inch and three quarters.
 7. Mr. Serrao asks if they will be painting to match what is existing.
 8. Mr. Criscella says yes.
 9. Mr. Serrao asks for public comment; there is none.
 10. Mr. Gastil asks about the neighboring properties and comments that this may be a precedence issue.
 11. Mr. Criscella says there is a restaurant across the street that has a similar window system.
 12. Mr. Serrao says the issue he has is with the Mario's façade, rather than the Blue Lou's façade. He says it has a very symmetrical façade with two large windows that are almost equal, and they will be introducing a new element that cuts the one window in half.
 13. Mr. Criscella says they could place a mullion in the other window to keep the
-
-

symmetry intact. He says they can't use an operable window in the other window because there are steps going up to the second floor there.

14. Mr. Serrao would like to see more context for the window replacement. He is not concerned with fact that it will be an operable system, but when it is closed it has to work with the rest of the building.
15. Mr. Gastil asks if there is any documentation of what the storefront looked like historically.
16. Mr. Criscella says no, but he says that it probably would have been similar to other storefronts on the street, with the large glass windows and recessed door.
17. Mr. Serrao says he would like to see them come back next month with a rendering of the mullion pattern they intend to do, as well photos of other similar buildings in the neighborhood for context.

Motion:

18. Mr. Serrao motions to table the application until next month.
 19. Ms. McClellan seconds.
 20. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

2000 E. Carson Street *East Carson Street Historic District*

Owner:

5 Oaks Development
1817 E. Carson Street
Pittsburgh, Pa 15203

Ward: 17th

Lot and Block: 12-K-14

Inspector: Brian Ralston

Applicant:

Classic Deck Impressions
2953 Brevard Avenue
Pittsburgh, Pa 15227

Council District: 3rd

Application Received: 4/17/14

National Register Status: **Listed:** **X** **Eligible:**

Proposed Changes: Construction of a rooftop deck.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Paul Schmitt steps to the podium. He states that they presented the project last month, and the Commission was concerned about the size of the deck and the visibility of the deck railings from ground level. He says they have taken the Commission's recommendations and exceeded them. The Commission recommended that they go to a 14 foot deck, and they went to a 12 foot deck in order to keep some space between the railings and the edge of the building. They are going to add an additional door for access to the deck. They will be leaving the existing door in place just for access to the third floor roof. They will be relocating the HVAC units that were in the area where the deck will be; they will be placed away from the edge of the roof and will not be visible. They have provided more documentation and accurate measurements to ensure that the deck will not be visible. He presents the materials and color selections, including the black metal railings.
 2. Mr. Serrao asks for public comment; there is none. He enters the acting chairman Ernie Hogan's email comments into the record, concurring with the changes that were made. He congratulates the applicant on doing a great job on the revisions and setting the standard for the South Side.
-
-

Motion:

3. Mr. Harless motions to approve the application as submitted.
 4. Mr. Serrao seconds.
 5. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

25 Market Square

Market Square Historic District

Owner:

Nick Nicholas
25 Market Square
Pittsburgh, Pa 15222

Ward: 1st

Lot and Block: 1-D-130

Inspector: Bob Molyneaux

Applicant:

Sipp + Tepe Architects LLC
PO Box 332
N. Lima, Oh 44452

Council District: 6th

Application Received: 4/17/14

National Register Status: Listed: X Eligible:

Proposed Changes: Construction of rooftop deck and railing.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Doug Sipp steps to the podium; he is the architect for the project. He introduces Jordan Nicholas who is representing the owner and Pete Landis who is representing the tenants of the building. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment; there is none. He states that the project was before the Commission last month, and they have come up with a few options based on the suggestions of the Commission. He shows a drawing that incorporates the Commission's suggestion of a glass handrail on the front of the building, rather than the metal railing they had presented before. The Commission had also stated that they didn't want to see the roof deck at all from the side of the building either, so he is proposing the existing parking be extended with a panel system in the same color to hide the additions. They have reduced the height of the stair tower and angled the front so it will be less visible. He says they have come up with other options if they would like him to go over those.
 2. Mr. Landis adds that they would be required to put some type of handrail on the side wall anyway, so the panel system will accomplish that as well.
 3. Mr. Serrao asks for public comment.
 4. Mr. Nicholas presents a letter in support of the project from Councilman Lavelle.
 5. Mr. Serrao presents a letter from Ernie Hogan requesting that the deck be pulled back eight to ten feet from the front, have no walls on the side, and use glass railings. He also reiterates the problem they have had with applicants putting roofs on previously approved roof decks.
 6. Mr. Nicholas says they would not want to add anything that would raise the deck over the existing façade. He says they have incorporated the glass railings, and the deck is pulled back from the front of the façade. He says the side walls would not look as dramatic as they do in the rendering, as they will be the same color as the existing parking.
 7. Mr. Gastil mentions that maybe they could add some detailing to the panel system
-
-

to break it up a little.

8. Mr. Serrao suggests they could break it up into different heights, and use a glass railing along part of it.
9. Mr. Gastil says they need to be consistent in the approval of roof decks.
10. Mr. Serrao agrees, and says they approved another deck in Market Square recently where they tried to set standards in the way they approached the approval. However, each case is unique. He feels that the glass railing for the front of the building will be appropriate, and they should try to break up the mass of the side wall.
11. Mr. Harless agrees that this is precedent-setting. He also thinks that they may want to pull the deck back a little bit more from the side to prevent visibility.
12. Mr. Serrao agrees that the deck should be pushed back on both facades. He states that it should be pushed back half a "panel", or approximately five feet, on each side. The glass railing could run the length of the deck and across the front, and they could start the panel wall back further to hide the bar, storage area, restrooms, and mechanicals. The proposed trellis roof should be behind the wall and not visible. He proposes to table the application so they can make the changes.

Motion:

13. Mr. Serrao motions to table the application until July.
 14. Mr. Harless seconds.
 15. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

1215-1221 W. North Avenue

Manchester Historic District

Owner:
Various

Ward: 21st

Lot and Block: 7-C-19, 19-A, 18, 18-A

Inspector: Pat Brown

Applicant:
Bureau of Building Inspection
200 Ross Street
Pittsburgh, Pa 15219

Council District: 6th

Application Received: 4/30/14

National Register Status: Listed: X Eligible:

Proposed Changes: Demolition to grade.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Russell Blaich explains that these are four attached houses and they are all condemned. The Commission views photos of the houses. He says the fronts of the houses are in good shape and most of the problems are in the back. 1219 and 1221 have collapsing roofs, and the back wall of 1217 is falling down.
 2. Ms. Quinn says these buildings are historic infill in the district.
 3. Mr. Serrao comments that the rest of the block has nice houses.
 4. Mr. Serrao asks for public comment.
 5. Ms. Natalia Kujdych steps to the podium; she is the owner of 1219 and 1221. She states that she spoke with BBI and has obtained building permits.
 6. Mr. Serrao asks if the permits are to demolish or restore.
 7. Ms. Kujdych says she is looking for guidance on that from the Commission.
 8. Mr. Blaich asks if she hired a contractor.
 9. Ms. Kujdych says she did. She thinks 1221 may have to be demolished at this point.
 10. Mr. Serrao says that they read as one unit, and he doesn't know if tearing down three units and leaving one is even structurally possible. He asks for any additional public comment.
 11. Mr. Ronald Zarotny steps to the podium. He says he owns the property next door, which is 1213 W. North Avenue. He says he maintains his property well, and the properties next door cause a lot of problems, such as overgrowth and people breaking in. He is in favor of demolishing all four of them.
 12. Ms. Evelyn Jones steps to the podium. She says that she understands the houses are in bad shape, but feels that it shouldn't come to this point that the houses have to come down, as there have already been too many demolitions in Manchester.
 13. Mr. Harless says the City will withdraw the applications for 1219 and 1221 since
-
-

permits have been pulled.

14. Mr. Blaich says 1215 and 1217 are both open and vandalized, and the back walls are starting to come down.
15. Mr. Serrao says the buildings can be saved, but it will take money. Demolitions have been a constant struggle for the HRC. He says that the owner of 1219 and 1221 should hire an architect, and can try and contact the other owners as well. The Commission can provide the contact information that they have.

Motion:

16. Mr. Serrao motions to table the applications for 1215 and 1217 for three months.
 17. Mr. Harless withdraws the applications for 1219 and 1221.
 18. Mr. Serrao amends the motion and Mr. Harless seconds.
 19. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

Certificates of Appropriateness Report – June 2014

Staff Approval	C of A Number	Date Issued	Application Address	Historic District	Work Approved
Y	14-062	12-Jun-14	4041 Fifth Avenue	Oakland Civic Center	Signage
Y	14-067	5-Jun-14	1514 E Carson Street	East Carson Street	Signage
N	14-068	9-Jun-14	408 Cedar Avenue	Deushtown	Façade renovations and construction of ADA ramp
N	14-069	9-Jun-14	2000 E Carson Street	East Carson Street	Construction of roof deck
Y	14-070	10-Jun-14	1111 Liverpool Street	Manchester	In-kind door replacement
N	14-071	25-Jun-14	1500 Bingham Street	East Carson Street	Demolition and new construction
Y	14-071	13-Jun-14	500 Liberty Avenue	Market Square	Signage