

CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

Minutes of the Meeting of December 2, 2014
Beginning at 2:06 p.m.

PRESENT OF THE COMMISSION: Chairwoman Christine Mondor, Valaw,
Gitnik, Askey, Burton-Faulk,

PRESENT OF THE STAFF: Gastil, Layman, Hanna, Rakus, O'Neill, Ray

AGENDA ITEMS COVERED IN THESE MINUTES

Item	Page No.
1. PG Publishing Company Subdivision Plan (Preble Avenue and Island Avenue), 27th Ward	4
2 Ascension Roman Catholic Church-Pine Grove Village Plan of Lots (Wingap and Berry), 28th Ward	4
3. Consolidated Gateway View Plaza Plan (West Carson Street), 19th Ward	5
4. Consolidation Plan of Central Catholic High School (South Neville Street and Fifth Avenue), 14th Ward	5
5. Northside Real Estate LP Consolidation Plan (Brighton Road and Jacksonia Street), 25th Ward	6
6. Rahal Subdivision Plan No. 1 (Baum Blvd. and Enfield Street), 8th Ward	7
7. Go Realty Consolidation Plan (Carrington St. and Pryor Way), 25 th Ward	8
8. 38th Street Consolidation Plan (38th Street), 6th Ward	8
9. Klobuchar Subdivision Plan of Lots (Grace Street), 19th Ward	9
10. MWK Forbes Subdivision and Consolidation Plan (Forbes Avenue and Euler Way), 4th Ward	9
11. Revision 3 of Fredland Plan of Lots (Carnahan Road), 20th Ward	10
12. Square View Apartments Consolidation Plan (Butler Street between 34 th and 35 th Streets), 6 th Ward	10
13. Project Development Plan #14-91, Penn Avenue and Highland Avenue, demolition and new construction,	11
14. Project Development Plan #14-109, 424 Third Avenue, District Hotel, GT-C	13
15. Lower Hill District Specially Planned District #11, Zone Change, Text Amendment, Preliminary Land Development Plan and Land Development Plan	14

Ms. Mondor chaired today's meeting and called the meeting to order.

A. ACTION ON THE MINUTES

On a motion duly moved by Ms. Valaw and seconded by Ms. Askey the minutes from the November 18, 2014 meeting were approved.

B. CORRESPONDENCE (See **Attachment A for staff reports.)**

Ms. Mondor stated that the Commission was in receipt of the attached list of correspondence.

Copy of Public Notice distributed on November 25, 2014 concerning Council Bill 0708 of 2014.

Letter from Marimba Miliones and others concerning the Hill District Development Project.

Letter from William J. Recker, Energy Innovation concerning the Hill District Project.

Letter from Senator Jay Costa concerning the Hill District Development Plan.
Letter from Marcela Gonzalez Rivas concerning the Hill District Development Project.

Letter and petition from Edna Council concerning the Hill District Development Project.

Letter from Phyllis Ghafoor concerning the Hill District Development Project.

Email from Mike Staresinic concerning the Penn-Highland Project.

Email from Gabe DeFelippis concerning the Penn-Highland Project.

Email from Melissa McSwigan with printed Power point concerning the Penn-Highland Project.

Email from Ellen Kitzerow and pictures concerning the Penn-Highland Project.

Email from Melody Farrin concerning the Penn-Highland Project.

Email from Chris Zurawsky concerning the Penn-Highland Project.

Email from Sarah Sims Erwin concerning the Penn-Highland Project.

Email from Robert Raczka concerning the Penn-Highland Project.

Email from Matthew W.C. Falcone concerning the Penn-Highland Project.

Email from Al Mann concerning the Penn-Highland Project.

Letter to Mr. Layman from CDAP District Hotel Project.

Email from Commissioner Blackwell stating that she is unable to attend today's meeting but would be available by phone if necessary.

Letter from Mayor William Peduto in support of the Penn-Highland Project.

5. Northside Real Estate LP Consolidation Plan (Brighton Road and Jacksonia Street), 25th Ward

Ms. O'Neill made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Director Gastil stated that the subdivision committee had met and recommends approval of the plan. The Chairwoman called for a motion.

MOTION: That the Northside Real Estate, LP Consolidation Plan, 25th Ward, City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, prepared for Northside Real Estate, LP by Pringle-Nero Land Surveying, Inc. dated November 10, 2014 and received by the Planning Commission December 2, 2014 be approved and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto. (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY Ms. Valaw; SECONDED BY Ms. Burton-Faulk.

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Valaw, Gitnik, Askey, Burton-Faulk

OPPOSED: None

CARRIED

6. Rahal Subdivision Plan No. 1 (Baum Blvd. and Enfield Street), 8th Ward

Ms. O'Neill made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Director Gastil stated that the subdivision committee had met and recommends approval of the plan. The Chairwoman called for a motion.

MOTION: That the Rahal Subdivision Plan No. 1, 8th Ward, City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, prepared for Team Rahal of Steel City, Inc., by PVE Sheffler dated November 13, 2014 and received by the Planning Commission on December 2, 2014 be scheduled for final review on Tuesday, December 16, 2014.

MOVED BY Ms. Valaw; SECONDED BY Ms. Burton-Faulk.

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Valaw, Gitnik, Brown, Askey, Burton-Faulk

OPPOSED: None **CARRIED**

7. Go Realty Consolidation Plan (Carrington St. and Pryor Way), 25th Ward

Ms. O'Neill made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Director Gastil stated that the subdivision committee had met and recommends approval of the plan. The Chairwoman called for a motion.

MOTION: That the GO Realty Plan of Lots, 25th Ward, City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, prepared for GO Realty, LLC by Allstate Mapping, Inc., dated April 25, 2014 and revised November 19, 2014 and received by the Planning Commission December 2, 2014 be approved and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto. (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY Ms. Valaw; SECONDED BY Ms. Askey

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Valaw, Gitnik, Askey, Burton-Faulk

OPPOSED: None

CARRIED

8. 38th Street Consolidation Plan (38th Street), 6th Ward

Ms. O'Neill made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Director Gastil stated that the subdivision committee had met and recommends approval of the plan. The Chairwoman called for a motion.

MOTION: That the 38th Street Project Consolidation Plan, 6th Ward, City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, prepared for E Properties LLC by Allegheny Land Surveying dated April 7, 2014 and received by the Planning Commission December 2, 2014 be approved and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto. (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY Ms. Askey; SECONDED BY Ms. Valaw.

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Valaw, Gitnik, Askey, Burton-Faulk

OPPOSED: None

CARRIED

9. Klobuchar Subdivision Plan of Lots (Grace Street), 19th Ward

Ms. O'Neill made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Director Gastil stated that the subdivision committee had met and recommends approval of the plan. The Chairwoman called for a motion.

MOTION: That Klobuchar Plan of Lots, 19th Ward, City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, prepared for Michael Klobuchar by Converse Surveying, dated October 24, 2014 and received by the Planning Commission December 2, 2014 be approved and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto. (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY Ms. Burton-Faulk; SECONDED BY Ms. Valaw.

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Valaw, Gitnik, Askey, Burton-Faulk

OPPOSED: None **CARRIED**

10. MWK Forbes Subdivision and Consolidation Plan (Forbes Avenue and Euler Way), 4th Ward

Ms. O'Neill made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Director Gastil stated that the subdivision committee had met and recommends approval of the plan. The Chairwoman called for a motion.

MOTION: That MWK Forbes Subdivision and Consolidation Plan of Lots, 4th Ward, City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, prepared for MWK Forbes LLC by Gateway Engineers, dated September 19, 2014 and received by the Planning Commission for review on December 2, 2014 be approved and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto. (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY Ms. Burton-Faulk; SECONDED BY Ms. Askey.

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Valaw, Gitnik, Askey, Burton-Faulk

OPPOSED: None **CARRIED**

11. Revision 3 of Fredland Plan of Lots (Carnahan Road), 20th Ward

Ms. O'Neill made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Director Gastil stated that the subdivision committee had met and recommends approval of the plan. The Chairwoman called for a motion.

MOTION: That Revision No. 3 of the Fredland Plan of Lots, 20th Ward, City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, prepared for Phyllis Fredland and Richard Moskala by Fahringer, McCarty, Grey, Inc., dated October 29, 2014 and received by the Planning Commission December 2, 2014 be approved and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto. (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY Ms. Valaw; SECONDED BY Ms. Burton-Faulk.

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Valaw, Gitnik, Askey, Burton-Faulk

OPPOSED: None **CARRIED**

12. Square View Apartments Consolidation Plan (Butler Street between 34th and 35th Streets), 6th Ward

Ms. O'Neill made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Director Gastil stated that the subdivision committee had met and recommends approval of the plan. The Chairwoman called for a motion.

MOTION: That the Square View Apartments Consolidation Plan, 6th Ward, City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, prepared for Square View Apartments, L.P. by Gateway Engineers, dated November 4, 2014 and received by the Planning Commission December 2, 2014 be approved and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto. (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY Ms. Askey; SECONDED BY Ms. Valaw.

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Valaw, Gitnik, Askey, Burton-Faulk

OPPOSED: None **CARRIED**

D. DEVELOPMENT REVIEWS (See **Attachment B** for staff reports.)

13. Hearing and Action: Project Development Plan #14-91, Penn Avenue and Highland Avenue, demolition and new construction, UNC

Ms. Rakus made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Ms. Rakus recommended approval of the proposal.

Todd Rebord Walnut Capital and Tom Price with Strauda Architecture presented information regarding this project.

Skip Swab East Liberty Development Project and Owner of the buildings gave a brief history of building and historic designation application.

The Chairwoman called for comments from the Public.

Councilman Rev. Ricky Burgess – Pastor of Nazarene Baptist Church has been in the community for a number of years and is in full support of the project.

Ellen Kitzrow, Chairperson of the Young Preservationist. They are not support in this project due to its Historic Façade. They also believe that this site can be preserved.

Justin Grennwald, E. Liberty Historical Society. They do not oppose redevelopment they do not endorse the demolition of these buildings.

Ian Lipsky – Highland Park is opposed to the plan.

Laurie Murray President of the East Liberty Chamber of Commerce is in support of the plan.

Malena Myers East Liberty Development Project and co-owner of the building is in full support of the plan.

There being no more comments from the Public, the Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the Commissioners.

Ms. Mondor and Ms. Askey had concerns about the quality of the materials used for this building.

There being no more questions or comments from the Commissioners, the Chairwoman called for the motion.

MOTION: That the Planning Commission of the City of Pittsburgh approves Project Development Plan No. 14-91 for demolition and new construction of a six-story mixed-use building based on the application and drawings filed by Strada Architecture, on behalf of Walnut Capital Partners – Penn Highland LP, property owner, with the following conditions:

- 14. Hearing & Action: Project Development Plan #14-109, 424 Third Avenue, District Hotel, GT-C

Ms. Rakus made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Ms. Rakus recommended approval of the proposal.

Joe Bevins Strauda Architects made a presentation regarding this plan.

The Chairwoman called for comments from the Public.

Rob Cresawn 429 First Avenue is in support of the plan.

There being no more comments from the Public, the Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the Commission members.

There being no questions or comments from the Commission, the Chairwoman called for the motion.

MOTION: That the Planning Commission of the City of Pittsburgh approves Project Development Plan #14-109 for approval of the proposed exterior renovation and new construction at 424 Third Avenue based on the application and drawings filed by Strada Architecture on behalf of the Distrikt Hotel, property owner, with the following conditions:

1. An exterior demolition permit may be issued for work that is consistent with the proposed exterior renovation plans.
2. Final construction plans including site plans, elevations, and materials shall be reviewed and approved by the Zoning Administrator prior to an application for a building permit.
3. The amended site plan, including the final loading space size and placement, shall be reviewed and approved by the City’s traffic and transportation planners prior to application for a building permit.
4. Final landscaping plans shall be reviewed and approved by the Zoning Administrator prior to issuance of an occupancy permit.

MOVED BY Ms. Valaw SECONDED BY Ms. Burton-Faulk

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Valaw, Gitnik, Askey, Burton-Faulk

OPPOSED: None

CARRIED

E. Continued

Ms. Mondor recused herself from this hearing and action. Ms. Valaw was appointed Temporary Chairwoman. A court reporter was present for this hearing and a full transcript is available for purchase.

15. Hearing & Action: Lower Hill District Specially Planned District #11, Zone Change, Text Amendment, Preliminary Land Development Plan and Land Development Plan

Mr. Layman made a presentation in accord with the attached staff report. Mr. Layman recommended approval of the proposal.

There being no comments from the Public, the Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the Commission members.

Mr. Gitnik made corrections to the motions and they were discussed among the commissioners. Corrections are noted in motion below.

Dusty Kirk attorney for the Penguins has signed the CCIP and abide by the CCIP to ensure it is implemented. We have no problems with the changes just one concern about "pending ordinance" this ordinance has not had a hearing nor has it been to City Council. We feel very uncomfortable agreeing to something that is unseen.

There being no more questions or comments from the Commission, the Chairwoman called for the motion.

MOTION: That the Planning Commission of the City of Pittsburgh Recommends Approval to City Council of Zone Change Petition No. 770, to rezone approximately 42 acres of property bounded by Bigelow Boulevard and Bedford Avenue to the north, Crawford Street to the east, Centre Avenue and Fifth Avenue to the south, and Washington Place and Chatham Square to the west; from GT-E, Golden Triangle, Subdistrict E to SP-11, Specially Planned District No. 11; rezoning to take effect upon the recording of a Planning Commission-approved Improvement Subdivision Site Plan for the subject property in the office of the Department of Real Estate of Allegheny County.

That the Planning Commission of the City of Pittsburgh Recommends Approval to City Council of the proposed text amendments to Sections 909.01, SP, Specially Planned District, 914.04, Off-Street Parking Exemption/Reduction Areas, and 922.11.C, Final Land Development Plans of Title Nine of the Pittsburgh Code as recommended.

That the Planning Commission of the City of Pittsburgh Approves the Preliminary Land Development Plan for SP-11, Lower Hill based on the document submitted by Pittsburgh Arena Real Estate Redevelopment LP, property owner/optionee, and dated September 18, 2014; subject to the following conditions of approval:

PENDING ORDINANCE

F. **ADJOURNMENT:**

5:35 p.m.

APPROVED BY:

Paul Gitnik, Esq.
SECRETARY

Attachments

DISCLAIMER: The official records of the Planning Commission's meetings are the Minutes of the Meetings approved by the Commission's Secretary, Paul Gitnik. The Minutes are the ONLY official record.

Any other notes, recordings, etc. are not official records of the Planning Commission. The Planning Commission cannot verify the accuracy or authenticity of notes, recordings, etc., that are not part of the official minutes.