



Division of Zoning and Development Review
City of Pittsburgh, Department of City Planning
200 Ross Street, Third Floor
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania 15219

Minutes of the Meeting of April 1, 2015
Beginning at 12:30 PM
200 Ross Street
First Floor Hearing Room
Pittsburgh, PA 15219

In Attendance:

<i>Members</i>	<i>Staff</i>	<i>Others</i>	
Erik Harless	Sarah Quinn	Evelyn Jones	Michael Bazala
Joe Serrao	Sharon Spooner	Bob Oben	Ron Graziano
Ray Gastil		Jeff DeNinno	Bob Shelton
Ernie Hogan		Bob Cook	

Old Business—None.

New Business

Approval of Minutes: In regards to the February and March meeting minutes, Mr. Harless motions notes a correction to the March minutes for 406-408 Foreland Street. Mr. Harless dissented and did not vote in favor of the motion as noted. Mr. Serrao motions to approve the minutes as corrected and Mr. Harless seconds. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.

Certificates of Appropriateness: In regards to the March Certificates of Appropriateness, Mr. Serrao motions to approve and Mr. Harless seconds. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.

Other Business:

1. Ms. Quinn makes a brief staff report about recent grants received and planned grant applications and surveys.
2. Mr. Gastil talks about the development of the new guidelines.

Adjourn:

Mr. Hogan motions to adjourn the meeting.

The discussion of the agenda items follows.

1500 E. Carson Street **East Carson Street Historic District**

Owner:

Steven Takes
942 Bebout Road
Pittsburgh, Pa 15367

Ward: 17th

Lot and Block: 3-H-72

Inspector: Jack Heath

Applicant:

Marcus Trunzo
4744 Woodhill Drive
Munhall, Pa 15120

Council District: 3rd

Application Received: 3/12/15

National Register Status: **Listed:** **X** **Eligible:**

Proposed Changes: Installation of operable storefront system.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Marcus Trunzo steps to the podium; he is one of the owners of the property.
 2. Mr. Mark Seneca steps to the podium; he is also one of the owners.
 3. Mr. Jeff DeNinno steps to the podium; he is the architect for the project. He explains the project, stating that they are proposing to install operable windows on the storefront. He states that there is currently one large piece of glass, and their preferred alternative is to install three operable folding windows. They are looking at a NanaWall aluminum-clad system, to be painted the same as the building.
 4. Mr. Hogan asks if there is a reason for three windows versus two, which would match the transom.
 5. Mr. DeNinno states that the panels would be too large and would interfere with features inside the building when folded back.
 6. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment; there is none.
 7. Mr. Hogan requests that they explore using two windows instead of three.
-
-

Motion:

8. Mr. Harless motions to approve the application with three windows, with the understanding that staff can approve two windows.
 9. Mr. Serrao seconds.
 10. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; Mr. Hogan, Mr. Serrao, and Mr. Harless are in favor and Mr. Gastil abstains. Motion carries.
 11. Mr. Hogan states that final materials and colors should be submitted to staff.
-
-

2205 E. Carson Street **East Carson Street Historic District**

Owner:

Carnegie Library of Pgh
4400 Forbes Avenue
Pittsburgh, Pa 15213

Ward: 17th

Lot and Block: 12-G-220

Inspector: Jack Heath

Applicant:

CLIO Consulting
233 Amber Street
Pittsburgh, Pa 15206

Council District: 3rd

Application Received: 3/12/15

National Register Status: **Listed:** **X** **Eligible:**

Proposed Changes: Installation of cooling tower.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Ron Graziano steps to the podium; he is the Director of Facilities Development for the Carnegie Library. He explains that they were before the HRC a few years ago for a total renovation on the building which was very successful, but the mechanical systems have not performed up to par. They will need to remove the geothermal pumps and install a boiler and cooling tower. He states that they have come up with two different proposals to screen the cooling tower, one of which has a screen wall with fencing and landscaping, and the other with a fence with a corrugated material behind it. The cooling tower will be approximately four by five feet and ten feet high. He states that he would like to have the screening extend all the way around the concrete pad, and they will tuck the tower back further than is shown in the drawings to eliminate visibility from East Carson Street.
 2. Mr. Gastil asks about how the heating system failed.
 3. Mr. Graziano goes into more details about the problems they had with the wells.
 4. Mr. Hogan says he is leaning towards approval of the green screening.
 5. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment; there is none.
 6. Mr. Serrao agrees about the green screening. He asks if it will receive enough sunlight.
 7. Mr. Graziano says there are large trees, but they are thinking of using a slow-growing ivy that can withstand the conditions.
-
-

Motion:

8. Mr. Serrao motions to approve installation of a cooling tower and the green screen as submitted.
 9. Mr. Gastil seconds.
 10. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

1415 Lake Street

Manchester Historic District

Owner:

Manchester Housing Development
1319 Allegheny Avenue
Pittsburgh, Pa 15233

Ward: 21st

Lot and Block: 22-K-109

Inspector: Pat Brown

Applicant:

Manchester Housing Development
1319 Allegheny Avenue
Pittsburgh, Pa 15233

Council District: 6th

Application Received: 11/26/14

National Register Status: **Listed:** **X** **Eligible:**

Proposed Changes: Replacement of fencing.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Al DePasquale with October Development steps to the podium; he also introduces Josh Parisi, the landscaper. He explains the project, stating that they will be replacing a chain-link fence and will be using a fence they have used in other historic districts.
 2. Mr. Parisi says they will be reusing as many of the steel posts from the existing fence as they can on the interior side. Any new posts will be 4x4 posts, and there will be one entrance from the back and one from the front. The material will be cedar and the color will just be natural. The fence will be six feet high.
 3. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment; there is none.
-
-

Motion:

4. Mr. Serrao motions to approve the replacement fencing, to be a wooden dog-eared fence, as submitted.
 5. Mr. Gastil seconds.
 6. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

4306 Centre Avenue

Schenley Farms Historic District

Owner:

George Stetten
4306 Centre Avenue
Pittsburgh, Pa 15213

Ward: 4th

Lot and Block: 27-G-66

Inspector: Joe Motznik

Applicant:

Shelton Design Assoc
4805 Penn Avenue, 2nd Floor
Pittsburgh, Pa 15224

Council District: 8th

Application Received: 3/13/15

National Register Status: Listed: X Eligible:

Proposed Changes: Construction of new front wall.

Discussion:

1. Mr. Bob Shelton steps to the podium; he is the architect for the project. He explains that the house has never had a site wall like the other properties on this side of Centre do. He states that they plan to replace the sidewalk, create a green buffer in front of the new wall. The new brick wall will have the same panel proportions, caps, and steps that all the other walls do on the street. They will also be upgrading the front walk and driveway pad with brick, and there will be a man gate and sliding privacy gate of stained cedar.
 2. Mr. Hogan states that this house was a replacement house on the street. He asks if they will be matching the red brick of the other walls.
 3. Mr. Shelton says yes, with the mortar to match the tan/buff color seen on nearby walls as well.
 4. Mr. Hogan comments on the mail slot in the wall and states that none of the other walls have one.
 5. Mr. Serrao states that he is questioning the use of wood.
 6. Mr. Hogan says some of the other walls have metal gates, but he doesn't know of any others that incorporate wood.
 7. Mr. Gastil asks if they have spoken with zoning to see if there would be any issues there.
 8. Mr. Shelton says they have.
 9. The Commission discusses the application
 10. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment; there is none.
-
-

Motion:

11. Mr. Serrao motions to approve the construction of the new front wall as submitted, with the modification that the man gate and privacy gate should be made of metal, with the color to be black, and to be submitted to staff for approval. The privacy fence behind and perpendicular to the wall can still be wood.
 12. Mr. Harless seconds.
 13. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; Mr. Serrao, Mr. Harless, and Mr. Hogan are in favor and Mr. Gastil abstains. Motion carries.
 14. Mr. Hogan adds for the record that the mail slot should not be in the brick portion of the wall; they should figure out a solution on the metal portion.
-
-

4355 Schenley Farms Terrace *Schenley Farms Historic District*

Owner:

German Barrionuevo
4355 Schenley Farms Terrace
Pittsburgh, Pa 15213

Ward: 4th

Lot and Block: 27-C-198

Inspector: Joe Motznik

Applicant:

Renewal by Andersen
1640 Golden Mile Highway
Monroeville, Pa 15146

Council District: 8th

Application Received: 3/3/15

National Register Status: **Listed:** **X** **Eligible:**

Proposed Changes: Window replacement.

Discussion:

1. Ms. Jen Sickels with Andersen Windows steps to the podium. She explains the project, stating that they are proposing to replace one window on the side of the home. It will be a composite material, and will also be going from a double-hung window to a fixed picture window. They will be maintaining the existing brickmold
 2. Mr. Hogan says it looks like the window had been replaced once before. It probably originally would have been a double-hung window.
 3. The commission tries to determine how visible the window is from the street. It is determined that it is minimally visible.
 4. Mr. Hogan asks for public comment; there is none.
-
-

Motion:

5. Mr. Serrao motions to approve the window replacement with a single pane as submitted.
 6. Mr. Gastil seconds.
 7. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; all are in favor and motion carries.
-
-

**4412-4415 Plummer Street—
Walton House**

Historic Nomination

Owner:

Chan Real Estate LP
343 Coltart Avenue
Pittsburgh, Pa 15213

Ward: 9th

Lot and Block: 80-P-68

Inspector: Gabe Mastroberardino

Applicant:

Carol Peterson
172 46th Street
Pittsburgh, Pa 15201

Council District: 7th

Application Received: 2/5/15

National Register Status: Listed: Eligible:

Proposed Changes: Nomination.

Discussion:

1. Ms. Quinn states that she doesn't have any new information about the property from last time. At the last meeting she found that as far as integrity, the location and original design of the property are intact, but the materials have changed significantly. She does not believe the property meets the threshold for significance for historic designation. She states that it is of a common shape in the neighborhood and city, and it no longer maintains integrity of materials. She states there is a potential for a larger nomination including this property.
 2. Mr. Gastil asks for a recap of what the decision was last time.
 3. Ms. Quinn says they were deciding nomination viability, and they voted in the negative. She states that today they have to decide what to recommend to City Council.
 4. Mr. Hogan states that his concern is that this is an unrenovated house, so it is being nominated for its context and its age. He compares it to the Turney House, which they did recommend. He is struggling with this being a single nomination rather than a nomination of the whole row, but understands that would have created a district and would have required signatures in favor of 25% of the owners.
 5. Ms. Quinn clarifies that if multiple properties are contiguous, they need to be nominated as a district.
 6. Mr. Harless asks for clarification on the standards of a district versus an individual property.
 7. Ms. Quinn states that as far as integrity, an individual property has to have its character-defining features intact, while a district would be less strict.
 8. Mr. Serrao states that there is a higher burden of proof when nominating an
-
-

individual property.

9. Mr. Gastil asks if there is an opportunity for public testimony today.
10. Mr. Hogan says yes; there is no one present to give public testimony.
11. Mr. Gastil states that he doesn't see a reason to change the decision from last month.
12. Mr. Hogan agrees it would be better in a district.
13. The Commission discusses the features of the building. They discuss the possibility of the National Register district in Lawrenceville and the process for that.
14. Mr. Hogan expresses again his concern that the other building in Lawrenceville was accepted because it is "pretty" and this one is not. He states that both nominations were based on form alone and didn't meet any of the other categories.
15. Mr. Gastil disagrees, stating that he considered the Turney House to be unique and different from the typical houses in the neighborhood in its age, setback from the street, and other factors. He states that this nomination is a fabric argument, but the Turney House was unique and almost outside the typical neighborhood fabric.
16. Mr. Serrao agrees.
17. Ms. Quinn clarifies that the Secretary of Interior's Standards state that integrity can also be regained through restoration, so it does matter if a property is restored or not.
18. Mr. Gastil states that he does understand the concerns in the neighborhood as far as demolition and development.
19. Mr. Hogan states that the only possible criteria that could apply are 3, which since it has been altered so much doesn't really apply, and 8. The nomination called out 8 or 10 as the applicable criteria.
20. Ms. Quinn says that significance and integrity are rated the same, and you do have to have both.

Motion:

21. Mr. Serrao motions to provide a negative recommendation.
 22. Mr. Harless seconds the nomination.
 23. Mr. Hogan asks for a vote; Mr. Gastil, Mr. Serrao, and Mr. Harless are in favor and Mr. Hogan abstains. Motion carries.
-
-

Certificates of Appropriateness Report – April 2015

Staff Approval	C of A Number	Date Issued	Application Address	Historic District	Work Approved
N	15-035	2-Apr-15	2205 E Carson Street	East Carson Street	Installation of cooling tower
N	15-036	2-Apr-15	4355 Schenley Farms Terrace	Schenley Farms	Window replacement
N	15-037	2-Apr-15	1415 Lake Street	Manchester	Fencing
Y	15-038	6-Apr-15	1309 Liverpool Street	Manchester	In-kind repairs and painting
Y	15-039	8-Apr-15	1508 Chateau Street	Manchester	Parging of side wall
Y	15-040	9-Apr-15	1302 E Carson Street	East Carson Street	Signage
Y	15-041	13-Apr-15	1423 N Franklin Street	Manchester	In-kind repair and replacement of façade elements
Y	15-042	22-Apr-15	521 N Taylor Avenue	Mexican War Streets	In-kind repairs

N	15-043	27-Apr-15	4306 Centre Avenue	Schenley Farms	Construction of a brick wall
Y	15-044	27-Apr-15	1231 Monterey Street	Mexican War Streets	In-kind roof replacement