

City of Pittsburgh
Planning Commission
Meeting Minutes

September 15, 2020 2:10pm, Meeting called to order by Chairwoman Christine Mondor

In Attendance

Chairwoman Christine Mondor

Rachel O'Neill

Sabina Deitrick

Secretary, Becky Mingo

Dina (Free) Blackwell

Holly Dick

Staff Present

Corey Layman, Zoning Administrator

Anne Kramer

Andrew Dash, Director of City Planning

William Gregory

Kate Rakus, Principal Planner

Kathleen Oldrey

Svetlana Ipatova, Recording Secretary

Daniel Scheppke

Sarah Quinn

Anthony Kobak

Index

Item	Page Number
1. DCP-HN-2020-00372, Herron Hill Pumping Station, Historic Nomination	3
2. DCP-HN-2020-00370, Gallagher-Kieffer Hoiuse, Historic Nomination	3
3. DCP-HN-2020-00090, St. John Vianney Church, Historic Nomination	4
4. DCP-ZDR-2019-02015, 1501 Penn Ave, Demolition and New Construction	5
5. DCP-LOT-2020-00808, Sassafrass Way, Polish Hill, Major	6
6. DCP-LOT-2020-00423, General Robinson Subdivision, North Shore, Major	7
7. DCP-LOT-2020-00845, 425 Wyola St, Duquesne Heights, minor	7
8. DCP-LOT-2020-00937, Jafarah Homes, North Oakland, minor	8
9. DCP-LOT-2020-00939, Island Ave, California- Kirkbride, minor	8
10. DCP-LOT-2020-00951, Crawford-Roberts , minor	8

A. Approval of Minutes

On motion moved by Ms. Deitrick and seconded by Ms. Dick, the minutes of the August 11, 2020 and August 25, 2020 meetings are approved.

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Mingo, Deitrick, Blackwell, Dick

RECUSED: O'Neill

OPPOSED:

B. Correspondence (See Attachment B)

The Commission is in receipt of the following correspondence:

DCP-ZDR-2020-03908 304 Jumonville Street

Neashia Johnson, Hill District Consensus Group
Justin Laing, Hillombo, LLC
Arbie Bamkston, Hill District Consensus Group
Marimba Milliones, President and CEO, Hill Community Development Corporation

DCP-HN-2020-00372, Herron Hill Pumping Station

Mary Fletcher, Bellefield Area Citizens Association President

DCP-HN-2020-00370, Gallagher-Kieffer House

From Matthew Falcone, Preservation Pittsburgh:
Paul Supowitz, University of Pittsburgh, Vice Chancellor, Community &
Governmental Relations
Mary Fletcher, Bellefield Area Citizens Association President

DCP-ZDR-2019-02015, 1501 Penn Ave

Matthew Falcone, Preservation Pittsburgh

DCP-HN-2020-00090, St. John Vianney Church, Historic Nomination

Anne Toland
Aaron Sukenik, Executive Director, Hilltop Alliance
Francis (Jack) Schmitt
James Homer, Pittsburgh Historic and Landmark member
Ron Trageser
Bob Kress, President St. George Church Preservation Society
Melissa McSwigan, Preservation Pittsburgh
Councilmember Bruce Kraus

DCP-HN-2020-00240 Spring Hill Elementary School, Historic Nomination

From Matthew Falcone, Preservation Pittsburgh:
Letter from Spring Hill Civic League

DCP-HN-2020-00373 Hanauer-Rosenberg House, Historic Nomination

From Matthew Falcone, Preservation Pittsburgh:
Letter from Dr. Barbara Burstin
Letter from East Allegheny Community Council
Petition from National Council of Jewish Women's Greater Philadelphia Section
Letter from National Council of Jewish Women
Letter from National Council of Jewish Women Pittsburgh Section

National Museum of American Jewish History
Rodef Shalom

Notice of Appeal from Troiani Group regarding Market Street properties

Notice of Appeal from Lumania Properties regarding DCP-LOT-2020-78

C. Development Reviews (See Attachment C for staff reports)

Hearing and Action:

1. DCP-HN-2020-00372, Herron Hill Pumping Station, Historic Nomination.

Ms. Quinn made presentation in accordance with the attached staff report. She informed history of building construction and use, criteria for nomination and planning staff recommendation.

Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the public.

Mr. Matthew Falcone from Preservation Pittsburgh thanked City planning staff for this nomination. He underlined that the subject structure is very significant as the oldest piece of water infrastructure and has a nice green space around. Mr. Falcone supported proposed nomination.

Ms. Kathy Gallagher, resident, supported the nomination.

There being no comments from the Commissioners, the Chairwoman called for the motion.

MOTION:

That the Planning Commission of the City of Pittsburgh provides a positive recommendation to City Council for the nomination of Herron Hill Pumping Station DCP-HN-2020-00372 for listing as a City- designated historic site.

MOVED BY: Ms. Deitrick

SECONDED BY: Ms. Dick

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Mingo, Deitrick, Blackwell, Dick, O'Neill

RECUSED:

OPPOSED:

MOTION CARRIED

2. DCP-HN-2020-00370, Gallagher-Kieffer House, Historic Nomination

Ms. Quinn made presentation in accordance with the attached staff report. Ms. Quinn explained PC members nomination information, district and zoning information, and history of construction and use. In addition, she explained criteria for nomination and planning staff recommendation.

Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the public.

Mr. Matthew Falcone from Preservation Pittsburgh informed that Gallagher-Kieffer House is an exceptional structure, special as architectural example and calls attention to everyone . Mr. Falcone asked PC members to approve the proposed nomination.

There being no comments from the Commissioners, the Chairwoman called for the motion.

MOTION:

That the Planning Commission of the City of Pittsburgh provides a positive recommendation to City Council for the nomination of Gallagher-Kieffer House, DCP-HN-2020-00370 for listing as a City- designated historic site.

MOVED BY: Ms. Dick

SECONDED BY: Ms. Deitrick

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Mingo, Deitrick, Blackwell, Dick, O'Neill

RECUSED:

OPPOSED:

MOTION CARRIED

3. DCP-HN-2020-00090, St. John Vianney Church, Historic Nomination

Ms. Quinn made presentation in accordance with the attached staff report. She provided history of building construction and use, criteria for nomination and planning staff recommendation.

Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the public.

Mr. Mark Wittman, resident and nominator for this structure stated that church is irreplaceable Building. He asked PC members to protect it from demolition because some construction work already started.

There being no comments from the Commissioners, the Chairwoman called for the motion.

MOTION:

That the Planning Commission of the City of Pittsburgh provides a positive recommendation to City Council for the nomination St. John Vianney Church, DCP-HN-2020-00090 for listing as a City-designated historic site.

MOVED BY: Ms. Mingo

SECONDED BY: Ms. Deitrick

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Mingo, Deitrick, Blackwell, Dick, O'Neill

RECUSED:

OPPOSED:

MOTION CARRIED

4.DCP-ZDR-2019-02015, 1501 Penn Ave, Demolition and New construction.

Ms. Rakus made presentation in accordance with the attached staff report.

Ms. Dusty Elias Kirk from Reed Smith LLP explained details for project background. She underlined that subject site is located in Golden Triangle zoning district that has no zoning height limitations, old structure is located in a floodplain area and has no positive reasons to be redesigned and saved.

Ms. Kirk conformed that project crew will present for PC members evidence to unique characteristics of subject site for positive motion to approve this application.

Mr. J Matthew Cassin, owner, informed history of project development. He added that not possible to use old building, just a portion of foundation. Project crew believes that proposal meets zoning open space and accessibility requirements.

Mr. Brandon Haw, architect, informed that developers added some new corrections to previous presentation. He presented site location, renderings of immediate context and future retail/office, design concepts and renderings from the different point of view. Mr. Haw clarified developers responses to CDAP meeting. He presented proposed plans and elevations, green roof design, colonnade design, landscaping and accessibility plans, storm water plan, and sustainability goals. In addition, Mr. Haw explained proposals for façade materials ,finishers and parking connectivity.

Mr. Ben Hawter, project engineer, made floodplain review presentation and proposal to raise the colonnade.

He added that Floodplain application was already approved by city planning staff. Storm water plan was also approved.

Ms. Cindy Jampole, transportation specialist, presented transportation study and analysis. Transportation report and access plans was reviewed and approved by DOMI. New bus stations will be added. Ms. Jampole explained proposed future bike lanes, access to building loading docks, and approved Transportation Demand Management Plan.

Ms. Kirk informed PC members about meetings held with community and stakeholders.

Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the public.

Mr. Andrew Miller stated that a proposed building is important because there is a need for the office space, and structure will provide office space for the City of Pittsburgh.

Mr. Jeff Turner, general constructor, informed that proposed development will provide tremendous job opportunity for hundreds of workers. He supported a proposal.

There being no more comments from the Public, the Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the Commissioners.

Ms. Deitrick supported planning staff recommendation to deny without prejudice proposed application. Ms. Deitrick stated that proposed building is massive and not with a context with a neighborhood area.

Ms. Mingo has concerns about building design, not creates adequate open space, proposed colonnade and outdoor area do not work as welcome public space, and block river view.

Ms. Mondor stated that public areas are not welcome to pedestrians, and she has concerns

about big and small dimensions of development.

Ms. Blackwell suggested that the applicant could make changes to the proposal and come back in two weeks to present them.

Mr. Layman made some clarification on planning staff recommendation. This recommendation allows the applicant to make corrections on the project, work with specific issues and come back to PC hearing.

There being no more comments from the Commissioners, the Chairwomen called for the motion.

MOTION:

That the Planning Commission of the City of Pittsburgh DENIES without prejudice Project Development Plan DCP-ZDR-2019-02015, for demolition and new construction at 1501 Penn Avenue, filed by R3A Architects, on behalf of the owner, 1501 Penn Owner LLC. The applicant is encouraged to continue to work on the building and site design and return to the Commission.

MOVED BY: Ms. Mingo SECONDED BY: Ms. Deitrick

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Mingo, Deitrick, Dick
RECUSED: O'Neill
OPPOSED:
ABSTAINED: Blackwell

D. Plan of Lots

5.DCP-LOT-2020-00808, Sassafrass Way, Polish Hill, Major (2nd),

Mr. Schepcke made presentation in accordance with the attached staff report. There being no comments from the Public, the Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the Commissioners.

There being no comments from the Commissioners, the Chairwoman called for the Motion.

MOTION:

Sassafrass Way Consolidation, 6th Ward, City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, received by the Planning Commission on August 25, 2020, **BE APPROVED and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto.** (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY: Ms. Dick SECONDED BY: Ms. Blackwell

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Mingo, Dick, Deitrick, O'Neill, Blackwell
RECUSED:
OPPOSED:

6. DCP-LOT-2020-00423, General Robinson Subdivision, North Shore, Major (2nd)

Mr. Scheppke made presentation in accordance with the attached staff report. There being no comments from the Public, the Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the Commissioners.

There being no comments from the Commissioners, the Chairwoman called for the Motion.

MOTION:

General Robinson Subdivision, 22nd Ward, City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, received by the Planning Commission on August 25, 2020, **BE APPROVED and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto.** (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY: Ms. Dick SECONDED BY: Ms. Blackwell

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Mingo, Dick, Deitrick, O'Neill, Blackwell
RECUSED:
OPPOSED:

7. DCP-LOT-2020-00845, 425 Wyola St, Duquesne Heights, minor

Mr. Scheppke made presentation in accordance with the attached staff report. There being no comments from the Public, the Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the Commissioners.

There being no comments from the Commissioners, the Chairwoman called for the Motion.

MOTION:

425 Wyola Lot Line Revision, 19th Ward, City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, received by the Planning Commission on September 15, 2020, **BE APPROVED and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto.** (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY: Ms. Dick SECONDED BY: Ms. Blackwell

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Mingo, Dick, Deitrick, O'Neill, Blackwell
RECUSED:
OPPOSED:

8. DCP-LOT-2020-00937, Jafarah Homes, North Oakland, minor

Mr. Scheppke made presentation in accordance with the attached staff report. There being no comments from the Public, the Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the Commissioners.

There being no comments from the Commissioners, the Chairwoman called for the Motion.

MOTION:

Jafarah Homes Consolidation, 5th Ward, City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, received by the Planning Commission on September 15, 2020, **BE APPROVED and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto.** (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY: Ms. Dick SECONDED BY: Ms. Blackwell

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Mingo, Dick, Deitrick, O'Neill, Blackwell
RECUSED:
OPPOSED:

9. DCP-LOT-2020-00939, Island Avenue, California-Kirkbride. minor

Mr. Scheppke made presentation in accordance with the attached staff report. There being no comments from the Public, the Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the Commissioners.

There being no comments from the Commissioners, the Chairwoman called for the Motion.

MOTION:

Island Avenue Consolidation, 19th Ward, City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, received by the Planning Commission on September 15, 2020, **BE APPROVED and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto.** (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY: Ms. Dick SECONDED BY: Ms. Blackwell

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Mingo, Dick, Deitrick, O'Neill, Blackwell
RECUSED:
OPPOSED:

10.DCP-LOT-2020-00951, Cliff Street, Crawford-Roberts, minor

Mr. Scheppke made presentation in accordance with the attached staff report. There being no comments from the Public, the Chairwoman called for questions and comments from the Commissioners.

There being no comments from the Commissioners, the Chairwoman called for the Motion.

MOTION:

Cliff Street Consolidation, 3rd Ward, City of Pittsburgh, County of Allegheny, received by the Planning Commission on September 15, 2020, **BE APPROVED and the signatures of the proper officers of the Planning Commission be affixed thereto.** (No improvements or monuments needed.)

MOVED BY: Ms. Dick SECONDED BY: Ms. Blackwell

IN FAVOR: Mondor, Mingo, Dick, Deitrick, O'Neill, Blackwell

RECUSED:

OPPOSED:

E. Director's Report

Director Dash presented PC members new FORGING PGH building our comprehensive plan. This is City wide use plan that is over-arching policy document, very important for future development of City of Pittsburgh.

F. Adjournment

Motion to adjourn made by Ms. Dick and seconded by Ms. Blackwell. The meeting adjourned at 5:45pm.

Approved by: Becky Mingo, Secretary

Disclaimer

The official records of the Planning Commission's meetings are the Minutes of the Meetings approved by the Commission's Secretary, Becky Mingo. The Minutes are the ONLY official record. Any other notes, recordings, etc. are not official records of the Planning Commission. The Planning Commission cannot verify the accuracy or authenticity of notes, recordings, etc. that are not part of the official minutes.