

Development Activities Meeting Report (Version: 06/24/2020)

This report created by the Neighborhood Planner and included with staff reports to City Boards and/or Commissions.

Logistics	Stakeholders
Project Name/Address: 1931 E Carson Street (Roofing)	Groups Represented (e.g., specific organizations, residents, employees, etc. where this is evident): South Side Community Council (SSCC) Local Review Committee (LRC) Residents Property owner/applicant team City Planning
Parcel Number(s): 12-F-00132	
ZDR Application Number: DCP-ZDR-2021-06333	
Meeting Location: Zoom	
Date: January 20 th , 2022	
Meeting Start Time: 6:00pm (this presentation started close to 7pm following other presentations)	
Applicant: John Despines (property owner) and Lou Holzer	
Boards and/or Commissions Request(s): Historic Review Commission due to proposed work on the front mansard portion of the roof including changing from siding to shingles	

How did the meeting inform the community about the development project?

Ex: Community engagement to-date, location and history of the site, demolition needs, building footprint and overall square footage, uses and activities (particularly on the ground floor), transportation needs and parking proposed, building materials, design, and other aesthetic elements of the project, community uses, amenities and programs.

John introduced himself as the property owner at 1931 E Carson St. He met Lou a year ago to re-shingle dormers, since shingles were in very bad shape, and they soon realized that the whole upper façade needs to be replaced. They would like to replace everything, change nothing, and bring it back all new so that there are no leaks and no wood falling down on people.

Lou shared that all the work is from the brick up, rebuilding the overhang, relining the gutter with copper, taking the vinyl siding off the mansard, installing a slate-like asphalt shingle. The mansard with the siding from the box gutter up is the work area. Lou has a sample with a shingle that will be installing.

The four pages of the scanned PDF of the applicant's Historic Review Commission Application for Certificate of Appropriateness were shown on the screen.

Input and Responses

Questions and Comments from Attendees	Responses from Applicants
You are proposing from the box gutter up to the peak of the roof on the front, you are replacing and renewing, correct?	That is correct.

Questions and Comments from Attendees	Responses from Applicants
<p>Could you go to another slide/page – a better diagram of what you’re doing?</p>	<p>[tried to search]</p>
<p>In my experience of doing this exact work on my own properties, there are some ways of doing it up there, and some ways turn out really beautifully and some really poorly, such as the case we’re looking at like the horizontal vinyl siding. I’m curious to know what level of work you plan on windows up there, the dormers, the woodwork that’s up there, the box gutter, are you putting downspouts coming down the front, how is the cornice going to be?</p>	<p>The downspout goes down the left side of the building.</p>
<p>The downspout doesn’t seem to be shown in the photo though.</p>	<p>The box gutter wraps around the left side just a touch, and out of that little bit of a box gutter is a vertical aluminum down spout that goes onto neighbor’s roof. Box gutter is getting totally taken down and rebuilt and relined with beautiful copper liner. All the trim around the dormers will be replaced as needed and will be painted. [Lou showed on video the shingle that will be installed on the mansard.]</p>
<p>Yeah it’s a like slate looking asphalt single.</p>	<p>Correct.</p>
<p>Yeah, I’m actually less worried about the shingle type, that looks good and I’m glad you’re going with something like that. I’m more concerned with how it will be trimmed out and brought back into a better shape than it is now and more in line.</p> <p>[Question to other community member]: Is there another precedent of what they should be aiming for or how do we direct them in this instance?</p>	
<p>For the woodwork, [others] may comment, you can replace what seems to be original wood work in kind, so that’s not controversial and can be approved over the counter sometimes. But glad to hear he’s taking the mansard siding off and replacing with something. If we had a historic photo...but I think it’s safe to say that was never siding, it was probably a slate shingle or similar back when the building was built.</p>	<p>Yes.</p>
<p>To emulate that with an asphalt shingle with the type you’re saying is probably ok there, no guideline to say you’d have to replace with slate that I’m aware of. This is a good direction. For HRC’s comfort, if there were some diagrams or details of the wood profiles and/or better pictures of the dormers and box gutter so we could see</p>	<p>We could put up a photo of the shingle.</p>

Questions and Comments from Attendees	Responses from Applicants
<p>what the profiles were and the character of all that, so that when you do change it out, you are matching and not taking out original historic fabric...though HRC may take a position of more preservation/restoration approach where say that if it's not too bad you keep the original and replace only that which is truly deteriorated, because guidelines try to save truly historic fabric and not necessarily replace everything, and so it's about showing them the extent of deterioration and to what point you could salvage/save parts that aren't quite gone yet, and patch in with new wood matching the exact same profiles of all those wood trims, and then they would debate the shingles with you. But then again, if they could see a sample in person or in better view...HRC would have loved to see samples live back when meeting in person, but now on Zoom they will likely require product literature to show what you're proposing when you present on Zoom.</p>	
<p>It looked ok to us.</p>	<p>We have a photo of the shingle. [showed picture of shingles on screen, with CertainTeed brand name included]</p>
<p>Well that's good because it also has the brand name, so that would be important to submit to the City.</p>	<p>The overhang is in rough shape. Matching moldings is impossible, so they would be replaced 100% with something close that matches but is new.</p>
<p>Let me tell you having just done the façade of my own house a couple years ago. When I had to replace the moldings, I had to have Allegheny Woodwork cut new moldings to match. Unfortunately, it's not an inexpensive route.</p>	<p>No, that's expensive.</p>
<p>We don't want you to replace historic pieces with something that is not matching. My other concern is what happens on the side where there is siding on the right hand side?</p>	<p>Nothing, we're not touching the sides.</p>
<p>So it will be important, what is the interface between the mansard...how do the shingle... how is that corner treated?</p>	<p>I was going to use a piece of trim going down the siding and extend the shingles out past that. So it would be a wood trim coming down on the siding. Currently there are two vertical pieces of aluminum (outside corners)...one side the aluminum is coming into it, and on the front the vinyl siding is coming into it. So it's terminated with an outside corner aluminum. So Lou is proposing taking that outside corner down and replacing it with wood.</p>

Questions and Comments from Attendees	Responses from Applicants
	<p>The box gutter has a current piece of molding for about half of it, and the other half I have in my basement, it fell down, so that we can match as best we can, and then around the windows we just need some advice and some guidance and we'll put up whatever molding the historical society wants. But what we see now is it is in bad shape, and dormers will need loving attention, and then we'll trim them out, and whatever molding they want us to put up we'll put up.</p>
<p>It would be helpful when you go to HRC to have more photos and better quality photos with close-up details of box gutters, and around the dormers, and even that top part on the top of the roof, the two sides.</p>	<p>I wonder if you can see this [visual]...</p>
<p>No, that's not going to work. Tonight's not the night – if we could invite you over to the LRC on Tuesday night we could spend some time to work through what you have there and try to finesse those details. I've had custom woodwork done in my house, and Allegheny Millwork is expensive. There is a place in Spring Garden Ave called Artcraft Wood Products. They're pretty competitive.</p>	<p>Yeah I'm familiar with them.</p> <p>Are you saying we need to match the molding exactly or try our best to find that cut?</p>
<p>I think the HRC would be against you taking all the original moldings off the building and putting in stock items out of the catalog, e.g. from Home Depot. Some of that stock can be very close and some of those profiles persist, so if it is stock and it matches very closely, I think that would be fine, but we don't know, because we don't have photographic evidence tonight to know how far off you are from what is off the shelf. I think they would want you to match, but we'll see. We'll try to fashion this for you so you can be approvable. Guidelines will want you to preserve fabric that is intact – that is stated emphatically -- and they say to replace anything that is deteriorated, so they will not want a wholesale removal unless totally falling off building and rotting out and you'd have to make that case with some evidence.</p>	
<p>[Displayed photo in chat and on screen showing the commenter's work done to house roofing etc.] I brought up this visual...I can tell you it was painstaking and lots of nuance, but as I was asking, how are you going to terminate on the right side when the shingles come to the edge on the cornice, it was a six-piece trim on the top but it was all re-made to match the original...it was</p>	<p>Yeah, the current box gutter is in really bad shape. The underneath actually had big holes in it.</p>

Questions and Comments from Attendees	Responses from Applicants
<p>painstaking...stainless steel box cutters, and it has the exact same shingle as what you showed here in your presentation. I couldn't afford the slate I wanted, but shingles will be fine and will last 60 years, being on an 18/12 pitch roof. That's what I was looking for, if you could come with some more details to talk with Bob and the group and if you could show if it's falling in the nature of original building or of that architectural period that would be best.</p>	
<p>Yeah this one had to be sistered up, brought out, reformed, all new framing behind all of this.</p>	<p>Yeah I'm just talking about our box gutter. With better photos you'll be able to see that it's not salvageable. We'll take your advice and get a lot better photos. Does the HRC approve Boral trim? It is not wood but looks like wood and is not PVC.</p>
<p>This is all Boral, are you familiar with this product?</p>	<p>Yes, that's the question to you.</p>
<p>Yeah, there's a difference though. There's vinyl and then there's Boral which is I think more a woodworker's material. It's like wood you can form and shape to match existing profiles, that's the difference. And it will last a very long time. But do we want to see it? I think we're happy with just a drawing of it, but I'll leave that up to Bob and LRC.</p>	<p>Well, the Boral would be used in place of 1x dimensional lumber.</p>
<p>I don't have a quick answer about Boral, maybe someone else remembers, we would have to look at it.</p>	
<p>[Question to other community member] Is there an expectation that when you go to HRC that you'll be sharing specifics about what you'll be using when you're going to replace something, and providing a lot of detail about what it is you're changing, why you're changing it, and what you're changing it to etc.?</p>	
<p>Yeah, they'll like some type of diagram, either photographs marked up, or the best case scenario, drawings. So if you have to replace the box gutter, go up and measure it and draw the profiles and give them a drawing with the dimensions and shape at a fairly larger scale so they can understand the parts of it.</p> <p>For example, you need to show with visuals and notes, something like the following: this entire box gutter we're going to replace in kind. Here is what it looks like now, and these parts and pieces we'll replace exactly. We're going</p>	<p>Ok.</p>

Questions and Comments from Attendees	Responses from Applicants
<p>to use this shingle on this area and this one around the dormer, and here's a picture of the dormer in its current condition, and here is where you will do work restoring it...as much detail as possible with drawings or photos...what they will approve is the material you present, not necessarily your words, and in discussion you need some evidence of what you intend to do and that is what people will keep an eye on to ensure that it's fabricated in the field and executed.</p>	
<p>Sorry to jump in, unrelated question, is Zed still in this building?</p>	<p>Yes, Zed is my tenant, and he is still tenant of the first floor and he rents the second floor. And my nephew is renting the third floor and that's the work that is in question, where my nephew is living.</p>
<p>The only thing I'd say is the Zed sign is a temporary sign and you get about 9 months for a temporary sign. Zed may consider for his storefront looking at historic district guidelines for signage, because eventually you'll end up with a 3-1-1 for a temporary sign in a permanent setting.</p> <p>Okay, sounds good. Thank you.</p>	<p>Yeah, it was about a year ago he was looking into a sign and I think he hired somebody, but I haven't talked to him about that, so I don't know, I'll have to ask him what's going on with the sign. I don't know if I told him to wait until we finished the above or not, but I think he was going to go ahead with it, I need to ask him what's going on with that, yeah he wants to get a permanent sign there.</p> <p>You're welcome.</p>
<p>Tell him to work through the HRC and not do anything without guidance.</p>	<p>Yeah, I think he was following all the rules there.</p>
<p>[SSCC Lead shared next steps and opportunities for public comments prior to this going to Historic Review Commission.] Thank you all.</p>	<p>Thank you.</p>

Other Notes

Planner completing report: Thomas Scharff